de Calvin vis-à-vis des "hérétiques" depuis la condamnation de Michel Servet. En même temps, il se sentait de plus en plus attiré par la modération du flamand Georg Casan (Cassander), surtout après les événements d'Amboise. C'est pourquoi il devra s'éloigner de plus en plus des positions dures défendues par les Réformés lors des colloques de Poissy et de Saint-Germain-en-Laye tenues sous les auspices de Catherine de Médicis et du cardinal de Lorraine. La rentrée de Bauduin dans le giron de l'Église romaine était alors décidée.

Comme l'auteur l'a d'abord suggéré, puis plus soigneusement montré à la fin de ce riche volume, il s'agissait, dans toute la série de ses controverses, de deux conceptions opposées de la vraie Réforme de l'Église au XVI^e siècle: réformation tout court, ou transformation. Bauduin avait toujours joué la carte de la réformation, en lui donnant une tournure essentiellement juridique et historique, plutôt que théologique.

L'auteur a utilisé et analysé toutes les sources de l'époque et la plupart des livres récents. J'oserais pourtant signaler que pour une vision plus complète des controverses de Poissy et de Saint-Germain, la connaissance de l'ouvrage de Mario Scaduto sur Laînez, basé sur une riche documentation, lui aurait fourni des données pertinentes sur les circonstances et le cours des discussions.

En tout cas, il s'agit d'un ouvrage qui dépasse de beaucoup le niveau de la biographie historique pour embrasser la question globale de toute cette époque, explicite dans le titre: "Concorde ou tolérance?"

MIQUEL BATLLORI, *Institutum historicum, Societates Jesu. Rome*

Larry Silver. *The Paintings of Quinten Massys with Catalogue Raisonné*. Montclair, N.J.: Allanheld & Schram, 1984. Pp.xvii, 361. \$79.50.

There can be no doubt that Quinten Massys (1466-1530) best represents Netherlandish painting at the watershed between the 15th and the 16th century or between what is termed the Late Gothic and the Renaissance. His wide-ranging oeuvre reflects at once his deep roots in the Eyckian-Rogierian tradition, his openness for the innovations coming from Italy and for the demands of the diversified community of fast-growing Antwerp, of which he was the leading painter. In the words of Panofsky (*Early Netherlandish Painting*, p.353), "Massys carried a memory of the past into the city of the future."

Recent scholarship has produced a fair number of essays, a couple of theses and one full-scale luxurious monograph (A. de Bosque, [Brussels, 1975]) on the artist. Larry Silver's volume deviates from the traditional approach to such monographic studies by concentrating, in his main text, on the "purposes of the pictures made by Quinten Massys in the urban complex of Antwerp" and by delegating questions of style, dates, techniques and influences to the *catalogue raisonné*. As the latter comprises sections of the author's doctoral thesis (Harvard University, 1974) and as the first and largest part of the book is the result of subsequent "new interests of a more contextual sort" (p.xv), some lack of unity and a measure of repetitiveness were almost unavoidable.

The obvious merit of Silver's book is his authoritative interpretation of Massys' artistic personality and of his pictures on the basis of the highly distinctive cultural milieu of the most powerful international trade center in Europe. A lengthy introductory chapter sketches a brief biography of the artist and deals effectively with his cosmopolitan environment. The prosperous city attracted artists from all across the Netherlands, its foreign communities commissioned many works of art (Massys made three altarpieces for Portuguese merchants, one for a German) and allowed for their own national art to be experienced locally (Massys' work clearly shows the influence of Leonardo and Du''rer). A strong cultural force was the *ommegang*, an annual procession in honour of Our Lady in which all city officials, religious confraternities and professional guilds participated (Massys' *Lamentation altarpiece* for the joiners' guild, images for private devotion and some portraits were the result of their patronage). Culturally even more important were the three Antwerp *rederijkers kamers* (rhetoricians' chambers), one of which was associated with the painters' guild of St. Luke. The spirit of their poetry and regularly staged performances of either farcical or morality plays is paralleled in Massys' grotesque and satirical pictures. Contemporary Antwerp literature in its various forms from spiritual treatises to prose satires and "foolish poetry" reveals a preoccupation with moral values that is shared by the artist's imagery, in the beauty of his holy figures and in the caricatured ugliness of those who lack moral responsibility.

On this well-set stage Silver examines the pictures, sensibly but not always conveniently grouped, according to their presumed functions, into chapters with titles that demonstrate the author's liking for alliteration. *A Tale of Two Triptychs* deals with the earliest dated works, a *Holy Kinship altarpiece* for the confraternity of St. Anne at Louvain of 1507-09 and a *Lamentation triptych*, commissioned by the Antwerp shrewworkers' guild, dating to 1508-11. These works are the cornerstones of Massys' scholarship and Silver anchors them correctly in the Netherlandish tradition. His subtle differentiations between the means of representation of the two almost-contemporary creations may well overinterpret the intentions of the artist.

Of the five foreign commissions, grouped together in *Merchants and Monarchs*, only the small portable *Rem altarpiece* seems entirely autograph, and Silver offers a most informed interpretation of the unusual imagery and its personal significance for the devout Augsburg merchant. The large *Seven Sorrows polyptych* for a royally founded monastery near Lisbon served, by contrast, the worshippers of a religious community. The author discusses the now-dispersed panels in terms of Massys' personal contribution to late medieval Passion iconography and adds a valuable account on the cult of the Seven Sorrows of the Virgin.

With the *Rem triptych* Quinten ceases to paint large altarpieces, which, Silver surmises, may in part be due to a change in his religious attitudes at the time of his association with the Antwerp humanist group. Nonetheless, he produced numerous small religious paintings from the beginning to the end of his career. Inspired by Ringbom's *Icon to Narrative* (Abo, 1965), the author separates them into iconic devotional images, depicting mainly the Virgin and Child, and gospel events, primarily of Christ's Passion. The Madonna images actually constitute the core of Massys' oeuvre and Silver traces their evolution from the early, Eyck-derived, hieratic enthroned Queen of Heaven type to the humble, intimate, maternal half-figure type, represented by the 1529 *Rattier Madonna*. The "self-conscious pictorial

emulation of Netherlandish tradition" (p.76), the archaism, so noticeable in the art of the early new century, is convincingly explained by the continued need for devotional icons for the purpose of pious meditation and conferral of grace. That the later holy figures, close to the viewer by their half-figure presentation, worldly setting and humanization, are spiritually further removed from him by their beauteous perfection, is the result of a shift in Massys' attitude, "who now perceives the condition of human sinfulness to be a serious barrier to grace." Perhaps this, too, is an overinterpretation.

In his treatment of gospel events he puts much emphasis on the contrast between the beauty of the holy figures and the ugliness of the crowd as a conscious artistic device to engage the beholder in contemplation of his own sinfulness and in compassion with the suffering of Christ and his mother. The author associates these visual admonitions (not unique with Massys) specifically with those of Ludolph of Saxony and Denis van Rykel, both Carthusians. It is true, Massys died at a Carthusian monastery outside Antwerp, but that does not particularly link his works to the widely circulated devotional tracts of these writers.

The chapter *Massys and Erasmus* is central to the book, and its author suggests that "Massys' art-making and his religiosity were redirected by his contact with that Erasmian circle in Antwerp" (p.120). Actual acquaintance is of course documented through the fine 1517 portraits of Erasmus and Peter Aegidius. It is also likely that the satirical bent of the genre pictures is in part inspired by the *Praise of Folly* (and equally by the *rederijkers* plays), whereas a presumed link between Erasmus' great interest in St. Jerome and Massys' missing depiction of this saint is more tenuous. So is the suggestion that Erasmus' views of the veneration of images might have effected a change of concept in Massys' representation of saints from the traditional cult figures to exemplars of Christian conduct. Most difficult to accept is the connection that Silver establishes between Quinten's Magdalen pictures and Erasmian thought by alluding to the debate of the French humanists over the identity of Mary Magdalen, especially when Erasmus "vacillated in his letters and avoided the issue" (p.125). Silver's deliberations are based on impressive scholarship and they are elegantly handled, yet his conclusions remain speculative.

Since the publication of *The Ship of Fools* by Sebastian Brant in 1494, social satire in literature and art had become the new form of sermonizing, hence Silver's title *Lectures and Laughter* for Quinten's small but important group of secular images. Although their subject matter varies, he demonstrates that, while they are all morally instructive (a quality they share with those of Bosch), Massys elects to castigate greed, usury, luxury, pride and other weaknesses with visual ridicule by the pictorial means of ugly and monstrous features, grotesque appearances and foolish behaviour. The viewer can laugh at these caricatured types, but he is sufficiently challenged by their moral deficiencies which prevent them from leading responsible Christian lives. To show the similarity of the artist's and Erasmus' didactic intentions, Silver most appropriately quotes from a letter of the humanist to one of his critics: "In the *Praise of Folly* I did in a jesting fashion exactly what I had done in the *Enchiridion* [i.e. give a pattern for Christian life]. I wanted to admonish and not to carp" (p.149). His discussion of the puzzling *Grotesque Old Woman* in London whose formal source is once more Leonardo and whose literary inspiration is the *Praise of Folly* is a model of sound interpretation.

Without the Erasmus-Gillis friendship diptych, which is discussed elsewhere, the *Portraits and Patrons* chapter suffers and the valuation of Massys' role in the history of Netherlandish portraiture is weakened. Just as this reviewer is not persuaded by the identification of the Vaduz *Canon* with the brother of Peter Gillis, Nicolai Claesz, and the Frankfurt *Reading Man* with the humanist Cornelius Grapheus, she has doubts about Silver's interpretation of attributes and settings of some of the unknown sitters as an expression of their religiosity. Why must the marble columns framing the Schloss Au and New York couple "suggest the exalted realm that will be the reward of the devout donors" (p.165)? They are quite common at this time as ennobling or simply formal devices (cf. Holbein, *Burgomaster Meyer and wife*). Questionable, too, is the proposed meaning of cross and rosebud, held in conjunction with a quill by the Edinburgh *Notary* as a profession of piety, or the symbolism of a pink in two other portraits. Conversely, the borage sprig in the hand of the New York *Wealthy Man* may not be a sign of betrothal but may instead be a symbol of devout meditation on Christ's suffering, as the man prominently wears a crucifix on a chain. *Borago officinalis* is a healing herb for heart tremors and melancholy which Campin already uses among other Passion plants in his *Veronica with the Sudarium*.

Aware that "evaluating the accomplishment of a painter in isolation is a perilous task" (p.176), Silver concludes his monograph with a summary look at some of Quinten's contemporaries, especially his younger Antwerp colleague, Joos van Cleve. They share much of their subject matter and borrowings from Italy, also the expression of a more internalized spirituality and a certain scepticism in religious matters that characterizes the age of humanism.

The *catalogue raisonné* lists 65 paintings as originals and includes replicas (the term is loosely used; the measurements of 3.0 x 1.5 cm for one of them on p.216 is erroneous). Each work is fully documented. The portrait of a cardinal may be added to the Lost Works section. H.Schickhardt in *Wahrhaffte Beschreibung zweyer Raisen . . .* (Mümpelgart, 1602) says that at the palace in Mantua he was shown the portrait collection by the Duke and saw there "a cardinal, painted in oil that Quinten Massys, the son of a blacksmith is supposed to have made" (translation mine; thanks for this reference are offered to my colleague C.M. Brown).

The 183 black and white illustrations of all originals and much comparative material are quite adequate, although Massys' importance as a colorist makes one wish for the inclusion of a few colour plates. Silver's book displays considerable erudition but seems somewhat overfootnoted. In Chapter Seven he quotes one of his articles in two pages of text (two footnotes are missing on p.32). Moreover, the book is marred by an abundance of typographical errors and the German should have been proofread by a specialist (the Renger title on p.158 has five mistakes in fourteen words).

The lasting value of Silver's study is in no way diminished by these small criticisms and art historians will be stimulated by his most thorough integration of Massys' art-making with the cultural context that dictated its purpose and by revealing how his paintings fit within social practices and how they address their contemporary beholders.