Tried, Tested, but not Proved: *The Home Cook Book* and the Development of a Canadian Culinary Identity

Melissa McAfee and Ashley Shifflett McBrayne*

In a “Letter to the Publishers” in an early edition of *The Home Cook Book*, Canadian journalist and publisher George Stewart Jr. wrote, “The subject of cookery is of national importance. The Scotsman discusses his haggis, the Englishman his chop, the Frenchman his pâté, and the American would be uncomfortable all day Sunday, if his plate of beans and brown bread were forgotten. In Canada proper, we have no national dish yet, but in Quebec in the old French parishes, our friends enjoy a mysterious black pudding, which savoury compound is fearfully and wonderfully made.”¹

First published in Canada in 1877 by the Toronto publishing firm Belford Brothers, *The Home Cook Book* was issued fifty-two years after the appearance of the first printed cookbook in Canada.² The majority of the 1,039 recipes offered in the volume are either British or American in origin. Only a small selection appears to be authentic Canadian cuisine. As the first community or fundraising cookbook issued in Canada — in this case to benefit Toronto’s Hospital for Sick Children — one might assume that the recipes, purported to be contributed by women living in Toronto in the late nineteenth century, would illuminate Canadian food habits. However, a close examination of the first Canadian edition of *The Home Cook Book*

* Melissa McAfee is the Special Collections Librarian and Ashley Shifflett McBrayne is a Library Associate in Archival & Special Collections in the University of Guelph Library. One of the collections they oversee contains over 17,000 culinary materials dating from the seventeenth century to the present.

¹ George Stewart Jr., “Letter to the Publisher,” in *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book: Compiled from Recipes Contributed by Ladies of Toronto and Other Cities and Towns: Published for the Benefit of the Hospital for Sick Children* (St. John, NB: R.A.H. Morrow Publisher, 1878), v–vi.

² The 1877 edition — *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book. Compiled from Recipes Contributed by Ladies of Toronto and other Cities and Towns: Published for the Benefit of the Hospital for Sick Children* (Toronto: Belford Brothers, 1877) — is believed to be the thirty-third cookbook produced in Canada. See Elizabeth Driver, *Culinary Landmarks: A Bibliography of Canadian Cookbooks, 1825–1929* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008).

casts doubt on the extent of the role of the “Ladies of Toronto and Other Cities and Towns” in compiling the cookbook, and suggests that the publisher had a large role in the selection of the content, much of which was pirated from the American cookbook of the same title published in Chicago in three editions prior to the initial Toronto publication. Nonetheless, the cookbook is important because of its influence on the development of Canadian culinary identity in the decades after Confederation. The fifty-two printings of the cookbook, which appeared from 1877 to 1929, served as a catalyst and a model for the community cookbook publishing phenomenon throughout Canada, which has persisted to the present day.³ In doing so, it influenced the development of an authentic textual medium often authored by the under-heard voices of women who transmitted Canadian culinary and social traditions.

Given some of its contents, however, it is more accurate to locate *The Home Cook Book* as a hybrid of two genres: the commercial domestic manual and the community cookbook. Domestic manuals gave instructions on both cooking and household operations. Advice would be provided on topics beyond the kitchen, and included receipts for cleaning procedures, as well as advice for entertaining, managing the household, and tending to the sick. The food-specific recipes presented in *The Home Cook Book* were probably also selected for commercial reasons and are an indication of what the publisher thought Canadians wanted to eat. Compared to community cookbooks of our day (typically self-published, spiral bound, and containing fewer than one hundred pages), *The Home Cook Book*, at nearly four hundred pages, resembled contemporary commercial publications.

While this cookbook may not be a reliable source for learning about Canadian cookery in the decades immediately after Confederation, the large number of recipes pirated from the American cookbook certainly demonstrates how American food preferences and cooking practices came to permeate Canadian cuisine. As the title-page suggests, the recipes may have been “tried, tested, and proved,” but the Chicago edition reveals that they are not always proven to be Canadian in origin.

Community cookbooks in their purest form reflect the cultural food habits of the communities that produce them. In her *Culinary Landmarks: A Bibliography of Canadian Cookbooks, 1825–1949*, Elizabeth Driver writes that community cookbooks are usually

³ A list of the editions of *The Home Cook Book* can be found in Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 322–36.

developed by “members of an organization [who] gather together recipes from their supporters, produce a text for printing, then sell the published work, usually to raise money for their cause, but often also for other reasons, which they may consider as important as the revenue, such as social value.”⁴ Often self-published by community groups for the benefit of a social or civic cause, the nuance and style of community cookbooks differ from commercially published cookbooks and offer a perspective into the social and economic landscape of a place and time. Lynne Ireland has also studied the community cookbook — what she refers to as the “compiled cookbook” — as the autobiography of the community and time period in which they were published.⁵ To assess the accuracy and completeness of the “autobiographical cookbook,” she suggests a close reading of the texts. The inclusion, exclusion, and repetition of recipes and ingredients, and their nature and scope, have the potential to provide major clues into a community’s food habits, including food preferences, taboos, popular and commonly served dishes, and changing economic and immigration patterns.⁶ She also makes the important distinction between whether a community cookbook tells the story of what a community actually eats or what they would have you believe that they eat.⁷ Ireland provides useful guidelines for how one might assess whether community cookbooks are faithful representations of their communities.

This paper will explore the influence of one significant example (albeit a hybrid one) of the community cookbook through its adaptation of a pirated American source. We will show how, over the course of its publication history, *The Home Cook Book* affected and reflected the development of Canadian cultural identity in the years after Confederation. Our study will examine the origins of the cookbook, with particular emphasis on influences on the content, design, and development; its publication history; and lastly, its reception and impact through a review of selected Canadian community cookbooks published in its wake. Our analysis of Canadian iterations of *The Home Cook Book* combines Ireland’s and Driver’s frameworks as a method for interpreting and understanding the impact of its publication. In particular, we have focused attention

⁴ Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 277.

⁵ Lynne Ireland, “The Compiled Cookbook as Foodways Autobiography,” *Western Folklore* 40, no. 1 (1981): 107–14.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 110.

⁷ *Ibid.*, 111.

on the selection and attribution of the recipes in their geographic and historical context and the bibliographic evidence.

As we agree with Driver's assertion that the source text was likely a later edition of the Chicago cookbook, we compared the first Canadian edition of *The Home Cook Book* (Toronto, 1877) with the third edition of the Chicago cookbook, published in 1876.⁸ We undertook a close reading and comparison of the two works, with concern for titles of recipes, contents, and contributors (including recipes contributed anonymously), and also compared the domestic manual chapters of the book ("Social Observances," "Table Talk," and so forth), to determine — qualitatively and quantitatively — the extent of original contributions to the Toronto text. To understand further how the Toronto edition of *The Home Cook Book* was developed and to assess its impact, we also pursued archival research, examining the annual reports of the board of the Hospital for Sick Children and meeting minutes of its Ladies' Committee from the period 1874–79, which aligns with the three-year period when the cookbook was affiliated with the hospital. We also looked at the surviving papers of the Hunter, Rose & Company, a later Toronto publisher of the work.⁹

Genesis of Community Cookbook Publishing: An Area of Scholarly Study

Community cookbooks have been popular in America since their beginnings, when they were first introduced as vehicles to raise money to help families of injured soldiers during the Civil War. More than 2,000 community cookbooks were published in the United States from the 1864 appearance of Maria J. Moss's *A Poetical Cook-Book* to 1922.¹⁰ Janice Bluestein Longone views the phenomenon of community cookbooks after the Civil War as the first "explosion" in American cookbook publishing, one resulting from a disenfranchised

⁸ Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 323; *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book. Compiled from Recipes Contributed by Ladies of Chicago and other Cities and Towns: Originally published for the benefit of the Home of the Friendless, Chicago* (J. Fred Waggoner, 1876), <https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.rsl5en;view=1up;seq=7>.

⁹ Hunter, Rose & Co. (Papers), [ca. 1874]–1977. Ms Coll. 00217. Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library, University of Toronto.

¹⁰ Jan Longone, "The Historic American Cookbook Project," *Feeding America*, 25 July 2017, http://digital.lib.msu.edu/projects/cookbooks/html/intro_essay.html.

community of women looking to display “collective civic virtue” and to participate in American public life.¹¹

After the American Civil War ended in 1865, many women’s organizations published community cookbooks to support other causes such as hospitals, schools, religious organizations, social causes, and so forth. The genre developed quickly over the next decade and migrated to Canada with the publication of *The Home Cook Book* (see figure 1). The Canadian adoption of this genre provided an opportunity for women to take on a prominent role in the creation of cookbooks and the social causes of their communities, but also demonstrates the continued American influence on the evolution of Canadian cookbook publishing after Confederation. A third of the cookbooks published in Canada prior to 1877 were written by Americans or based on American sources, including *The Cook Not Mad* (1831), the first English-language cookbook published in a colony that now forms part of Canada.¹²

Figure 1: Title-page, *Home Cook Book*, Toronto, 1878.

¹¹ Janice Bluestein Longone, “‘Tried Receipts’: An Overview of America’s Charitable Cookbooks,” in *Recipes for Reading: Community Cookbooks, Stories, Histories*, ed. Anne L. Bower (Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press, 1997): 17–28, 20.

¹² *The Cook Not Mad, or, Rational Cookery: Being a Collection of Original and Selected Receipts, Embracing Not Only the Art of Curing Various Kinds of Meats and Vegetables for Future Use, but of Cooking, in its General Acceptation, to the Taste, Habits, and Degrees of Luxury Prevalent with the Canadian Public, to which are Added, Directions for Preparing Comforts for the Sick Room, Together with Sundry Miscellaneous Kinds of Information of Importance to Housekeepers in General, Nearly All Tested by Experience* (Kingston, Upper Canada: J. Macfarlane, 1831).

Scholarly research on cookbooks is in its preliminary stages and thus far has focused broadly and predominantly on texts of the hand-press period (ca. 1450–1800), national and regional culinary traditions, or well-known cookbook writers of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, such as Catharine Parr Traill, Isabella Beeton, Fannie Farmer, and Julia Child. The study of community cookbooks is a specialized area within the field, one complicated by the prevalence of local publications and small print runs. Research is exacerbated by the often-fragile state of the paper upon which these cookbooks were printed, cheap binding, and the undated state of many imprints. If acquired by libraries, they are often uncatalogued, under-catalogued, or inaccurately catalogued, and consequently have been the focus of few digitization projects. An important work on the sub-genre of community cookbooks is Margaret Cook's comprehensive bibliography, *America's Charitable Cooks* (1971), which provides a good foundation for understanding the corpus of these ephemeral and ubiquitous materials published in the United States. Another prominent bibliographer is Elizabeth Driver, who identified a large proportion of Canadian community cookbooks and has written about them in her introduction to the Ontario section of *Culinary Landmarks* and in her article "Home Cooks, Book Makers and Community Builders in Canada."¹³

Since the publication of Cook's and Driver's bibliographies, scholars have approached the study of community cookbooks from a variety of interests and disciplines. A women's history or feminist approach has been taken by scholars such as Janet Theophano and Laura Shapiro,¹⁴ highlighting the nature of community cookbooks as a window into women's lives, especially as a way for women to participate in their communities. Those interested in culinary history and the study of foodways, such as Driver and Carolyn Blackstock,¹⁵ have examined community cookbooks to investigate "whether the recipes work by cooking them" because "preparing

¹³ Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 276–79; Elizabeth Driver, "Home Cooks, Book Makers and Community Builders in Canada," in *Food, Culture, and Community*, ed. Lynette Hunter, *Moving Worlds* 6, no. 2 (Autumn 2006): 41–60.

¹⁴ Janet Theophano, *Eat My Words: Reading Women's Lives through the Cookbooks They Wrote* (New York: Palgrave, 2002); Laura Shapiro, *Perfection Salad: Women and Cooking at the Turn of the Century* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2008).

¹⁵ Carolyn Blackstock, "A Year with the Berlin Cook Book," *Cuizine: The Journal of Canadian Food Cultures* 4, no. 2 (2013): doi:10.7202/1019325ar.

the recipes is a way of testing whether the book would actually have been useful in the kitchen.”¹⁶ Others have taken a regional approach, such as Kristine Kowalchuk and Julia Christensen, who looked at recipes from the Canadian Prairies and Northwest Territories respectively.¹⁷ Finally, culturally specific approaches are evidenced by Jacqueline Newman’s study of Chinese community cookbooks, Marion Bishop’s examination of Mormon community cookbooks, and Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett’s review of cookbooks from the Jewish community.¹⁸

Ireland’s study of the “compiled cookbook” analyzes components of these books, including the title of the work, nature of the recipes, and community demographics. To these three factors, one might also include the period in which the cookbook was published. Driver states, “every culinary manual has a unique publishing history, set within the national context of a country’s publishing industry ... it is [therefore] necessary to consider a cookbook’s publishing history to interpret the meaning between the covers and to assess the book’s significance within the society.”¹⁹

Origins of *The Home Cook Book* and Comparison with the Chicago Source Text

In the late 1870s, the Ladies’ Committee of the newly established Hospital for Sick Children embraced the idea of a cookbook project as a fundraiser for the hospital. The Ladies’ Committee was an

¹⁶ Elizabeth Driver, “Cookbooks as Primary Sources for Writing History: A Bibliographer’s View,” *Food, Culture & Society* 12, no. 3 (April 2015): 257–74 (259).

¹⁷ Kristine Kowalchuk, “Community Cookbooks in the Prairies,” *Cuizine: The Journal of Canadian Food Cultures* 4, no. 1 (2013): doi:10.7202/1015493ar; Julia Christensen, “Eskimo Ice Cream and Kraft Dinner Goulash: The Cultural Geographies of Food in Three Cookbooks from the Northwest Territories (NWT), Canada,” *Cuizine: The Journal of Canadian Food Cultures* 4, no. 1 (2013): doi:10.7202/1015494ar.

¹⁸ Jacqueline M. Newman, “Chinese Community Cookbooks,” *Flavor and Fortune Magazine* 6, no. 2 (1999): 6–26; Marion Bishop, “Speaking Sisters: Relief Society Cookbooks and Mormon Culture,” in *Recipes for Reading: Community Cookbooks, Stories, Histories*, ed. Anne L. Bower (Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press, 1997), 89–104; Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, “Recipes for Creating Community: The Jewish Charity Cookbook in America,” *Jewish Folklore and Ethnology Review* 9, no. 1 (1987): 8–12.

¹⁹ Driver, “Cookbooks as Primary Sources for Writing History,” 258.

enterprising and reform-minded group, comprised primarily of socially prominent women. It was led by the energetic Elizabeth McMaster, a Toronto philanthropist and a devout Baptist, who was motivated by a profound spiritual and religious commitment to social action.²⁰ As a fundraiser, the impact of the first edition of the cookbook appears to have been modest; the hospital's annual reports show only six dollars in revenue from "Cook Books" in 1877, with no mention of any money received from the publishers or booksellers.²¹ By comparison, far more money was raised that year through the hospital's successful cot sponsorship program whereby individuals or groups could sponsor a cot for \$100, payable in \$25 increments.²² The hospital ceased to be affiliated with *The Home Cook Book* after the 1879 printing, a split apparent from the subsequent removal of the hospital's name from the title-page. While the minimal funds raised might have been one reason for this parting of the ways, the separation also came about after the committee received a threatening letter from the lawyer of the Chicago publisher, who identified pirated sections of the Toronto edition of the cookbook.²³

The cookbook's publisher in Toronto, Belford Brothers, was very active in producing pirated American and British texts in the 1870s, and in fact were "notorious" for it.²⁴ The Belfords — Alexander Beaty Belford, Charles Belford, and Robert James Belford — had come to Canada from Ireland in 1857 and formed Belford Brothers in 1875.²⁵ Alexander Beaty Belford began working for John Ross Robertson as a clerk at the Daily Telegraph Printing House in 1867, and may have been exposed to piracy practices there, as Robertson was known to pirate books.²⁶ According to Canadian publishing

²⁰ Judith Young, "A Divine Mission: Elizabeth McMaster and the Hospital for Sick Children, Toronto, 1875–92," *Canadian Bulletin of Medical History* 11, no. 1 (1994): 71–90.

²¹ *Report of the Hospital for Sick Children, 245 Elizabeth Street, Toronto. From January 1st, 1877, to December 31st, 1877* (Toronto: Hunter, Rose & Co., Printers), 17.

²² David Wright, *SickKids: The History of the Hospital for Sick Children* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2017).

²³ Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 323. Driver refers to \$75 recovered from Belford Bros.

²⁴ Elizabeth Hulse, "The Hunter Rose Company: A Brief History," *The Devil's Artisan* 18 (1986): 3–10 (5).

²⁵ Elizabeth Hulse, *A Dictionary of Toronto Printers, Publishers, Booksellers, and the Allied Trades, 1798–1900* (Toronto: Anson-Cartwright Editions, 1982), 18.

²⁶ George L. Parker, "English-Canadian Publishers and the Struggle for Copyright," in *History of the Book in Canada, Volume II 1840–1918*, ed. Yvan Lamonde, Patricia

historian George Parker, “Belford Brothers printed American books that were not protected under the 1842 Imperial copyright act, as well as British books not registered at Stationers’ Hall or under Canada’s 1875 act.”²⁷ Nonetheless, the firm did lose a copyright infringement case in 1876, not long before the appearance of the Toronto edition of *The Home Cook Book*.²⁸ Belford operated in Toronto until 1878, when Charles Belford retired due to poor health and Robert James Belford joined George Maclean Rose to form Rose-Belford Publishing Co., which he managed.²⁹ Alexander Beaty Belford worked briefly for Rose-Belford before forming a new partnership with Robert and James Clarke Belford, another relative, at Belford, Clarke & Co., which operated in Toronto and Chicago.³⁰ Rose continued to print *The Home Cook Book* under the Rose-Belford imprint for many years after the Belfords’ departure from the business.

In her introduction to the 125th Anniversary Edition of *The Home Cook Book*, published in 2002, Driver wrote that a large part of the Toronto cookbook was pirated from an American cookbook of the same name, first published in Chicago in 1874 for the benefit of the Home for the Friendless. She goes on to state that the “compilers of *The Home Cook Book* may have relied heavily on the structure and content of the Chicago book, but their text was, in the end, a separate entity. Cooking in Canada and the United States is based largely on common traditions, so the Toronto ladies reasonably kept much of the Chicago material. Still, over half (54%) of the recipes are new.”³¹ Her assessment was based on a comparison of the 1877 Toronto text

Lockhart Fleming, and Fiona A. Black (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005): 148–59 (153).

²⁷ Ibid.

²⁸ The Belford brothers lost a court case in 1876 to Samuel Smiles when they published *Thrifty* without permission. The court decided that the Canadian Copyright Act of 1875 did not take precedence over the Imperial Copyright Act of 1842 (ibid.). The court case between Smiles and Belford Bros. highlighted tensions after Confederation between the Canadian Copyright Law and the Imperial Copyright Act of 1842 that preceded it. A *Globe* editorial discusses “the supremacy of the Imperial Legislation (as the Parent State) over local legislation” in relation to the case and expresses that “it does not follow, however, that the Copyright Act of 1875 is a useless piece of legislation,” countering possible sentiments after the verdict. See J.C. Tache, “Copyrights,” *The Globe*, 7 October 1876, p. 2.

²⁹ Hulse, *A Dictionary of Toronto Printers*, 223.

³⁰ Ibid., 19.

³¹ Elizabeth Driver, Introduction to *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book, 125th Anniversary Edition* (Vancouver, BC: Whitecap Books, 2002), xviii.

with the 1874 Chicago text. In 2008, Driver revised her opinion of the source text, and asserted that the 1876 edition of the Chicago cookbook was the more likely source for the first Toronto text.³² As we concur with Driver's hypothesis, we undertook a detailed comparison of the 1877 Toronto edition with the 1876 Chicago edition.

The hybrid nature of the Toronto edition of *The Home Cook Book* finds its origins in the Chicago text. Both the Toronto and Chicago versions are similar to other domestic manuals of the nineteenth century, including those that were in circulation in the 1870s.³³ In addition to recipes for preparing food, *The Home Cook Book* included chapters on a variety of domestic concerns, such as housekeeping, etiquette, bills of fare, and advice for tending to the ill. At the same time, and following the example of the Chicago text, many of the recipes are individually credited — a distinguishing feature of community cookbooks.

The Toronto edition of the book removed the Chicago preface, and added one written by Mrs. McMaster, which only appeared in the first edition published in 1877.³⁴ In her preface, McMaster is surprisingly mute over how *The Home Cook Book* was compiled. Ireland has noted a commonality in the prefaces of community cookbooks, one in which there is commentary on the successful nature of the recipes and approval by social groups, husbands, and families.³⁵ However, McMaster's preface is not characteristic of the genre. Furthermore, some explanation of the nature of the book, or the individually attributed recipes, might have been expected or useful given that, at the time, a fundraising cookbook would have been an unfamiliar type of cookbook to the Toronto community. Moreover, McMaster does not refer to the Ladies' Committee or acknowledge the efforts of any individual involved in the project. These omissions cast some doubt on how involved, beyond some recipe contributions, the members of the committee were in compiling and selecting recipes. Instead, McMaster uses the preface as a case for supporting

³² Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 323.

³³ Some contemporary examples of domestic manuals published in Ontario include Catharine Parr Traill's *The Female Emigrant's Guide and Hints on Canadian Housekeeping* (Toronto: Maclear, 1855), and *The Canadian Receipt Book: Containing over 500 Valuable Receipts for the Farmer and the Housewife* (Ottawa: Ottawa Citizen, 1867).

³⁴ This preface has been reprinted in the Anniversary edition published by Whitecap Books in 2002.

³⁵ Ireland, "The Compiled Cookbook as Foodways Autobiography," 108–9.

the hospital, citing the need to have “some place where the ailments of children can be studied by themselves, to the great advancement of medical knowledge.”³⁶ She also cites the hospital’s success in the treatment of 111 children, and highlights the expertise of its medical and nursing staff. She ends with a plea for book purchasers not to “rest content with the aid thus given to the institution,” but instead to “become acquainted with its plan and working.”³⁷

Elements that Driver refers to as extra-textual (i.e., paratextual) components of *The Home Cook Book*, especially in subsequent re-printings, also alter the community feel of the publication. A new commercial element can be seen in the “Letter to the Publishers” by George Stewart Jr., which appeared in the book after the first edition. It seems to serve primarily as a marketing device in the form of an endorsement, such as might be seen today by a celebrity chef or a blurb on a dust jacket. For example, Stewart writes, “The volume you have sent me is not only, in my opinion, an admirable receipt-book, but it is a perfect companion to a housewife.”³⁸ Advertised as costing one dollar, sales were evidently brisk, but the lack of pertinent publishers’ archives prevents us from knowing exactly how many copies were sold during the half century after its initial appearance. Publicity for the book cited by Elizabeth Hulse and Driver, putting sales at over 25,000 copies in 1881, and over 100,000 copies in 1885, were likely exaggerations for marketing purposes.³⁹ Another marketing gimmick that appears in subsequent reprintings was to identify them as numbered editions on their title-pages; in effect, presenting these reprints as numbered editions may well have created the impression that *The Home Cook Book* was more popular than it actually was. According to the title-pages, a “fiftieth edition” appears around 1881, a “sixtieth edition” between 1881 and 1887, a “seventieth edition” around 1887, and a “one hundredth edition” around 1918.

The extent to which the Toronto cookbook pirated the earlier Chicago source can be determined by an examination of the recipes.

³⁶ Mrs. S.F. McMaster, Preface to *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book, 125th Anniversary Edition*, x.

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ George Stewart Jr., “Letter to the Publishers,” in *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book. Compiled by the Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada* (Toronto: Rose Publishing Co., 1883), iv–v, <https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=hvd.rsl77u;view=1up;seq=9>.

³⁹ Hulse, “The Hunter Rose Company,” 6; Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 323.

After comparing the new content in the Toronto edition against the recipes used from the Chicago contributors, we found that only 409 of the 1,039 recipes are new to the Toronto edition, or just 39 percent. This excludes the almost wholly pirated contents of the preceding domestic-manual chapters on “Housekeeping,” “Table Talk,” “Dinner Etiquette,” “Social Observances,” “The Little Housekeepers,” “Our Susan’s Opinion of a Kitchen,” and “Utensils.” Table 1 provides a quantified comparison of the pirated, deleted, and added content by chapter.

The contents of the two cookbooks diverge in the arrangement of the chapters and the selection of recipes. In the Toronto text, a section named “Domestic Receipts” precedes the “Meats” section. In addition, a “Dishes for Dessert” section follows the “Ices” section. In the Chicago text, the “Cakes” chapter contains subsections titled “Layer Cakes” and “Small Cakes and Cookies,” but such subdivisions are not present in the Canadian publication. Further, the “Sick Room” chapter is divided in the Toronto book with a subsection called “Medicinal Receipts.”

While most of the recipe sections in the Toronto text resemble the Chicago text quite closely, four of the nineteen sections, and especially the “Cakes” section, follow the Chicago text very little. In both texts, the “Cakes” section is very prominent, though it is significantly larger in the Toronto text. While the Chicago text has ninety-five recipes allocated among the subsections “Layer Cakes” and “Small Cakes and Cookies,” the Toronto text has one sizeable chapter containing 158 recipes, of which only nine originated in the Chicago text. This results in 149 new recipes in the Toronto text, representing 94.3 percent of the new content of this section. As Catharine Parr Traill observed in 1854 in *The Female Emigrant’s Guide* (an authentic portrayal of the Canadian culinary landscape prior to Confederation), Canada is “the land of cakes.”⁴⁰ Thus the enhanced prominence of cakes is not surprising. Chapters in which more than half of the recipes were attributed to the Toronto ladies include “Drinks,” “Pies & Pastry,” “Puddings,” and “Salads, Sauces, and Pickles.” Those chapters with few contributions from the ladies include the “Candy,” “Vegetables,” “Pudding Sauces,” and “Breakfast & Supper” sections.

⁴⁰ Traill, *The Female Emigrant’s Guide*, 110.

**Table 1. Comparison of Chicago and Toronto Editions of
*The Home Cook Book***

Chapter	Number of Recipes in Chicago ed. (1876)	Number of Recipes in Toronto ed. (1877)	Pirated Recipes from Chicago text in Toronto ed.	Recipes from Toronto contributors	Percentage of pirated content in Toronto ed.
Soups	36	35	27	8	77.1%
Fish	41	32	26	6	81.3%
Poultry & Game	28	28	23	5	82.1%
Meat (and Domestic Receipts)	57	51	41	10	80.4%
Salads, Sauces, and Pickles	82	87	38	49	43.7%
Breakfast & Supper	54	44	38	6	86.4%
Vegetables	45	34	31	3	91.2%
Puddings	107	112	55	57	49.1%
Pudding Sauces	13	15	13	2	86.7%
Pies & Pastry	42	37	18	19	48.6%
Custards & Creams	52	38	34	4	89.5%
Ices	12	10	8	2	80%
Fruits	51	58	40	18	69%
Candy	16	16	15	1	93.8%
Bread & Yeast	157	98	70	28	71.4%
Cakes	95	158	9	149	5.7%
Drinks	13	26	12	14	46.2%
Misc.	40	50	37	13	74%
The Sick Room	25	40	24	16	60%

A comparison of the recipes in the Toronto edition of *The Home Cook Book* with contemporary cookbooks from Toronto is needed to draw conclusions about whether this cookbook is a true

food autobiography according to Ireland's definition. However, a preliminary analysis of our data suggests that *The Home Cook Book* is not an authentic example of Ireland's idea of a community cookbook as food autobiography because more than half of its recipes are from a pirated American source and therefore not truly reflective of Toronto. Its commercial nature suggests that the publishers shared in the responsibility for the selection of the recipes and other content, causing one to think that their selection criteria was based on what they believed would make the book sell. The publishers appeared to be speculating on what people might want to cook or like to cook.

On the other hand, Ireland's premise that community cookbooks conservatively adhere "to traditional food habits despite change and innovation" is sustained since there were extremely few changes in the Toronto cookbook between 1877 and 1929.⁴¹ Changes to the text over the course of its publishing history are enumerated in Table 2 under "Publishing History of the Canadian version of *The Home Cook Book*." Despite the introduction of new food technologies, ingredients, and increased immigration, there were no substantial revisions to the Canadian text over the fifty-two years that it remained in print. Its popularity suggests that despite the fact that the cookbook is not a reliable source for studying Toronto foodways, it may, over the course of five decades, have influenced Toronto cookery to resemble more closely that of Chicago.

Attributions and Efforts to Canadianize the Contents

In addressing the question of how the text of Toronto's *The Home Cook Book* was created, we looked at the critical factors in the development of published cookbooks outlined by Driver, including the following: the purpose of the book; the role of the authors (recipe contributors) and publishers; the source of the text and alterations in later editions; and the extra-textual (i.e., paratextual) components.⁴² While the archives of the Hospital for Sick Children were consulted, neither the minutes of the Ladies' Committee meetings nor the annual reports of the hospital board provide any pertinent details.⁴³

⁴¹ Ireland, "The Compiled Cookbook as Foodways Autobiography," 113.

⁴² Driver, "Cookbooks as Primary Sources for Writing History," 258.

⁴³ Minutes of Meeting of the Ladies' Committee, Manuscript, Hospital for Sick Children Archives, 19 December, 1876–19 December, 1880.

What we had hoped to discover were documents that might offer insights into this work as a fundraising project. It would have been helpful to find information about the role of the Ladies' Committee in the planning of this publication, details about how the recipes were solicited and gathered, clarification about how the recipes were selected, and documentation about how the committee came to work with Belford Brothers. This lack of relevant information in the extant Ladies' Committee and board minutes suggests that the Ladies' Committee was not closely involved in the planning and production of the cookbook. Consequently, it is reasonable to conclude that Belford Brothers played the dominant role in moulding the Toronto publication.

Of course, one learns significant details about the history of the work from the volume itself. For the most part, the named Toronto contributors had a relationship to the hospital, whether they were members of the Ladies' Committee, the wife of a doctor, or a regular volunteer visitor. Driver has mapped out who these women were and many of their names appear regularly in the minutes of the Ladies' Committee meetings.⁴⁴ However, there are also a number of contributors who appear to have no affiliation with the hospital. These women were relatives of the Belford Brothers. Their presence is another factor suggesting that the firm played a major role in determining the content of the cookbook. There are at least fifteen recipes originating from Chicago in the Toronto text credited to these individuals, including Mrs. C. Belford and Mrs. R. Belford, wives of the publishers, and other relatives of the Belford family, including the Beatys.⁴⁵ While some recipes credited to these individuals are original to the Toronto text, the majority of recipes attributed to Mrs. C. Belford are, in fact, taken from credited and uncredited recipes that appear in the Chicago edition. These include the recipes for "Pressed Chicken" and the home remedy for "Cleaning White Paint," both of which were attributed in the Chicago text to a Mrs. C.H. Wheeler, as well as the recipe for "Kiss Pudding" originally credited to Mrs. F.B. Cole. Mrs. C. Belford is also credited with "Roast Beef" and an "Egg Sauce" recipe, both of which appeared as uncredited recipes

⁴⁴ Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 322.

⁴⁵ Ibid. "On the publisher's side, the wives of Charles and Robert Belford contributed recipes, as did Mrs. James Beaty (probably the wife of the Belford brothers' great-uncle James) and two of her relatives (Mrs. Robert Beaty and Miss Kate Beaty)."

in the Chicago text. However, the recipe for “Cocoanut Pie” might be her own or may have been taken from another American source.

Through comparison of the Chicago and Toronto texts, we discerned the extent to which the publishers of the Toronto version disguised the American original by the removal of general references that would have identified the book as originally an American publication. For example, the section in the 1876 Chicago edition on domestic issues was written with the centennial of American Independence in mind and the celebrations that would ensue during the year. In the “Social Observances” chapter, references to “Centennial enthusiasm” and tea parties like “Mrs. Washington used to give” have been left out, as well as an explanation of the differences between “New York etiquette” and “English Custom.” Similarly, in “Dinner Etiquette,” the Chicago text specifies that the “number of guests for a state dinner, even such as are given by the President and Secretary of State, at Washington, rarely exceeds 12” whereas the Toronto text reads simply: “The number of guests at a state dinner rarely exceeds 12.” In discussion of the proper dining furniture and table length, the Chicago text refers to the size of the dining table owned by Mr. A.T. Stewart and the diameter of the round table owned by William Butler Duncan for intimate parties. As Stewart was a prominent Chicago department store owner, and Duncan was the President of the Mobile and Ohio Railroad Company, readers might recognize these individuals and thus, this passage was omitted. However, such omissions are not consistent, as demonstrated in “The Little Housekeepers” section, in which one reads of little girl helpers in their “Martha Washington dusting caps.” As well, both the Chicago and Toronto texts state, “There is a great work to be done in American kitchens.”⁴⁶

Variation can also be discerned in the way recipes are attributed or titled. The Chicago edition credits recipe contributors outside of Chicago by name and city of residence. One can see, for example, that recipes were submitted by women from cities including Evanston (Illinois), Detroit (Michigan), and Albany (New York). In the case of recipes from the Chicago text that were retained, the Toronto edition includes the recipes’ content and the original contributor’s name. However, the place names have been removed. This occurs in thirty-nine instances and an additional two in which the recipe had been credited simply to “A Southern Lady.” Place names and

⁴⁶ *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book, 125th Anniversary Edition*, 36.

other American references found in recipe titles are addressed in two ways: first, through the exclusion of recipes such as “Congress Pickles,” “Saratoga Fried Potatoes,” “Boston Baked Beans,” “Astor House Pudding,” “Philadelphia Butter Pie,” “Boston Brown Bread,” “Detroit Rolls,” “Virginia Biscuits,” “Green Mountain Biscuits,” and “New England Election Cake”; or, alternatively, by renaming recipes, including “Yankee Baked Beans” as “Canadian Baked Beans” and “Washington Pie” as “Toronto Pie.” However, the latter was done inconsistently, as there is still a recipe for a “Washington Pie,” as well as a “Lincoln Fruit Cake,” included in the Toronto publication. The reasons for these editorial inconsistencies cannot be fully determined in the absence of the relevant publishers’ archives that might have shed light on how the volume was compiled.

A few notable omissions of Chicago recipes are likely explained by the unavailability of their ingredients. In particular, this applies to regional dishes such as Ochre Gumbo, which appears in the Chicago text. Furthermore, despite the inclusion of crab in the Toronto index, no recipes employing crab as an ingredient actually appear in the Toronto cookbook. Driver also notes the omission of crab and suggests the ingredient was not available in Toronto.⁴⁷ As a reflection of the Toronto community, one needs to be critical when examining *The Home Cook Book* as a source of information on Canadian foodways around the time of Confederation. Only a few sections, such as “Cakes,” because of their high ratio of original content, can be legitimately viewed as representative of foods prepared in Toronto kitchens.

Publishing History of *The Home Cook Book*

The number of versions of *The Home Cook Book* published over a fifty-two year period indicates that it was well received in Canada. It was produced by five Toronto publishers from 1877 to 1929: Belford Brothers (1877); Rose-Belford Publishing Company (1878–82); Hunter, Rose & Company (1894); G.M. Rose & Sons (1895–1901); and Musson Book Company (1902–29) as well as by other publishers

⁴⁷ Driver, Introduction to *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book*, 125th Anniversary Edition, xvii. Driver provides an excellent summary of the differences of ingredients between the two texts, namely the inclusion of tripe, heart, and ox tail to the Toronto text, as well as a heartier “Vegetables” chapter, and a unique Carrot Pudding recipe.

outside of Toronto.⁴⁸ The cookbook was also published in Sydney, Australia (Fraser & Fraser, 1889),⁴⁹ in Wellington, New Zealand (Clara Pinny Yerex, 1891),⁵⁰ and in London, England (The De More Press, 1895).⁵¹ Facsimiles of the Belford Brothers' 1877 edition were produced in 1970 (Toronto, Ontario Reprint Press),⁵² 1971 (Toronto, Coles Publishing Company),⁵³ 1980 (Toronto, Coles Publishing Company),⁵⁴ and 2002 (Vancouver, Whitecap Books).⁵⁵ The facsimiles of 1970, 1971, and 1980 erroneously attribute the publisher of the 1877 edition to Hunter, Rose & Company, rather than Belford Brothers.

⁴⁸ Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 324. Other Canadian editions were published as follows: 1) Saint John, NB, by R.A.H. Morrow, 1878 (two editions) and 1879 (sold by subscription); 2) Paris, ON, by John S. Brown, ca. 1879; 3) Whitby, ON, by J.S. Robertson & Bros., 1882 and 1883 (three printings of the 50th edition and one edition sold by subscription); 4) London, ON, by McDermid & Logan, 1887 (60th edition) and 1889 (70th edition); 5) Barrie, ON, by W.B. Baikie, 1887 (70th edition); and 6) Winnipeg, MB, by Russell Lang & Co., ca. 1901 and by Consolidated Stationary Co. (prior to 1917 per Driver). Some of the editions were numbered as follows: 50th edition (Rose-Belford, two printings ca. 1881 and 1882; Rose Publishing, two printings ca. 1883 and 1883–84; J.S. Robertson, three printings ca. 1883); 60th edition (J.S. Robertson ca. 1887; Rose Publishing, two printings ca. 1887; McDermid & Logan, 1887); 70th edition (W.B. Baikie, 1887; J.S. Robertson, 1887; Rose Publishing, 1887, 1888, and 1889; McDermid & Logan, 1889; Hunter, Rose & Co., 1894 and ca. 1897; G.M. Rose, ca. 1895–98); 79th edition (G.M. Rose, ca. 1898–1901); and 100th edition (Hunter, Rose, 1923; Musson, 1929).

⁴⁹ *Tried! Tested! Proven! The Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada*, 75th edition (Sydney, Australia: Fraser & Fraser, 1889).

⁵⁰ *Tried! Tested! Proven! The Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada*, 78th edition (Wellington, New Zealand: Clara Pinny Yerex, 1891).

⁵¹ *Tried! Tested! Proven! The Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Ontario* (London, UK: The De La More Press, 1895).

⁵² *Tried! Tested! Proven! The Canadian Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada* (Toronto: Ontario Reprint Press, 1970).

⁵³ *Tried! Tested! Proven! The Canadian Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada* (Toronto: Coles Publishing Company, 1971).

⁵⁴ *Tried! Tested! Proven! The Canadian Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada* (Toronto: Coles Publishing Company, 1980).

⁵⁵ *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book, 125th Anniversary Edition* (Vancouver: Whitecap Books, 2002).

Over the course of the publishing history of *The Home Cook Book*, there were changes in kitchen technology and the presentation of recipes in cookbooks was standardized, particularly in the first quarter of the twentieth century. However, the organization and content of *The Home Cook Book* changed little during the fifty-two years it was in print. In the early twentieth century, gas stoves, equipped with temperature gauges, were starting to replace wood and coal-fuelled iron stoves, especially in urban areas. Nevertheless, cooking instructions for twentieth-century printings of *The Home Cook Book* continued to specify oven temperatures as slow, moderate, or quick withdraw of a hand from the stove, according to the intensity of the heat. Most likely these crude measurements of heat levels persisted in rural Ontario where modern stove technology was slow to be adopted. In the late nineteenth century, Fannie Farmer introduced standardized measuring cups and spoons in which ingredients should be levelled to ensure consistency. Eliza Acton, Isabella Beeton, and Mary Lincoln helped to establish the standard formatting of the modern recipes (list of ingredients, followed by an ordered list of instructions for preparing the food, cooking temperature, and duration) in the second half of the nineteenth century. Both level measurements and recipe standardization came to be the norm in twentieth-century cookbooks, particularly after the First World War. However, recipes in twentieth-century editions of *The Home Cook Book* did not adopt these innovations.

To assess changes over the course of *The Home Cook Book's* fifty-two-year publication history, we compared the 1877 edition to those published in 1887 (70th edition)⁵⁶ and 1923 (100th edition).⁵⁷ We did not have the opportunity to compare the 1877 edition to any other editions of the book between 1877 and 1923 and did not have access to the 1929 edition, which was the last publication of the cookbook. The text of all three editions is comprised of 384 pages, although there are slight variations in pagination.⁵⁸ All of the editions were bound

⁵⁶ *Tried! Tested! Proved! The Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada*, 70th edition (Toronto: Rose Publishing Company, 1887).

⁵⁷ *Tried! Tested! Proven! The Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada*, 100th edition (Toronto: Musson Book Company, 1923).

⁵⁸ In *Culinary Landmarks*, Elizabeth Driver lists the following editions in which the pagination has changed due to the addition of advertisements and the addition and deletion of content in the book: 1) O21.1 1887: [i–viii] [9] 1–384, [i–vi], 322;

in cloth with an identical design of the title stamped on the front cover, embellished with a thistle, the national flower of Scotland. This design motif might have been used as a tribute to the large number of Scottish Canadians in Ontario. The 1877 and 1887 editions are bound in brown oilcloth embossed with a wood grain pattern while the 1923 edition (see figures 2 and 3) is in green cloth with a linen grain pattern. Both binding styles were common during the period in which they were published.

Figure 2: Cover, *Home Cook Book*, Toronto, 1923.

2) O2o.28 70th ed., 1887: [i–iii] iv–xi [xii], [9], 10–384, 330; and 3) O2o.46 100th ed., 1923: [i–iii] iv–xi [xii], [9] 10–379 [380–84], 334.

Figure 3: Title-page, *Home Cook Book*, Toronto, 1923.

The contents of the three editions are remarkably similar. The 1887 and 1923 editions do not include the advertisements that appear at the end of the 1877 edition, but the 1887 edition has an advertisement for Cook's Friend Baking Powder on the verso of the page preceding the title-page. In addition, the 1887 and 1923 editions lack the dinner bill of fare for the Queen's Hotel in Toronto and an advertisement for this hotel that follows. In all three, the largest percentage of recipes are for the chapter on "Cakes" and the smallest for "Dishes for Dessert." The recipe attributions appear to remain the same in all editions. There are two chief differences between the editions. First, the "Index," which appears at the beginning of the 1877 edition and functions as a table of contents, was replaced with "Contents," which was in effect an index to all the recipes present in the later edition. Secondly, sixteen recipes were omitted and the

same number added in both the 1887 and 1923 editions, although there is some variation between the two editions (see Table 2). The elimination of eight pudding recipes in the 1923 edition, the largest number of recipes in a chapter to be omitted, was perhaps an indication of a diminished emphasis on British cookery. The inclusion of more sour pickle recipes and recipes for tongue and veal may perhaps be indicative of an enhanced interest in Central European cuisine. In addition, two recipes from the “Ices” chapter (“A Nice Dessert Dish” and “An Excellent Dessert”) are moved to the more appropriate “Dishes for Dessert” chapter in the later editions. Finally, the 1887 and 1923 editions include two new, short chapters: “Baking Powder” (see figure 4) and “Dal an Indian Lentil.” The first of these on baking powder is a short, one-page article on the “healthfulness” of the leavening agent. Most likely it was written in response to contemporary malicious advertising and erroneous newspaper reports about the health hazards of adulterated baking powder.⁵⁹ Instructions for making baking powder at home are provided, but housewives are advised to purchase it from a “respectable maker, who procures his supplies in a large scale from places of production, and can test their purity.”⁶⁰ Commercial baking powder such as Cook’s Friend Baking Powder and Magic Baking Powder were available in Canada from around the end of the nineteenth century. As a demonstration of the increased popularity of the new commercial baking soda, Cook’s Friend is listed as an ingredient in seventy-two recipes in the 1923 edition, but in only ten recipes in the 1877 edition of *The Home Cook Book*. The second new chapter, which appears in both the 1877 and 1923 editions, offers two dishes: Breakfast Dal and Bengal Soup (without meat) by Mrs. Keer, which were made from lentils, peas, or beans and onions boiled in water. The inclusion of these recipes might indicate an interest in the food of South Asia that was acquired from exposure to immigrants from this part of the world or travel to this region. Recipes by American “celebrity chef” Mary Virginia Terhune (1830–1922), known by her penname Marion Harland, were also added, but unlike the recipes included from the Chicago edition, these were credited.

⁵⁹ See Linda Civitello, *Baking Powder Wars: The Cutthroat Food Fight that Revolutionized Cooking* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 2017).

⁶⁰ *Tried! Tested! Proven! The Home Cook Book. Compiled by Ladies of Toronto and Chief Cities and Towns in Canada* (1923), 165.

Table 2. Comparison of Recipes in First Edition to Later Editions

Chapter	1877	1887	1923	Omitted	Recipes Omitted 1887 & 1923 editions	Added	Recipes Added 1887 & 1923 editions
Soups	35	34	34	1	Croutons (uncredited) – both	0	
Fish	12	13	13	0		1	Codfish Balls (uncredited) – both
Shellfish	20	19	20	1	Scalloped Oysters (uncredited) 1887	0	
Poultry & Game	28	29	28	2	Dressing for Turkey (C. Kennieot) – 1923; Chicken Cheese (uncredited) – both	1	Broiled Pigeons or Squabs (Marion Harland) – both
Meats	10	11	11	0		1	Beef's Heart (Marion Harland) – both
Domestic Receipts	44	47	47	0		3	Boiled Tongue with Tomato Sauce (Mrs. J. Ellis) – both; Veal Cake (Mrs. Brokovski) – both; Pickled Pork (Mrs. Dr. Oliphant) – both
Salads, Sauces, and Pickles	17	17	17	0		0	
Sauces for Meat & Fish	29	29	29	0		0	
Sweet Pickles	5	5	5	0		0	
Sour Pickles	30	36	36	0		5	Spiced Tomatoes (Mrs. Stotesbury); Pickled Cucumbers (Mrs. Packard); Dressing Salad (Mrs. Riley); Cucumbers for Present use (Mrs. Riley); Tomato Mustard (Mrs. Spaulding) – both
Breakfast & Supper	46	46	46	0		0	
Vegetables	35	34	34	1	Mushroom Stewed – both	0	
Baking Powder	0	1	1	0		1	Baking Powder
Puddings	120	120	112	8	Potato; Apple & Bread crumb; Cottage; Paradise; Manchester; Small & Cheap Plum Pud; Queen of Puddings; Suet – 1923	0	
Pudding Sauces	15	15	15	0		0	
Pies	37	37	36	1	Plainer Pastry title, but no recipe – 1923	0	
Custards, Creams	39	39	39	0		0	

Ices	11	9	9	2	A Nice Dessert Dish (Mrs. J. Thorney); An Excellent Dessert (Mrs. J. Young Scammon) – both	0	
Dal an Indian Lentil	0	2	2	0		2	Breakfast Dal (Mrs. Keer); Bengal Soup without meat (Mrs. Keer) – both
Dishes for Dessert	2	4	4	0		2	A Nice Dessert Dish (Mrs. J. Thorney); An Excellent Dessert (Mrs. J. Young Scammon) – both
Fruits	59	59	59	0		0	
Candy	16	16	16	0		0	
Bread & Yeast	101	101	101	0		0	
Cakes	167	167	167	0		0	
Drinks	33	33	33	0		0	
Miscellaneous	50	50	50	0		0	
Sick Room	43	43	43	0		0	
Medicinal Receipts	35	35	35	0		0	
Total Receipts	1,039	1051	1043	16		16

Figure 4: Baking powder recipe, *Home Cook Book*, Toronto, 1923.

Influence of *The Home Cook Book* on later Community Cookbooks in Canada

The Home Cook Book in its Canadian iterations was likely the original stimulus for the many Canadian community cookbooks that followed. In the fifty years after Confederation, their numbers included approximately 122 titles from Ontario, seventeen from Quebec, and eighty-four from the remaining provinces.⁶¹ In order to see how this genre developed in its early years, we looked at some early examples of cookbooks published in Ontario, which we highlight below. Links to *The Home Cook Book* can be discerned, although there are also differences.

Many community cookbooks were fundraising initiatives of religious organizations and this was true of *The Toronto Cook Book* compiled by Mrs. E.J. Powell (see figures 5 and 6), which was dedicated to the “Ladies of the Dominion of Canada” and published in 1915. In the preface (a paratextual element also present in *The Home Cook Book*), Powell states that the proceeds from the cookbook would go to support those “who have been financially embarrassed by the present war.”⁶² The cookbook was developed with the support of the Executive Committee of the Davisville Methodist Church and the proceeds of the first 25,000 copies, after paying for the expenses of preparation and distribution, were allocated to causes to help the unemployed. Powell expressed the hope that every Christian church would act as a sales centre to increase the cookbook’s distribution. As in *The Home Cook Book*, Powell does not shed light on the practical aspects of how the book was designed, such as how the recipes were selected or details about how it was published.

Unlike community cookbooks of today, the *Toronto Cook Book* is an elegant, commercial production of similar dimensions to *The Home Cook Book*, and it also emulates the length and production values of the earlier work. It consists of 352 pages, twenty-four pages less than *The Home Cook Book*. Both cookbooks were bound in cloth with the titles stamped on the cover, although *The Home Cook Book* was issued in a number of binding variants over the years. Also, like *The Home Cook Book*, the *Toronto Cook Book* includes chapters on

⁶¹ Numbers of community cookbooks by province extrapolated from Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*.

⁶² Mrs. Edwin James Powell, *Toronto Cook Book* (Toronto: Printed by The Mortimer Company, 1915), 4.

Figure 5: Cover, *Toronto Cook Book*, 1915.

Figure 6: Title-page, *Toronto Cook Book*, 1915.

household and domestic issues such as “A Visit with the Housewife,” “Toilet Talk,” and the “Sick Room,” but far less space is devoted to information of this kind than in *The Home Cook Book*. In addition, none of the recipes are signed. Unique among cookbooks of this period, and much in contrast to *The Home Cook Book*, the *Toronto Cook Book* is illustrated throughout with fascinating photomontages, a popular printing process consisting of collages of photographic images from the time of the First World War and before (see figures 7 and 8). Many of these illustrations incorporate food displayed against a backdrop of various watercolours of nature scenes, such as the tropical scene in the illustration from the “Pudding” section,⁶³ or combinations of food and other imagery, such as the cutlery in the illustration from the “Meat” section.⁶⁴

Figure 7: Interior illustration,
Toronto Cook Book, 1915.

Figure 8: Interior illustration,
Toronto Cook Book, 1915.

⁶³ Powell, *Toronto Cook Book*, 32.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, 52.

A comparison of the recipes included in the two cookbooks reveals the following: first, the *Toronto Cook Book* includes three chapters on types of food that are not in *The Home Cook Book* of 1877. The innovative chapters include “Cheese Dishes,” “Chilled Jellied Desserts,” and “Sandwiches.” Secondly, the chapter on “Cakes” in the *Toronto Cook Book* accounts for a large percentage of the recipes (121), though still less than the 167 recipes in *The Home Cook Book*. Finally, the chapter on “Meat” is the largest section in the *Toronto Cook Book* with 142 recipes and the “Beverage” section is the smallest with only eight recipes. Although the construction and tone of the recipes is similar in both cookbooks, the *Toronto Cook Book* appears to include less repetition of recipes for the same kind of food, a larger variety of recipes and ingredients in each section, and has a more international flavour with the inclusion of some French, German, and Spanish recipes.

While approximately five hundred community cookbooks were published in Ontario to the mid-twentieth century, and community cookbooks accounted for a large percentage of all cookbooks published in all Canadian provinces from the beginning of the twentieth century, it is significant that most were in English and those associated with religious groups are mainly from Protestant churches.⁶⁵ Even in the case of those issued in Quebec, very few are in French or affiliated with Catholic groups. The only community cookbook published in Quebec before 1950 that included any recipes in French is “*The Black Whale*” *Cookbook*, published in the Gaspé in 1948, but most of the recipes in it are in English.⁶⁶

Two cookbooks that do significantly reflect a shift away from the early and decidedly more commercial community cookbook publications discussed above, and instead move in the direction of the now common ephemeral type of community cookbooks are *The Spartan Cook Book: A Selection of Tested Recipes Compiled by the Ladies of the Sparta WTA* (Women’s Temperance Auxiliary, 1902)⁶⁷ and *The Cobalt Souvenir and Cook Book* (ca. 1909)⁶⁸ (see figures 9 and 10). Both are issued in pamphlet bindings, not commercial hardcover

⁶⁵ Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 76.

⁶⁶ Ethel Renouf, “*The Black Whale*” *Cook Book: Famous Old Recipes Handed Down from Mother to Daughter* (Montreal: Gnaedinger, 1948).

⁶⁷ *The Spartan Cook Book: A Selection of Tested Recipes Compiled by the Ladies of the Sparta WTA* (Sparta, ON: Women’s Temperance Auxiliary, 1902).

⁶⁸ *Cobalt Souvenir and Cook Book: A Collection of Choice Tested Recipes Contributed and Compiled by the Ladies of the Presbyterian Church, Cobalt, Ontario* (Cobalt, ON: Cobalt Nugget Print, ca. 1908–9).

Figure 9: Cover, *Cobalt Souvenir and Cook Book*, ca. 1909

Figure 10: Title-page, *Cobalt Souvenir and Cook Book*, ca. 1909

volumes, contain significantly fewer pages than *The Home Cook Book* (Spartan, 168 pages; Cobalt, 86 pages), and were produced by local printing firms rather than commercial publishers. In addition, both cookbooks contain numerous advertisements throughout, indicating that the cookbooks might have been subsidized by local businesses (see figures 11–13). From this evidence, it is clear that they were assembled and produced by the women involved. The fundraising purpose behind *The Spartan Cook Book*, an initiative of the Women's Temperance Auxiliary, was to purchase the last standing bar in Sparta and turn it into a "dry" community centre⁶⁹ (see figure 14). *The Cobalt Souvenir and Cook Book*, an early example of a community cookbook from Northern Ontario, was compiled by women of the local Presbyterian Church.⁷⁰ At the time of its publication in 1908, Cobalt had become the largest producer of silver in the world. The purpose of the cookbook is unclear. The cover is illustrated with a simple coloured drawing of a camp and photographs of scenes from Cobalt appear at the front and back of the cookbook. Though these two publications have a more homemade feel than *The Home Cook Book* and the *Toronto Cook Book*, the women who compiled them shared a common goal of improving the communities in which they lived.

Figure 11: Advertisement, *The Spartan Cook Book*, 1902

⁶⁹ "To Whom it May Concern," *A Selection of Tested Recipes Compiled by the Ladies of the Sparta W.T.A.* (St. Thomas, ON: The Journal Book and Job Dept., 1902), 5.

⁷⁰ *Cobalt Souvenir and Cook Book: A Collection of Choice Tested Recipes Contributed and Compiled by the Ladies of the Presbyterian Church Cobalt, Ontario* (Cobalt, ON: Ladies' Aid, Presbyterian Church, ca. 1908–9).

6

THE SPARTAN W. T. A. COOK BOOK.

HOUSEWIVES, ATTENTION!

To insure the best results
from these recipes, use only

FOREST CITY

BAKING POWDER
SPICES AND
EXTRACTS

GORMAN, ECKERT & CO.

LIMITED

HIGH-GRADE FOOD PRODUCTS

LONDON AND WINNIPEG

THERE'S a roomy oven
in this range.

- An easy-working grate.
- A long-wearing enamel
reservoir.
- A handy emery rod.
- An effective ash-pan.

Indicating
that **Pandora Range** is made

**SCIENTIFICALLY,
SKILFULLY,
CAREFULLY.**

Your dealer will acquaint you
with **Pandora** prices. See him.

McClary's

London - Toronto - Montreal
Winnipeg - Vancouver
St. John, N. B. - Hamilton
Calgary.

Figure 12: Advertisement, *The Spartan Cook Book*, 1902

Chase & Sanborn's

HIGH GRADE COFFEE

Some people buy
Chase & Sanborn's Coffee because of its
exquisite flavor—others, because of its
strength—some, “just because
they like it.”

All of them, because no other
coffee suits them so
well.

91

Figure 13: Advertisement, *The Spartan Cook Book*, 1902

Figure 14: Preface, *The Spartan Cook Book*, 1902.

Conclusion

In many ways, *The Home Cook Book* issued by Canadian publishers (in addition to publishers abroad) between 1877 and 1929 belies the definitions of a community cookbook provided by Driver and Ireland. Substantial in length and manufactured according to high production standards throughout the fifty-two years of its publishing history, it clearly demonstrates a commercial sensibility as a physical object. Moreover, while associated those first few years with the Hospital for Sick Children as a fundraising vehicle, editorial involvement by its first publisher — Belford Brothers — was manifest from the outset given that certain recipes were attributed to members of the publishers' family.

The anonymous author of a contemporary review of *The Home Cook Book* published in the *Canadian Monthly and National Review* appeared not to know that many of the recipes in it were not of Canadian origin, stating that “it is well that our infant literature should include a Canadian Cookery Book.”⁷¹ However, our analysis of *The Home Cook Book* has shown the extent to which it is based on the Chicago publication of the same name. A large proportion of the content was pirated from the Chicago edition, including most of the chapters on domestic and household issues and 559 of the 1,039 recipes. In addition, the contents of the cookbook did not change much over its half century in print, despite developments in kitchen technology and the likely availability of new ingredients. The decision by the publishers not to make revisions to align the cookbook with modern cooking practices likely indicates a deliberate business plan that found the expense of changing a bestselling cookbook unnecessary. The selection of an American cookbook as the source for *The Home Cook Book* may have been due to the established Canadian practice of pirating American texts and the proximity of Toronto to Chicago, where J. Fred Waggoner published the American version. As we noted, many of the first cookbooks to be published in Canada relied heavily on American sources. It is also possible that after Confederation, Canadians might have turned their attention away from Britain to American models for financial inspiration. In reading the “Housekeeping” chapter of the Chicago edition, Mrs. McMaster and Belford Brothers might have taken to heart the conclusion of this section: “People grow refined first in their eating. How is it that the most brilliant and cleverest nation in the world has also the best cooking?”⁷² This unabashed embrace of American cookery was pirated word for word in the Canadian version. Perhaps the ultimate tribute to the American origin of Canada’s first community cookbook was that in her senior years its patron, Elizabeth McMaster, left Ontario to dwell in the United States and died in Chicago.

The larger significance of *The Home Cook Book* issued in Canada lies in its influence on the development of the community cookbook genre in Canada, providing opportunities for women to become

⁷¹ Book Review: “Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book. Compiled from Recipes Contributed by Ladies of Toronto and Other Cities and Towns. Published for the Benefit of the Hospital for Sick Children. Toronto: Belford Bros, 1877,” *Canadian Monthly and National Review* 11 (April 1877): 452.

⁷² *Tried, Tested, Proved. The Home Cook Book. Compiled from Recipes Contributed by Ladies of Chicago and Other Cities and Towns* (Chicago, 1876), 14.

involved in a variety of social causes, as well as facilitating the influence of American cookery on the development of Canadian cuisine. The first community cookbook to appear in Canada, *The Home Cook Book* was the inspiration for over 500 community cookbooks published in its wake to 1950.⁷³ From their beginnings as a genre to the present day, community cookbooks have been published in great numbers in every Canadian province, benefitting a wide range of recipients, including the poor (*How We Do It*),⁷⁴ war efforts (*War-Time Cook-Book*),⁷⁵ orphanages (*Mrs. Flynn's Cookbook*),⁷⁶ Wolf Cubs (*Cub Camp Cook Book*),⁷⁷ sports teams (*C.L.C. Tombola Cook Book*),⁷⁸ convalescent homes (*Favorite Recipes of Canadian Women*),⁷⁹ church organs (*Fredericton Cathedral Organ Fund Cookery Book*),⁸⁰ Scottish Canadian culture (*The Waverley Cook Book*),⁸¹ and the work of Hadassah in Palestine (*Naomi Cook Book*).⁸²

An interesting final fact to share: community cookbooks offered an opportunity for Canadians to finance humanitarian causes no longer funded by the British government after Confederation in 1867. Canada's new independence resulted in a shift in funding causes such as provisions for the poor from the British government to individuals and the provinces, and new tax laws were created to reward Canadians who either established charities or donated to them.⁸³ In view of this circumstance, it seems likely that social- and civic-minded Canadians

⁷³ Driver, *Culinary Landmarks*, 277.

⁷⁴ *How We Do It* (Montreal: Emergency Unemployment Relief Committee of Montreal, ca. 1932).

⁷⁵ *War-Time Cook-Book Compiled by G.W.V.A.* (Saskatchewan: Great War Veterans Association, ca. 1918).

⁷⁶ *Mrs. Flynn's Cookbook: Selected and Tested Recipes Compiled by Mrs. Katherine C. Lewis Flynn Published by the Ladies of St. Elizabeth's and [sic] Society* (1930; repr., Charlottetown, PEI: Prince Edward Island Heritage Society, 1981).

⁷⁷ *Cub Camp Cook Book* (Vernon, BC: First Pack, Vernon Wolf Cub, 1932).

⁷⁸ *C.L.C. Tombola Cook Book: A Book of Recipes Tried and Tested by the Ladies of Cornwall and the Friends of the Cornwall Lacrosse Team* (Cornwall, ON: 1909).

⁷⁹ *Favorite Recipes of Canadian Women* (Alberta: Favorite Recipes Committee, Bishop Gray Convalescent Home, ca. 1949).

⁸⁰ *Fredericton Cathedral Organ Fund Cookery Book* (Saint John, NB: J. & A. McMillan, 1907).

⁸¹ *The Waverley Cook Book and Housewife's Purchasing Guide Compiled and Arranged by May McMillan* (Winnipeg, MB: Sons of Scotland Benevolent Society, ca. 1934).

⁸² *Naomi Cook Book* (Toronto: 1928).

⁸³ Peter R. Elson, "A Short History of Voluntary Sector–Government Relations in Canada," *The Philanthropist* 1, no. 21 (1 July 2007): <https://thephilanthropist.ca/2007/07/a-short-history-of-voluntary-sector-government-relations-in-canada/>.

might have embraced community cookbooks as a means to support this new philanthropy.

Going forward, the superb bibliographies of Driver and Cook, and the work of research libraries in collecting, cataloguing, and preserving these hidden collections — such as Library and Archives Canada, the Library of Congress, Michigan State University Library, New York Public Library, the University of Alberta Library, and the University of Guelph Library — will provide a much-needed foundation to support scholarly inquiry into the history of cookbook publishing and its impact on foodways.⁸⁴ Digitization projects, such as the Library of Congress's initiative to digitize community cookbooks published between 1872 and 1922,⁸⁵ the University of Iowa Library's online repository of the Szathmari Culinary and Manuscripts Collection,⁸⁶ the University of Alberta's "Culinaria: A Taste of Food History on the Prairies,"⁸⁷ Michigan State University's "What America Ate,"⁸⁸ and the University of Guelph Library's forthcoming site on historic Canadian cookbooks, are a good start to making these materials more visible. If copyright issues can be addressed, the mass digitization of major collections of community cookbooks would be a catalyst in sparking more scholarly interest, and would facilitate research in the comparison of the recipes and ingredients in community cookbooks, an effort necessary to drawing more detailed conclusions on the development of Canadian cuisine.

SUMMARY

This article considers the creation, publication, and reception history of *The Home Cook Book*, Canada's first community and fundraising

⁸⁴ Large community cookbook collections are in the holdings of the following: Culinary Arts Collection, Archival & Special Collections, University of Guelph Library; Cookery and Food Collection, Special Collections, Michigan State University Library; Library of Congress.

⁸⁵ Alison B. Kelly, "Choice Receipts from American Housekeepers: A Collection of Digitized Community Cookbooks from the Library of Congress," *The Public Historian* 34, no. 2 (Spring 2012): 30–52.

⁸⁶ Szathmari Culinary and Manuscripts Collection, University of Iowa, <http://digital.lib.uiowa.edu/cookbooks/>.

⁸⁷ "Culinaria: A Taste of Food History on the Prairies," University of Alberta, <https://omeka.library.ualberta.ca/exhibits/show/culinaria/intro>.

⁸⁸ "What America Ate," Michigan State University, <http://whatamericaate.org/>.

cookbook. Published initially in Toronto in 1877 as a fundraiser for the Hospital for Sick Children, the text of the work was heavily derived from a volume of the same name issued in Chicago several years earlier. Comparison of the text of the 1877 Toronto edition with the earlier Chicago text proves many of its recipes were not Canadian in origin. As a result, the work offers a clear demonstration of how American food preferences and cooking practices came to permeate Canadian cuisine.

Although its affiliation with the hospital quickly faded away, the Canadian version of *The Home Cook Book* remained continuously in print for fifty-two years, its content undergoing only very modest changes across that half century. We locate *The Home Cook Book* as a hybrid of two genres: the commercial domestic manual and the community cookbook. Our analysis combines Lynne Ireland's and Elizabeth Driver's frameworks for interpreting historic cookbooks as a method for understanding the impact of *The Home Cook Book*. With those frameworks in view, our study examines the origins of this cookbook, with particular emphasis on the influences on its content, design and development, and its publication history and reception. In particular, we focus attention on the selection and attribution of the recipes in their geographic and historical contexts, the bibliographical evidence associated with the original source text from which the cookbook derives, and the textual variations that appeared in its later iterations. In addition, the larger impact of *The Home Cook Book* is considered through a review of selected Canadian community cookbooks that appeared in its wake.

RÉSUMÉ

Dans cet article, les auteures examinent le processus de création et de publication ainsi que la réception de *The Home Cook Book*, le premier livre de cuisine canadien qui a été utilisé pour une campagne de financement. Cet ouvrage, d'abord publié à Toronto en 1877, a permis d'amasser des fonds pour l'hôpital des enfants malades. Il s'inspire largement d'un volume du même nom, édité plusieurs années auparavant à Chicago. La comparaison entre les deux livres laisse entrevoir que plusieurs des recettes présentées dans l'édition torontoise n'étaient pas d'origine canadienne. Par conséquent, cette édition montre clairement jusqu'à quel point les préférences alimentaires

ainsi que les pratiques culinaires américaines ont influencé la cuisine du pays.

Même si ses liens avec le milieu hospitalier se sont rapidement étiolés, la version canadienne de *The Home Cook Book* a été continuellement réimprimée pendant cinquante-deux ans, subissant uniquement de très modestes changements. Ce livre est hybride : il relève de deux genres, soit le manuel domestique commercial et le livre de cuisine. Afin de bien comprendre son impact sur la société canadienne, nous combinons les cadres théoriques élaborés par Lynne Ireland et Elizabeth Driver, utiles pour analyser les livres de cuisine anciens. En plus de revenir sur les origines de *The Home Cook Book*, nous insistons sur ses influences, sa présentation matérielle, sa conception ainsi que sur l'histoire de sa publication et de sa réception. Plus spécifiquement, nous portons une attention particulière au choix et à la répartition des recettes selon les contextes géographiques et historiques, aux indices et aux preuves qui montrent que l'édition canadienne de *The Home Cook Book* s'inspire largement de la version américaine ainsi qu'aux variations textuelles qui apparaissent dans les éditions canadiennes ultérieures de l'ouvrage. Enfin, l'analyse de quelques livres de cuisine parus peu de temps après la première édition canadienne du *Home Cook Book* nous permet de mettre en évidence l'importance de cette publication.