took a fair amount of work to sort them out and repair them. One can imagine the possibilities for errors or omissions. Even as he was searching for the Rome Irish punches in the Imprimerie Nationale, McGuinnee himself had difficulty locating them, and although he later tracked down a record of Irish fonts in the Tipografia Poliglotta Vaticana, the successor to Propaganda Fide, he found some characters included that he knew were not Irish.

McGuinnee relates other incidents of history that are tied with the names of other Irish types: most were developed for Bible societies’ publications, catechisms, grammars, and dictionaries. In 1811, John Barlow first used Irish type to indicate places on a map of Ireland. John Henry (later Cardinal) Newman commissioned the Newman Irish type for the Catholic University of Ireland Press in 1857. The late nineteenth and early-twentieth century brought new debates on the merits of using Roman characters for Irish letters to extend circulation of the Irish language with a type that was readily available and less expensive to produce, considerations that are not an issue in the digital age. We can no doubt look forward to a revival of these earlier Irish fonts, so carefully documented here.

An extensive bibliography completes McGuinnee’s worthy study, an essential addition to a history of the book collection.

ELIZABETH MALONEY
Montreal


It was with trepidation that I agreed to review (sight unseen) this bibliography, which covers the first 230 years of printed cookbooks in Europe, in 14 languages. Although I have compiled two cookbook bibliographies, my expertise is in nineteenth- and twentieth-century British and Canadian cookbooks, and language barriers have limited my primary research to culinary texts in English and French. How would I be able to evaluate entries for cookbooks written in other languages, ranging from Catalan, Czech, Danish, and Dutch to German, Hungarian, Italian, Latin, Polish, Portuguese, Spanish and
Swedish? There was no need to worry. Indeed, Henry Notaker has produced a bibliography that is accessible and illuminating for scholars of bibliography and newcomers to food history alike.

In the preface, Notaker expresses the hope that the bibliography “with its overview and commentaries will be a useful help for students of culinary literature as a source for the development of cuisine and food culture,” and that it will also be of interest to “book and literary historians … turning their attention to different forms of non-fiction that have not been properly studied until now,” and to collectors interested in rare items. He has accomplished much more by demonstrating how the practice of bibliography can bring order and understanding to a subject area, as the bibliographer decides what books to include, how to organize the material, the degree of physical description, and the depth and scope of commentary. Notaker’s subject is challenging – early modern culinary literature, comprising over 100 titles in at least 650 editions, in multiple languages, and printed within shifting political boundaries – yet he makes the material approachable, even for non-specialists.

Notaker organizes the entries by language, rather than by place of publication, since national borders changed over time and sometimes also the language of cities (e.g., Strasbourg). Within each language group, the entries are arranged chronologically. A fundamental question of culinary history is the transmission and evolution of recipes. Cookbooks are important vehicles for sharing recipes and culinary practice more generally, and the translation of a text into another language may be a significant point of change in a recipe and signals the dissemination of the recipe collection to a new population. Choosing language as the organizing principle for the entries emphasizes the dynamics of recipe exchange, and Notaker’s comments lead one easily from the original edition to later editions in other languages. In fact, the act of navigating from one language chapter to another reinforces the sense of recipes “travelling” to, or from, another culture. *The Secrets* by Alessio Piemontese (London, 1558; No. 503), for example, is identified as a translation by William Warde from the French edition, *Les secrets* (Antwerp, 1557; No. 609), itself a translation of the original Italian edition, *Secreti* (Venice, 1555; No. 907), from which the reader is directed to editions in all languages, including German, Latin, Dutch, and Spanish. The organization by language also emphasizes the strength of cookbook publishing in English (78 titles) in contrast to German (56), French (36), Italian (20), or Portuguese (1).
Notaker’s entries contain all the information necessary to distinguish editions (and to correct mistakes in previous documents): full title, imprint, colophon, description (format, size, pagination, signatures, number of lines per page, typeface, running-title, illustrations), references, locations, and commentary. In judging the level of detail of the material description, he has kept his focus “on the overview, the long lines, the completeness of titles and editions, and on the literary and culinary background,” and this is the strength of the bibliography for the food historian. He almost always remarks on the culinary content, often giving the number and type of recipes and how they are organized or not (“232 recipes without any organization!”); additions or deletions of recipes from one edition to the next; and instances of plagiarism (especially helpful since large portions of more than one text would often be assembled and printed under a new title, or the original author would not be credited in a translation). His comments are enriched by current food history scholarship, published and unpublished. (The “background literature” listed at the back of the book is itself a useful resource.)

The entries make for lively reading as Notaker tracks innovations: “This [Petit traité, Paris, (c. 1536-8?); No. 603] seems to be a completely new text because none of the 133 recipes are from any other known source. These recipes confirm the break with medieval tradition in the French cuisine of the Renaissance. Fish dominates, but is prepared with butter instead of oil. The first known recipes for dishes like ‘carbonade’ and ‘hachis’ are introduced. The recipes come back in many of the cookbooks in the following decade.”

Of English authors, one learns that John Murrell was the first person to reveal the changes in French cuisine at the beginning of the seventeenth century (No. 520) and to give plans for how to arrange dishes on the table (No. 523); Hannah Woolley was the first woman to appear as an author on the title-page of an English cookbook (No. 545); and Mary Tillinghast was probably the first author represented as an owner and/or teacher of a cookery school (No. 559). Taken together, the first entries of the fourteen chapters represent a series of “first printed cookbook” in each language. The first printed cookbook of them all was Platina’s De honesta voluptate et valetudine (Rome, [c. 1470?]; No. 1001.1), which went through twenty-three subsequent Latin editions, including the first cookbook printed in Switzerland, in Basel, in 1541.

In the historical introduction Notaker discusses, succinctly and perceptively, the issues about which any researcher of this genre
should be aware. Indeed, this introduction is a primer for students of cookbooks of any era, whether the fifteenth century or 1960s gourmet cooking. He begins with the definition of a cookbook; the number of documented cookbooks versus the number actually published, but unknown (still a factor in the twentieth century for community cookbooks); the percentage of cookbooks relative to total book production in the period; the transition from Latin to vernacular languages, and the dominant languages for culinary literature; and production in the centres of publishing versus the periphery. He examines the relationship of culinary manuscripts to printed books; the role of printers and publishers in shaping culinary texts (an issue also relevant today and for Canada in the nineteenth century; see, for example, *The Canadian Housewife’s Manual of Cookery*, Hamilton, Ontario, 1861, compiled by either the printer William Gillespy or his wife, Elizabeth); and women as cookbook authors (recognized and unrecognized). He explores plagiarism and other forms of “borrowing” (still common amongst food writers), and patterns found in the act of translation. He considers the organization of the text and a cookbook’s physical aspects (format, typeface, and illustrations) and how these indicated the intended market. Finally, he asks to what extent the early cookbooks were agents of change or continuity, and assesses cookbooks as sources for the study of food history, remarking that “[i]n the study of development and change it is necessary to begin with solid bibliographical groundwork.”

Notaker has produced a masterwork of bibliography and culinary history. *Printed Cookbooks in Europe, 1470-1700* is a necessary starting-point for anyone studying the cuisine and food culture of this period.

LIZ DRIVER
*Campbell House Museum, Toronto*


Sylvia Brown and John Considine’s *Marginated* is the catalogue accompanying an exhibition of the same name at the Bruce Peel Special Collections Library at the University of Alberta (15 February