Reconstructing the *Palladium of British America*: How the Rebellion of 1837 and Charles Fothergill Helped to Establish Susanna Moodie as a Writer in Canada¹

Michael Peterman²

I. Toward a Literary Connection

The study of authorship, literary culture, and publishing conditions in Upper Canada is illuminated by the brief convergence of two English-born writers, Susanna Moodie (1803-1885) and Charles Fothergill (1782-1840), from late December 1837 until the summer of 1839. The convergence, which is to be found on the pages of Fothergill's newspaper, *The Palladium of British America and Upper Canada Mercantile Advertiser*, tells us several things about the profession of writing, the challenge of finding suitable outlets for one's work, and the kinds of public communication available in that time. In the process we encounter the story of Fothergill's deepening struggles and his final failure in Upper Canada even as we gain a clearer view of John and Susanna Moodie, a displaced British literary couple diligently pursuing whatever opportunities for publication they could find from their home in the remote "bush."

A Suffolk-born woman who had written extensively for London magazines and annuals in her twenties, Susanna Moodie had emigrated to Upper Canada in 1832 with her husband and one-year old daughter. In 1837 she was struggling to raise her family of four children in the backwoods of Douro Township, thirteen miles north of the small village of Peterborough. The outbreak of the Rebellion in Upper Canada in early December set in motion a major change for herself and her family that can be traced in part to her husband's subsequent military movements and in part to her writing of fervently pro-British verse expressly for Charles Fothergill's new and impressive weekly newspaper. The *Palladium's* first issue appeared in Toronto

1 An earlier version of this essay was presented in November 2000 at the History of the Book in Canada Volume I Open Conference in Toronto.

2 Michael Peterman teaches at Trent University and has written extensively on Susanna Moodie and Catharine Parr Traill.

on 20 December 1837, just two weeks after the outbreak, at a time when feelings about the Rebellion were running very high. Anxieties about the whereabouts of the perpetrators, uncertainties about continuing local threats, and the renewed fear of American invasion abounded. When Moodie's "An Address to the Freemen of Canada" appeared in that first *Palladium* issue, it found a ready audience in Toronto and Upper Canada, especially among those who were proud of their British birth.

The story of Susanna Moodie's emergence as a prominent writer in Canada is told in her autobiographical recollection, *Roughing It in the Bush* (1852).³ The general accuracy of her account can be verified and has seldom been questioned. However, a close examination of available documents reveals a more complex set of circumstances and actions than she describes there. Most notably, she neglected to include the crucial initiatory role played by the *Palladium* and, in particular, its owner and "co-editor." The elderly Fothergill, a man of middle-class Yorkshire and Quaker roots, had been in Canada since 1816 and had made a considerable reputation for himself as a naturalist, writer, editor, politician, public figure, and community builder.⁴ The enthusiastic and empathetic interest he took in Moodie's poetry, especially her patriotic verse, paved the way for her profitable and extended connection with John Lovell and his Montreal-based magazine, *The Literary Garland*.⁵ It is likely that Fothergill, who was struggling with very serious financial difficulties during the year and a half of his editorship, did not pay her for her contributions. For that reason, or perhaps simply because of lapse of memory, she neglected to mention the part he played in her literary emergence.⁶

These two personal narratives converge in the pages of the *Palladium* and together provide valuable clues to the operations of

3 See the chapter entitled "The Outbreak" in *Roughing It in the Bush*, ed. Carl Ballstadt (Ottawa: Carleton UP, 1988), 430-52.

4 Paul Romney describes Fothergill in the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* (DCB) VII: 317, as follows: "naturalist, artist, writer, businessman, office holder, JP, newspaperman, publisher, and politician." Fothergill was a man of many parts who was much involved in political, scientific, and literary affairs in Upper Canada for over two decades.

5 Susanna Moodie was one of the major contributors to *The Literary Garland*. The monthly magazine was in steady production from December 1838 until December 1851.

6 In writing of her connection to *The Literary Garland*, Moodie put her emphasis on the much-needed remuneration that John Lovell offered her for her writing.

print and literary culture in Upper Canada in this time. It goes without saying that self-interest played an important part in the motivations of both writers. Each sought a fresh medium for expression – Fothergill for his cultural projects, literary-scientific interests, and political views, all of which vied for his attention, and Moodie for her poetry. As self-interest is a given, so too are matters of class, social status, and national identity. There are notable similarities between the outlooks of these two middle-class English writers, though they were born a generation apart. They shared an air of superiority, even a snobbishness, that was born of their education and their previous literary experience in England; they wrapped that cultural cloak all the more tightly around themselves in the midst of a society that they often found threateningly vulgar and dangerous at its worst, and in need of refined guidance and educational leadership at its best. Bearing such factors in mind, it is possible to detect a kind of laying on of hands in this convergence, the gesture of a well-positioned member of the old English guard who wished to provide a literary opportunity for a young woman and her congenial husband, both of whom he saw as like-minded heirs to his vision for colonial Upper Canada.

The first of these narratives might be called Fothergill's last hurrah. A long-standing Anglo-Canadian advocate of British cultural development and English rule in the colony, Charles Fothergill was a tired and broken man of 55 when, straining his already precarious finances, summoning up his characteristic gumption, and enlisting his son Charles Forbes Fothergill as his managing partner, he set out to launch a new forum to promote his personal views and to provide a medium for enriched scientific and literary expression in Toronto. There was evident need for such a medium. Heather Murray has observed that, while there were eight newspapers in Toronto prior to the appearance of Fothergill's *Palladium*, they "did not publish verse, despite announcements of their intent to do so"; indeed, little other than political reports, current agricultural information, and belated European news found space in these weekly papers.⁷

The second narrative is the aforementioned breakthrough of Susanna Moodie as a writer of consequence in Canada's incipient literary marketplace. It is also the story of her husband, John

7 Heather Murray, "Frozen Pen, Fiery Print, and Fothergill's Folly: Cultural Organization in Toronto, Winter 1836-37," *Essays on Canadian Writing* 61 (Spring 1997): 63.

Wedderburn Dunbar Moodie who, it would appear, befriended Fothergill and placed himself in a position in which he could promote his wife's and his own literary interests. An accomplished writer himself, the affable and impressive Captain Moodie readily found favour with the elderly editor in December 1837.⁸ Indeed, his part in the convergence is a significant one, for men dominated cultural activities in 1830s Toronto. Though he was in the city for only a few weeks, John Moodie moved at ease amongst those of literary and musical interests. For her part, his aspiring wife was simply continuing to do what she had done with determination since they arrived in Cobourg in 1832 – she was seeking to avail herself of any new-world publishing opportunity she could access, whether it paid or not. In 1837 lack of payment was the only condition she knew.

Not surprisingly, given the fact that she had engaged in patriotic writings while still in London, Moodie responded to the violence of the Rebellion and its continuing threats to British rule with outrage and anger. Her poems were a passionate, public rallying cry. She praised British roots and demeaned the rebel leaders who dared to challenge English leadership and tradition. Nor did she hesitate to advocate violent retribution in her verbal assaults upon the perpetrators. The need to voice British support as strongly as possible in time of need and uncertainty was far stronger in her than any fond hope of payment for her writing.

In unearthing the Fothergill-Moodie connection I need to emphasize several basic factors germane to the study of print culture in early Canada. First among them is the centrality of newspapers in communications before 1840. Newspapers at that time were, as Allan R. Pred has observed, “the only regular pretelegraphic communications medium through which news of distant origin could be made locally available in the form of public information.”⁹ Attempts to initiate literary magazines were short-lived and book

8 John Moodie was in contact with Fothergill during his military training in Toronto from December 1837 until early March 1838, but they may have crossed paths at an earlier point between autumn 1832 and the period in question (see *Letters of Love and Duty: The Correspondence of Susanna and John Moodie*, ed. Carl Ballstadt, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael Peterman (Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1993), 72.

9 Allan R. Pred, *Urban Growth and the Circulation of Information: The United States System of Cities, 1790-1840* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard UP, 1973), 20.

publishing was a rarity.¹⁰ What few printing presses there were in Upper Canada were used mostly for the production of weekly newspapers and for local job printing. These papers reflected the political views and economic interests of their owners. They offered few opportunities for literary expression; if a paper included a "Poet's Corner" on occasion, the poems were mostly reprints by British or American writers.

Weekly newspapers across the Canadas constituted an informal though prickly system of communication divided along party lines. Tory publisher-editors dedicated themselves to the support of the government and Family Compact interests, while others like William Lyon Mackenzie took up the mantle of "Reform," arguing as emphatically as possible for self-government in Canada. Though the colony lacked structured political parties, most local papers fell readily in line with one view or the other. Editors of like-minded politics closely watched each others' editorials, reprinting polemical pieces which served their cause, and aggressively attacking the commentaries of those they opposed. Hostility was rampant. A man of refined and quiet sensibility, Charles Fothergill was comfortable with neither side; he loathed the kind of vulgar, obsessive, name-calling journalism that the influence of "Party" necessitated. In a typical *Palladium* editorial (25 April 1838), he urged "the destruction of Party" asserting, rather naively, that once it was done away with, "all would soon be well" in the Canadas. Seeking to articulate what he defined as moderate reform and to speak from an "independent" position that was squarely British in its commitment, he set about in the autumn of 1837 to create a new newspaper for Toronto that would follow neither party line even as it sought to offer better informed and more intellectually stimulating matter for its readers. Such was his intention in the planning stages for the *Palladium*. The Rebellion, however, altered his plan.

A second matter of consequence for the study of pre-1850 Canadian newspapers is the ephemerality of much early newsprint. Several papers have not survived their historical moment. Printing-office fires, unpaid subscriptions, mismanagement, or simple neglect could lead to heavy losses, if not bankruptcy, for publishers. Archivists have wrestled with the challenge of trying to locate and preserve as many as possible of these early, often short-lived, journalistic ventures.

¹⁰ In 1837 there was no literary magazine in Toronto (Murray, 63). What books there were typically reflected the publisher's interests or a (vanity) project paid for by the author.

So broken are the runs of some of the surviving newspapers that, as historians like Paul Rutherford have observed, scholars have often shied away from the pre-1850 field.¹¹

The *Palladium of British America* (1837-1839) provides a dramatic case in point. Only about one-quarter of its approximately 70-90 published issues have survived. No bound copy of the first year's 55 issues is known to be extant.¹² To make matters more difficult still, the surviving issues, some of which are in very poor condition, are located in several different Ontario repositories.¹³ To date only one issue has been preserved on microfiche.¹⁴ Moreover, a look at a few issues seems to have satisfied many of those who have alluded to the *Palladium* in articles and research papers. However, an examination of all the extant issues tells us much about the importance of Fothergill's newspaper as a publishing outlet for a few writers of original material in the 1830s.¹⁵

- 11 Paul Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority: The Daily Press in Late Nineteenth-Century Canada* (Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1982), 36-42. He notes "the chaos of organs" in the period, usually of small circulation and governed largely by "the rituals of party warfare" (37). Other sources including W.H. Kesterton's *A History of Journalism in Canada* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1967), the Canadian Press volume, *A History of Canadian Journalism* (Toronto: Murray, 1908), and Doug Fetherling's *The Rise of the Canadian Newspaper* (Toronto: Oxford UP, 1990) provide little detail or commentary on pre-1840 journalistic history. George Parker's *The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada* (Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1985) and Chris Raible's *Muddy York Mud: Scandal & Scurrility in Upper Canada* (Creemore, Ont.: Curiosity House, 1992) are more helpful in their copious detail; Charles Fothergill's journalism during the 1820s and his long-standing relation with and opposition to William Lyon Mackenzie are discussed in the latter.
- 12 Vol. 2, No. 1 (Whole Number 56) of the *Palladium* (2 January 1839) is held by the Archives of Ontario. Only three issues from the second year of publication seem to have survived; the latest in time is the issue for 17 May 1839, Vol. 2, No. 15 (Whole Number 70), also at the Archives of Ontario.
- 13 Extant copies of *The Palladium* are found in the Baldwin Room of the Metropolitan Toronto Library, the Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library at the University of Toronto, the National Archives of Canada in Ottawa, and the Archives of Ontario in Toronto. The latter has the largest holding of issues.
- 14 See the Canadian Institute for Historical Microfiche (CIHM #45875). This copy is a special edition published on Thursday evening, 8 March 1838.
- 15 Another original contributor featured in the *Palladium* was Dr. Robert Douglas Hamilton (1873-1857) of Scarborough Township. A Scot by birth, Hamilton published political essays under the pseudonym of Guy Pollock, a name borrowed from a Scarborough blacksmith. Hamilton also wrote on medicine and was a contributor, along with Susanna Moodie, to George Gurnett's short-lived *Canadian Literary Magazine* (Toronto, 1833).

While surviving issues articulate the *Palladium's* editorial purposes and general outlook, they also reveal the importance that Fothergill placed upon literary and scientific expression in his newspaper. His model was a highly successful weekly paper of the period, the *The Albion or British, Colonial and Foreign Weekly Gazette* (the New York *Albion*); edited by another expatriate Englishman, John Sherran Bartlett (1790–1863). It was a paper read by many recent British emigrants to Canada. Long a writer himself, Fothergill, like Bartlett, sought an elevated level of discourse, cultural sophistication, and talent among his contributors and letter writers; literary ability, scientific knowledge, British birth or allegiance, genteel social status, and patriotic spirit were qualities he wished to recognize in the *Palladium*. He aimed for the dissemination of “superior” literary expression “untainted by scurrility and personal abuse.” He argued for Canada’s “promising destiny” as “the most important appendage of the British crown” and he counseled unyielding loyalty to England and its political institutions as well as “free[dom] from party politics” (*Palladium* 27 December 1837). When the *Albion* criticized the *Palladium* for lacking originality and being “made up of scraps from English papers” (17 February 1838), Fothergill was astonished and indignant. Such “a wanton and malicious attack,” he responded, was far from valid and entirely unexpected of its gentleman editor. Though he had by then published only nine issues of the *Palladium*, he defended himself by citing positive reviews of his newspaper in Ogle Gowan’s the *Statesman* (Brockville) and in the *Western Herald* (Sandwich); the *Palladium* provides “more reading matter than any other publication in the Province,” wrote the editor of the latter paper. In his own defense Fothergill argued that, contrary to the *Albion's* assertion, his paper offered much original writing (*Palladium* 28 February 1838). Poems by Susanna and John Moodie were no doubt implicit in this assertion, as were a series of papers on geology that may have been by his own hand.

In piecing together the contributions of Susanna and John Moodie to the *Palladium*, I have had the use of Mary Lu Macdonald’s working list of literary publications by writers in Canadian newspapers before 1850. This list, which is not included in her monograph, *Literature and Society in the Canadas 1817–1850* (Mellon, 1992), is particularly helpful in that several poems listed under Susanna Moodie’s name are described as being “From the *Palladium*,” though they appeared in another newspaper. Using that information and the precise evidence available in extant issues of the *Palladium* itself,

I have compiled a list of Moodie's identifiable contributions to the paper. It includes ten poems and one two-part book review. Moreover, her contributions span the year and a half of the paper's existence, suggesting that, even though her writing began to appear in John Lovell's *The Literary Garland* in May, 1839, she remained in some contact with Fothergill even when his newspaper was losing its popularity and editorial steam. It must also be added that there is every likelihood that more than ten of her poems appeared in the *Palladium's* pages. What can be traced, however, is ample available evidence that she was one of Fothergill's primary and favoured contributors. Moreover, as several of her poems were reprinted widely in both Upper and Lower Canada, it is clear that her appearances in the *Palladium* helped to provide her with a wide colonial exposure well before she became a prominent contributor to *The Literary Garland*.

II. Charles Fothergill: Nature Study, Politics, and Newspapers

It is difficult to be succinct about "the quixotic writer, naturalist, and publisher Charles Fothergill."¹⁶ He was amongst the busiest and most talented men in Upper Canada during his 23 years in the province, but he was also one of the least successful in terms of enduring results. The reasons for such failure and disappointment were at once personal, political, and accidental. He was a man of many parts, a kind of renaissance man. His ambitions were capacious, his visions often grand, his energy level high. Yet, for all his efforts and projects, he was seldom able to complete even those undertakings to which he devoted so much time and commitment. At times he was the victim of his own aspirations, spreading himself too thin and trying to accomplish too much. At other times he was simply unlucky. In most instances he showed bad, if not perverse, judgement in attacking the political forces to which he had to appeal for monetary and social support.¹⁷ Still, it is important to observe that, despite his many emotional and economic setbacks, he remained remarkably consistent in his ambitions and values. In many ways he seems a man ahead of his time;¹⁸ certainly he was a man oddly out of

¹⁶ Murray, 44.

¹⁷ Paul Romney describes Fothergill's career as "an unbroken sequence of failures that were largely of his own making" (*DCB*, VII: 320).

¹⁸ This was the view of Henry Scadding. See *Toronto of Old*, ed. Frederick H. Armstrong (Toronto: Dundurn Press, 1987), 148.

tune, a proud and individualistic Englishman who was never willing to play the political game laid out before him in Upper Canada.

Before Fothergill came to Canada, he had committed a great deal of his time to nature study and literary writing, encouraged by scientists within his own family and the model of Gilbert White of Selborne. When only 17 he published *Ornithologia Britannica*, an 11-page folio classifying 301 species of British birds. A precocious, two-volume collection of stories, essays, and verse entitled *The Wanderer* appeared four years later (1803) and "An essay on the Philosophy, Study, and Use of Natural History" in 1813. For him, the acquisition of scientific knowledge was the "truly great and virtuous" way of living.¹⁹ Setting the study of birds and animals as his highest priority, he devoted enormous amounts of time to the preparation of two major manuscripts he hoped to publish – their working titles were the "Natural and Civil History of Yorkshire" and "The Northern Isles of Britain." Despite having commissioned several plates for these two projects (some by the noted engraver Thomas Bewick), Fothergill was frustrated in his plan to publish the manuscripts in England. Never one to linger long in disappointment, however, he revised his plans and brought both manuscripts with him to Canada in 1816, heartened by the idea that he might now expand the projects to include the natural history of British America. Yet, it was more than a new plan and passionate scientific ambition that led him to emigrate with his wife and two young sons. He had failed in several business and educational ventures while in England and was faced with debts that made his remaining problematical. In leaving Yorkshire as he did, he set a pattern of aspiration, struggle, defeat, and indebtedness that would characterize his later activities in Upper Canada.

In several articles and in the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, Paul Romney has traced Charles Fothergill's checkered political and journalistic career in York (Toronto) and other parts of Upper Canada.²⁰ James L. Baillie, Jr., and others have sought to describe

19 See the Preface to Fothergill's *The Wanderer: A Collection of Original Tales and Essays, Founded on Facts*, Vol. 1 (London: Wynne and Scholey, 1803).

20 Paul Romney, "Charles Fothergill," *DCB*, VII: 317-321. See also "A Conservative Reformer in Upper Canada: Charles Fothergill, Responsible Government and the 'British Party,' 1824-1840," *Historical Papers* 1984: 42-62, and "From the Types Riot to the Rebellion: Elite Ideology, Anti-legal Sentiment, Political Violence, and the Rule of Law in Upper Canada," *Ontario History* 76, no. 2 (June 1987): 113-44.

Figure 1. Charles Fothergill's water-colour of a "Young Bunting."
Reproduced from the original painting held in the Charles Fothergill Papers,
Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library, University of Toronto.

and itemize his pioneering achievements in zoology, ornithology, geology, and other scientific fields.²¹ More recently Heather Murray has studied his visionary attempt to develop for Toronto in the 1830s not only a literary society but also a Lyceum of Natural History and the Fine Arts, which was to include a museum, a gallery of the fine arts, a botanical garden, and a zoo.²² Fothergill was, in Paul Romney's useful phrase, a "savant with a sense of public duty."²³ He was an intellectual and amateur scientist of Quaker leanings, a journalist of conservative political views, and a man who spoke out publicly and fearlessly for his beliefs.²⁴ A self-styled independent in Party-ridden Upper Canada, he was confident that he could rise above the fray and speak for the best of British social values and the English constitutional tradition. In doing so, he showed a persistent tendency "to cross ... powerful figure[s]" in the Upper Canadian political arena.²⁵

When Fothergill emigrated to Upper Canada in February 1816, Susanna Strickland was a fifteen-year-old girl living at Reydon Hall in Suffolk. He left behind a record of failed ventures in farming, horse breeding, acting, writing, and the study of medicine. After settling his business affairs in Quebec and making his family comfortable, he set out alone on an adventurous trip by sleigh from that city to York (Toronto), duly recording his travels in a notebook. Stopping at Port Hope (Smith's Creek) and visiting the virtually unsettled lands near Rice Lake, he was attracted to that landscape

21 James L. Baillie, Jr., "Charles Fothergill, 1872-1840," *Canadian Historical Review* 25 (December 1945): 376-396. See also Elaine Theberge, "Fothergill: Canada's Pioneer Naturalist Emerges from Oblivion," *The Beaver* 68, no.1 (Feb./Mar. 1988): 12-18.

22 Fothergill was, with Dr. William Rees and and William "Tiger" Dunlop, a co-founder of the Literary and Philosophical Society of Upper Canada at York. He exhibited ten watercolours at the 1834 show put on in York by the Society of Artists and Amateurs (the show included a portrait of him by another artist), and he earned attention for essays on Canadian quadrupeds and the need to preserve the salmon stock in Lake Ontario.

23 Romney, *DCB*, VII: 319.

24 In his introduction to *The Wanderer*, Fothergill wrote of "the importance of cultivating the mind, the finer feelings of the heart, and of learning to restrain passions." Though his many activities, including a brief fling in acting and a devotion to horse breeding, suggest a secularity well beyond his Quaker commitments, Fothergill always maintained a strong set of Quaker values. Both of his wives, Charlotte Nevins of York, England, and Eliza Richardson of Port Hope, Upper Canada, were from Quaker families.

25 Murray, 61.

and its possibilities. He petitioned the Lieutenant Governor Francis Gore to allow him to develop what he called a "colony of gentlemen" at Rice Lake. To his delight, he was granted 1200 acres in southern Monaghan Township near the mouth of the Otonabee River.

Over the next fifteen years Fothergill maintained close connections to the Rice Lake area. He built a hunting lodge which he named Castle Fothergill, hunted and gathered natural specimen, practised taxidermy, and developed friendly relations with the local Mississauga tribe and their chief "Captain Mohawk."²⁶ His home base was "Ontario Cottage," a comfortable villa within walking distance of the village of Port Hope. Here he was much in the public eye as postmaster, magistrate, local political figure, businessman, and member of the district land board. Though he often worried about his finances, he insisted that his family live in style. In writing home to Yorkshire after his wife's painful death from tuberculosis in 1822, he assured her family that Charlotte had "never wanted for comfort and luxury." In fact, he complained that they had employed too many rather than too few servants at Ontario Cottage and that his property had been injured as a result.²⁷

His appointment as King's Printer in York (January 1822-26) and his subsequent election to the Legislative Assembly in 1824 took him away from Port Hope but brought him an income, a printing press, and a new level of public prominence. His successes, however, angered some of the powerful political leaders of York who resented the favoured newcomer with his English superiority and lofty schemes,²⁸ and were disturbed that a prominent government employee dared to be critical of government operations in the Legislative Assembly. Undeterred by growing signs of opposition, he went quickly to work, enlarging the paper (it was called the *Weekly Register* after April 1824) and expanding its yearly almanac, both of which served as platforms for his literary energies. But when he emerged as "a

26 Though many of Fothergill's manuscripts have been recovered, the one describing his experiences with the Mississauga remains missing.

27 A copy of a letter from Fothergill to his wife's sister dated 17 October 1822, Charles Fothergill Papers, vol. 23, Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library, University of Toronto.

28 In the election of 1824 he stood against George Strange Boulton, the brother of Solicitor General Henry John Boulton and a prominent member of the Family Compact. That election seemed to mark a turning point in Fothergill's political outlook as he soon set himself in opposition to both Mackenzie's reforms and the machinations of the Family Compact.

leading spokesman of the parliamentary opposition” in the Legislative Assembly session of 1825-26, his political enemies sought ways to silence, or at least diminish, his voice.²⁹ Members of the Family Compact, as both William Lyon Mackenzie and Fothergill were wont to label them, objected not only to various of Fothergill’s political criticisms but also to the unprecedentedly large expenses he undertook at the press (costs that Fothergill expected the government to absorb). Early in 1826 he was removed from the editorship “for political reasons” and, worse still, given his limited capital, he was saddled with a new debt in the form of a government-imposed bond.³⁰ Despite a public outcry and a subscription taken up to help him in his injured state, Fothergill was enraged. He would never forgive his persecutors and he would renew his attacks upon the Family Compact during his editorship of the *Palladium*. In the mid-1830s some of those same Family Compact leaders, among them John Strachan and Chief Justice John Beverley Robinson, would do what was necessary to impede and effectively to scuttle his eager plans to establish major cultural institutions in Toronto.

By the late summer of 1832, when the Moodies arrived in Cobourg, Charles Fothergill had left Port Hope and moved to present-day Pickering where, near the family of his second wife, he developed plans to establish a new community and model town he named Monadelphia. Like so many of his visionary schemes including the “colony of gentlemen” at Rice Lake, this project faltered, in large part because a fire destroyed the mills in which he had heavily invested. Again his finances were badly over-extended.

Whether he knew of the Moodies in 1832 is not clear. Having sold Ontario Cottage, he may have continued to subscribe to the Cobourg *Star*, the leading newspaper between York and Kingston. The *Star* was a weekly paper in its second year of operation under the editorship of R.D. Chatterton. Fothergill, who had in 1829 petitioned Sir John Colborne to begin a Port Hope newspaper as a government voice for Eastern Upper Canada, knew Chatterton well. In fact, he contributed several essays to the paper in 1831 and early 1832 under the pen name “Atticus.” Titles such as “Land Tortoises and Mud Turtles” (29 March 1831), “Natural Frostwork” (15 April 1831), “Old Thunder – An Indian Tradition” (5 July 1831), “The First Fall of Snow” (6 December 1831), and “Duty of Parish and

29 Romney, *DCB*, VII: 319.

30 Romney, *DCB*, VII: 318. The bond was for 367 pounds.

Town Officers" (25 January 1832) provide evidence of his range of interests and his role as local authority. In particular, they show his passion for naturalistic observation and his familiarity with the Mississauga people of Rice Lake. It is a mere coincidence that one of his Atticus essays, "A Short History on the Art of Writing," appeared in the 20 September 1831 issue of the Cobourg *Star* alongside a poem taken "From a collection of Unpublished Poems, written by a young English Lady." That poem, "The Vision of Dry Bones," was the work of Susanna (Strickland) Moodie who had yet to emigrate.³¹ Her unpublished collection, *Enthusiasm, and Other Poems*, had by then been published in London.

Genteel English emigrants with a passion for literary expression and an interest in natural history were likely to become known to each other, if only by name and reputation. Living in eastern Upper Canada, Fothergill and the Moodies brought with them from the homeland a shared belief in the importance of manners and the development of one's mind and sensibility. They valued proper speech, genteel behaviour, and evidence of personal cultivation and achievement. They may not have had much formal education themselves but that little mattered. What counted was their serious commitment to education and self-cultivation, and their confident belief that intellectual, social, and spiritual benefits followed naturally from such conscious endeavour.

III. The Moodies in and out of "The Bush"

Both Susanna and John Moodie came to Canada as displaced writers, literary aspirants who by their choice of emigration found themselves at a great remove from the English cultural arena in which they had separately sought recognition. With *Enthusiasm, and Other Poems* recently published by subscription in London, and a significant number of appearances in London magazines and annuals behind her, Susanna was a 29-year-old poet torn between her increasing commitments as a wife and mother and her powerful desire to practise her skills as a writer. In both enterprises she had the firm support of her husband, an adventure-loving, gregarious Orcadian who had already published a well-received memoir of his experiences

³¹ It is likely that Robert Reid of Douro Township near Peterborough brought the poems back with him after a trip to Ireland and England where he visited the Moodies and assisted them in their plan to emigrate. Chatterton published three of them in the Cobourg *Star* before the Moodies had arrived in Canada.

as a soldier in the Napoleonic wars and who, prior to emigrating to Canada, had left in London (with the publisher Richard Bentley) a two-volume account of his ten years as a settler in South Africa.³² The problem facing the pair was how to make a sustainable family life for themselves as settlers in Canada while finding ways to tap into available Canadian and American markets for literary expression. They had to live, they had to find socially acceptable ways to support themselves, but they also had to write. As writers, they had to be noticed and they had to be read. To be published was in their blood, and it is likely that, of the two, Susanna was the more driven to make her mark as a practising professional writer. Nevertheless, she often had to rely on her husband to make the necessary connections with publishers.

Not surprisingly, then, the Moodies sought out available publishing opportunities soon after arriving. Almost immediately, John arranged to place one of Susann's poems in the Cobourg *Star*. "Lines written amidst the ruins of a church on the coast of Suffolk" appeared there on Wednesday 19 September 1832, two weeks after their arrival in town. The author was identified as "Susanna Strickland (now Mrs. Moodie)." This important dual identification was one which Susanna carefully applied during the early years of her marriage in order to keep her Strickland identity before both editors and readers. In the same issue John also managed to have Chatterton include a poem written to their daughter on the occasion of their debarkation from Southwold, Suffolk. "To Catherine Mary Moodie, An Infant" was the work of James Bird (1788-1839), a well-known Suffolk poet and close friend of several of the Strickland daughters of Reydon Hall. Such an inclusion implied a message, even if its significance eluded many readers of the Cobourg *Star*. A literary couple of some note, a couple with impressive literary connections, had arrived in Cobourg. Attention ought to be paid.

Other Susanna Moodie poems from *Enthusiasm, and Other Poems* appeared in the Cobourg *Star* that same year – "Autumn" (17 October), "Uncertainty" (31 October), "O Come to the Meadows" (23 November), and "Youth and Age" (19 December). Thus, even as

32 John Moodie's monograph "Narratives of the Campaign in Holland in 1814" appeared in *Memoirs of the Late War*, ed. John Henry Cooke (London, 1831). He received some good reviews and considerable recognition for his two-volume account of his South African experiences in the 1820s, *Ten Years in South Africa, with a Particular Description of the Wild Sports* (London: Bentley, 1835). An excerpt from this book was reprinted by Chatterton in the Cobourg *Star*.

the Moodies were settling uncomfortably into their infamously sty-like shanty at Gage's Creek, they were doing their best to have samples of their work included in the local newspaper, no doubt hoping that such recognition might lead to further connections. For his part, John Moodie arranged to place his dramatic sketch, "The Elephant Hunt," which had recently appeared in book form in Charles Knight's *Menageries* in London and which was a part of his still unpublished South African narrative, in the *Star* in the same 17 October issue that included Susanna's "Autumn."

In *Roughing It in the Bush*, Susanna lamented the difficulty, if not the near impossibility, of writing for publication while living in the depths of the Upper Canadian backwoods. However, their time in the bush, which became for them an experience of near-isolation and increasing poverty, did not begin until later in the decade. While living close to Port Hope and Cobourg (from September 1832 until February 1834), and while still excited by her English literary successes, Susanna aggressively sought out other opportunities for publication. Fortunately, her eldest sister Elizabeth had by then earned an influential editorial position with *The Lady's Magazine* in London. Several of Susanna's poems and stories appeared in those pages from 1832 through 1837. But in Upper Canada she was on her own, though she was abetted by her husband who, when possible, functioned as her agent, genially badgering the editor of the Cobourg *Star*, among others, to include her poems when space or occasion allowed.

It was typical of the ambitious and persistent Susanna Moodie that she should also curry literary favour on her own whenever she could. Her letter of 14 February 1833 to John Sherran Bartlett, owner and editor of the New York *Albion*, demonstrates her eager yet genteel approach. The chance to peruse your "clever and interesting paper," she began, "has made me ambitious of the honour of contributing to its pages; and if the assistance of a pen, deemed not unworthy of public notice in my native land, when held by Susanna Strickland, can in any way be acceptable to you, and your readers, it will afford me much pleasure to transmit to you, from time to time, a few small original poems." Anticipating a 'yes' from Dr. Bartlett, whom she knew to be an Englishman, she appended two poems which she proudly described as "the first flight of my muse on Canadian shores."³³ Bartlett immediately published them along with

33 Susanna Moodie to the editor of the *Albion*, 14 February 1833 (see *Susanna Moodie: Letters of a Lifetime*, ed Carl Ballstadt, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael Peterman, [Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1985], 90).

her letter, though, in his editorial commentary, he inadvertently confused Susanna with her older sister, the better-known and more widely published poet, Agnes.

It is not recorded whether Bartlett's conspicuous error unsettled the sensitive Susanna. Likely it did. She was certainly used to playing second fiddle to Agnes in England and there is some evidence that she had been occasionally at odds with her sister prior to her own emigration. But, with a new audience before her, her response was cheerful and gracious. Using Bartlett's error as an excuse to set the record straight about her identity, she included another of her "original poems," which he promptly published in his issue of 25 May 1832. Bartlett would also publish several of John Moodie's poems along with others by Susanna in his other newspaper, aptly entitled *The Emigrant. A Journal of the Domestic News of England, Ireland, Scotland and Wales*. Appearing in the 25 June 1834 issue of *The Emigrant*, for instance, were Susanna's poems, "The Canadian Woodsman" and "The Canadian Woods."

Moodie's pursuit of public recognition is evident both in her approach to editors and in the way she presented her material. The first two poems in the *Albion*, "The Sleigh Bells. A Canadian Song" and "Song: The Strains We Hear in Foreign Lands," earned her wide exposure and immediate attention. With a sound instinct for marking the emotional polarities of emigrant experience, she typically sent Bartlett a pair of contrasting poems, one singing the praises of Canadian experience and the other expressing the deep sense of displacement and loss felt by British emigrants in the new world. Shrewdly, she balanced the charm of the new against the weight of deracination and homesickness; such, it seems, was her strategy from the outset. It is a measure of her success in this first contact with Bartlett that "The Sleigh Bells" was reprinted in at least nine Canadian newspapers and its companion poem, "The Strains We Hear in Foreign Lands," appeared in seven.

Moodie tested other opportunities as well. She sent material to two promising but short-lived magazines in Toronto (George Gurnett's *Canadian Literary Magazine*, edited by John Kent, and Robert Stanton's *The Canadian Magazine*, edited by W. Sibbald) and to Sumner Lincoln Fairfield, an Anglophilic poet living in Philadelphia. Fairfield had sought out her poetry and prose for his *North American (Quarterly) Magazine*, but he regretted that he could not pay for contributions. By then, living deep in the backwoods and being far more financially constrained than in her early days

near Port Hope, Susanna was unable to afford the postage required to mail her submissions south of the border.³⁴ Still, eleven of her pieces (and one by her husband) appeared in Fairfield's magazine from December 1834 through 1836.

By the time of the Rebellion, Susanna Moodie had tried out most of the publishing outlets she could identify. In fact, she was more or less stymied. Editors paid only in platitudes and the business of making oneself attractive to such men at a distance was expensive and frustrating. Her work continued to appear occasionally in magazines and newspapers, but the unyielding demands of the bush farm and the energies involved in bearing and rearing her children left her drained. The constraints that came with lack of money for paper, ink, and candles further limited her enterprise.

IV. The Rebellion and "The Palladium"

Recalling her surprise upon hearing of "the outbreak," Susanna Moodie wrote in *Roughing It in the Bush* that "Buried in the obscurity of the woods, we knew nothing, heard nothing of the political state of the country, and were little aware of the revolution which was about to work a great change for us and for Canada."³⁵ While the latter half of the statement is accurate, the pages of the *Palladium* reveal that Moodie's claim of total ignorance is a misrepresentation. Because 'Mackenzie Meetings' were being held in various locales across the province and arousing much concern, it is likely that the Moodies would have had some knowledge of, and concern about, grievances and unrest in the Peterborough area. It was, rather, the sudden outbreak of violence that took her by surprise. Still, the fact of the Rebellion's occurrence quickly made a major difference in their lives, at first because of John Moodie's military experience and his hasty trip to Toronto upon hearing of Sir Francis Bond Head's Proclamation.

Informed of the outbreak after his brothers-in-law, Sam Strickland and Thomas Traill, had already left for Peterborough to answer Head's call for help, John Moodie hurriedly set off on his own, despite a leg injury from which he was still recovering. Traveling directly to Toronto, he managed to gain a Captain's position in a

34 *Roughing It in the Bush*, 440. Moodie sent a copy of *Enthusiasm, and Other Poems* to Fairfield; he used it as a source of poems to publish. See her two letters to Fairfield in *Susanna Moodie: Letters of a Lifetime*, 92-95.

35 *Roughing It in the Bush*, 432.

newly formed regiment, the Queen's Own, which was to begin training there in mid-January. With him he carried a copy of his wife's poem, "Canadians, Will You Join the Band. A Loyal Song." He was able to place it with Charles Fothergill, whose newspaper, he learned, was about to produce its first issue. The poem appeared on page 4 of that initial issue of the *Palladium* on 20 December 1837. It was dated "Douro, November 20, 1837" – that is, a good two weeks in advance of the actual outbreak. Included (without its date) in *Roughing It in the Bush* as "An Address to the Freemen of Canada," the poem challenged all loyal British descendants to "spurn the base wretch who dare defy / In arms, his country and his God!" It proclaimed that it was the duty and privilege of all who recognize "The regal power of that bless'd land / From whence your boasted freedom flows" to confront "the rash, misguided band" and to "crush the traitors to the dust." The poem would be picked up by at least eight Canadian newspapers over the following three weeks, five in Upper Canada and three in Lower Canada.³⁶ One of these was John Lovell's Montreal *Transcript* where the poem appeared eight days later (28 December 1837). Lovell, who may then have begun making plans to publish *The Literary Garland*, would readily remember Susanna Moodie when it came time to recruit able and interesting contributors.

Charles Fothergill was clearly pleased by John Moodie. He was a literary man, an adventurer with South African experience, a loyal soldier, and an Orcadian. Fothergill had visited the Orkneys in researching his manuscript of natural observations of Britain's northern islands and had a great admiration for those hardy islanders. As an officer boarding at the New British Coffee House on King Street, John Moodie was not long in making, or renewing, several literary, musical, and social connections in Toronto. In a letter to his wife dated 7 February 1838 he commented on several friends – the George Maynards, "our good little friend [John] Kent," Walter Crofton, and Fothergill, adding that "Every body here is delighted

36 The dates of publication in the five Upper Canadian papers were – the *Western Herald* (Sandwich) 3 January 1838; the *St. Catharines Journal* 11 January 1838; the *Upper Canada Herald* (Kingston) 9 January 1838; the *Kingston Chronicle* 3 January 1838; and the *Statesman* (Brockville) 30 December 1837; and in three Lower Canada papers – the *Gazette* (Montreal) 30 December 1837; the *Transcript* (Montreal); and the *Missiskoui Standard* (Frelighsburg, Que.) 9 January 1838.

with your poetry. Fothergill seems most grateful for your assistance.”³⁷ As importantly, Susanna’s fiery patriotism accorded with his own; so did her faith in the British constitution and her confidence in English freedom. His fondness for the Moodies and his personal awareness of her poetry are evident in his editorial remarks on “Canadians, Will You Join the Band”:

Thanks to the sweet poetess who has so often delighted us from her nesting place in the dark-brown woods of the Newcastle District on subjects of softer interest: and who now shews with what skill she can strike a bolder strain – Yes; all who see it, must thank thee, sweet Poetess – Daughter of Genius – and, Wife of the Brave.

Given such effusion, it is not surprising that more of her poems celebrating British patriotism and interpreting signal events of the Rebellion would soon follow.

Susanna’s second “Rebellion” poem appeared in the fifth issue of the *Palladium* (17 January 1838) and hit a note of rabid patriotism she would never again equal. “On Reading the Proclamation Delivered by William Lyon Mackenzie, on Navy Island” is 80 lines in length and was written “For the Palladium.”³⁸ It was not picked up by other newspapers, likely because of its length. Moodie may have sent it down to Toronto with her husband when, after a brief visit home to bid farewell to his family and gather his equipment, John returned to the city to report to the Queen’s Own. With him

37 *Letters of Love and Duty*, 72. Both the Rev. George Maynard (from Cambridge) and John Kent taught at Upper Canada College. Moodie’s phrase “our good little friend” implies, if not actual friendship between Susanna and Kent, then a good working relationship of a literary kind. As editor of *The Canadian Literary Magazine*, Kent had included three poems and two stories by Susanna along with a flattering review of *Enthusiasm, and Other Poems*. Only three issues of the magazine appeared in 1833. W.G. Crofton, another Englishman with literary aspirations, later wrote under the pseudonym “Uncle Ben” and would edit the *Cobourg Star* for a time in the 1840s.

38 The only known copy of this poem (in the *Palladium* issue) is held by the Archives of Ontario. The full text is included in Carl Ballstadt, “Secure in Conscious Worth: Susanna Moodie and the Rebellion of 1837,” *Canadian Poetry* 18 (Spring/Summer 1986): 96-98. In his essay Ballstadt covers some of the same ground as I do here, though without the emphasis on print culture and the examination of the connection between Charles Fothergill and the Moodies. He also provides an analysis of “the inconsistency of Moodie’s treatment of the rebellion” in the poem (94).

he also brought several of his own poems, four of which Fothergill included in the *Palladium* issues of February 7th and 14th.³⁹

Fothergill was almost as effusive about “the gallant husband of Mrs. Moodie” as he was about Susanna. She already held a “distinguished rank” among poets “throughout Great Britain and upon this Continent.” But he found in John Moodie another poet “possessed of talents of a superior character” and was grateful to have received “permission to publish” several poems that reflected the “versatility” of the “author of that delightful work, a “Ten Year Residence in South Africa” [sic]. With *Ten Years in South Africa* published to good reviews in London, John Moodie was both a literary figure to be reckoned with and a welcome contributor.

In his visits with Fothergill while he was training in Toronto with the Queen’s Own Regiment,⁴⁰ John Moodie passed on at least one more patriotic poem by his wife, “The Banner of England,” which appeared in the *Palladium* 24 January 1838.⁴¹ He also left a copy of *Enthusiasm, and Other Poems* for Fothergill to use as he saw fit. The editor did, in fact, take poems from the book for at least two subsequent issues of the *Palladium*.

Here follows a list of the seven other poems by Susanna Moodie that can be identified as having made their first Canadian appearances in the *Palladium*. The date and issue number follow the title:

4. “War” (from *Enthusiasm, and Other Poems*). 11 February 1838 (Vol. 1, No. 11).
5. “The Avenger of Blood” (from *Enthusiasm*). 11 April 1838 (Vol. 1, No. 18).

39 John Moodie’s poems in the issue of 7 February 1838 were the pun-ridden “The Bears of Canada” and “Dream of Happiness,” along with an epigram. “Song” (first line: “To the woods—to the woods—the sun shines bright”) and “Och! Now I’m intirely continted” appeared in the next issue – 14 February 1838; again a four-line epigram was included with the two poems. In his letter to Susanna of 7 February 1838 (see footnote 31) he reported, “In this days paper [Fothergill] inserts some of my verses ... with a flaming introduction. Far too complimentary for my tastes, but he means it kindly.”

40 John Moodie trained with the Queen’s Own through February and was assigned to the Niagara frontier in early March (see *Letters of Love and Duty*, 72-75).

41 “The Banner of England” is dated 2 January 1838, the same day as her “On Reading William Lyon Mackenzie’s Proclamation, on Navy Island.” Though it carried the inscription “For the Palladium,” the poem was actually a slightly revised version of one she had included in *Patriotic Songs* (1831), a collection of seven songs with music that she co-wrote with her sister Agnes for J. Green of Soho, London, England. Three of the songs were by Susanna.

Figure 2. The masthead of the *Palladium of British America* for 25 April 1838. In the upper lefthand corner under the heading "Original Poetry" appeared Mrs. Moodie's "The Wind That Sweeps Our Native Sea." Reproduced from a copy held in the Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library, University of Toronto.

6. "The Wind That Sweeps Our Native Sea. A National Song" ("Written Expressly for the *Palladium*"). 25 April 1838 (Vol. 1, No. 20).⁴²
7. "The Burning of the *Caroline*." The poem appeared in the *Palladium* sometime in early October. It was reprinted in Lovell's *Montreal Transcript* 11 October 1838; the *Montreal Gazette* 13 October 1838; and the *Western Herald* (Sandwich) 6 November 1838.
8. "There's Not a Spot (in this wide peopled earth)." The poem also appeared in the *Palladium* some time in October 1838. It was reprinted in the *Montreal Herald* 24 October 1838; the *Western Herald* (Sandwich) 20 November 1838; the *St. Catharines Journal* 13 December 1838; and the *Montreal Gazette* 28 February 1839.

42 It is not clear how this poem came into Fothergill's hands, for John Moodie was on military duty at this time in the Niagara area. Likely it was brought to Toronto by a friend or sent by mail.

9. "To Mrs. Pringle" (first line: "Widow, indeed! 'Tis thine to weep"): a poem included as the conclusion to the second part of a two-part review of *The Poetical Works of Thomas Pringle*, 2 January 1839 (Vol. 2, No. 1). The first part appeared in a missing issue (Vol. 1, No. 52). In the issue of 2 January 1839, Fothergill elegantly apologized for the delay between the two parts of the review. He also praised the charitable object of "this deeply interesting communication" and suggested that readers pay special attention to the poem to Pringle's widow. "It is touchingly beautiful," he wrote, "and worthy of the excellent moral feeling and superior genius from where it emanates." The Pringles had been close friends and almost surrogate parents to Susanna Strickland in London. Pringle, who gave Susanna away in marriage to John on 4 April 1831, had died suddenly in 1834.

10. "The Waters. A Song" (first line: "Let the lover laud earth's daughters") appeared in the *Palladium* some time in August 1839, in what was likely one of the final issues of the paper. It was reprinted "From the Palladium" in the *Montreal Morning Courier* on 19 August 1839 and in the *Bytown Gazette, and Ottawa and Rideau Advertiser* on 11 September 1839. The *Bytown Gazette* describes the poem as written "Expressly for the Palladium of British America" and provides the date and place of composition as "Douro, May 12, 1836." The poem was comprised of four stanzas of eight lines in length. While it is not clear how Fothergill received this poem (it is not in *Enthusiasm, and Other Poems*), its date suggests that John Moodie could have left it with him at any time after December 1837. It is important to note that "The Waters: A Canadian Song" (first line: "Come launch the light canoe"), which appeared in *The Literary Garland* 2, no. 8 (July 1840): 360, is the same poem, minus its first eight-line verse. See also "A Canadian Song" in *Roughing It in the Bush*, 362. There are several variant wordings from the lines in the *Bytown Gazette* reprinting to the later three-verse versions that appeared in *The Literary Garland* and *Roughing It in the Bush*, but the poems are essentially the same.

Of these poems, the most consequential in terms of the Rebellion is "The Burning of the Caroline." Lovell's *Montreal Transcript* of 11 October 1838 corroborates the poem's *Palladium* appearance, for in republishing it, the editor included Moodie's letter to Fothergill. Surprisingly, it was written from Douro on the very same date as its appearance on the pages of the *Transcript*. While such a coincidence seems impossible (it was likely a typographical error), the letter and poem would most likely have been carried to Toronto by her husband

who was at the time between military postings and seeking a further commission. While her letter precisely accounts for her delay in commemorating the Caroline's burning, it also implies that she did not know Fothergill personally, having relied on her husband to place her poems in his hands:

The enclosed poem was partly written at the period when the important event it celebrates occurred. The absence of my dear husband on the frontier, sickness, the management of our bush farm, and many domestic cares, hindered me from preparing it for publication at the time. Without wishing to keep alive the public excitement, so widely displayed on the perpetration of that gallant action, by Captain Drew, and his brave and loyal band, – [but] with the vanity natural to my sex and profession, I should like to see my honest feelings on the subject transferred to the pages of your valuable paper, and I remain, Sir,

Yours with respect,
Susanna Moodie.

By the time that John Lovell enlisted Susanna Moodie as a paid contributor to *The Literary Garland*, the *Palladium* was faltering badly. Her first poems appeared in the sixth number of the magazine's first volume – May 1939. They were "The Oath of the Canadian Volunteers: A Loyal Song for Canada" and "The Otonabee." By then Fothergill's finances were at a critical stage; his health was failing, his interest was flagging, and the newspaper's ability to hold subscriptions and advertising was on the wane. In the issue of 28 February 1838, Fothergill had confidently bragged that the paper had not only the largest circulation in the province but also the largest and most attractive format, having expanded from four to eight pages on high-quality paper stock. A year later he knew this was no longer the case.

With the *Palladium*, as in many of his earlier ventures, Fothergill overshot the limits of his resources and the cogency of his personal views. Advocating a conservative reform position for the colony, he had continued his verbal assaults upon the Family Compact and the administration of Sir Francis Bond Head while attacking the traitorous violence of Mackenzie and his reform-minded cohorts. His pursuit of a high middle ground, appropriate to his conservative values and his sense of himself as a superior kind of Englishman in a British colony, was tenuous at best because it was without a sustaining political anchor. Idealistically, he placed his hope first in the arrival

of Sir George Arthur as Lieutenant Governor of Upper Canada, and then in the recommendations of Lord Durham, but insisting on the independence of his own outlook and finding few political allies, he remained without a significant base of support.

One of his major journalistic projects early in 1838 was to prepare a book detailing the folly and destructiveness of Mackenzie's radical actions. It appeared early that summer under the title *Mackenzie's Own Narrative of the Late Rebellion, with Illustrations and Notes, Critical and Explanatory: Exhibiting the only true account of what took place at the Memorable Siege of Toronto, in the Month of December, 1837*. A much lesser document than Fothergill had originally intended, the 24-page pamphlet reprinted Mackenzie's personal account of the Rebellion along with Fothergill's Introduction and his 50 footnotes. Drawn from his own experiences and the records of a few other prominent individuals, these footnotes and related appendix material make clear Fothergill's disdain for "the Arch-Traitor MACKENZIE." The real problem, however, lay deeper. "[T]he Chief, most deeply rooted, and incessantly active, cause of all the principal mischief"—[was] the "OLIGARCHY" or "FAMILY COMPACT." Fothergill had a certain sympathy for Mackenzie whom he knew well and with whom, in Toronto from the early 1820s, he had shared the experience of verbal abuse and other sorts of mistreatment at the hands of Family Compact sympathizers. Hence, his "Introduction" to the pamphlet was more concerned with the seed of the "mischief" in Upper Canada and Toronto — those "few upstart families, unfortunately entrusted with power at an early period in the Government of the Colony" — than with Mackenzie himself. The Scot was a villain for taking up arms, but he was a more understandable phenomenon given the political circumstances. The Family Compact people were an ongoing evil upon whom not enough condemnation could be piled.⁴³ In a 7 February 1838

43 Fothergill's great plan of a Lyceum for Toronto had been effectively defeated early in 1837 by, as he saw it, unsympathetic Family Compact members in places of power. This scheme, which as Heather Murray notes "came strikingly close to realization" (60), must have frustrated Fothergill tremendously, because he had so much of his life's work in scientific research and collecting tied up in its establishment. So had he been frustrated in his attempt, with Dr. William Rees and William "Tiger" Dunlop, to initiate the Literary and Historical Society of Upper Canada at York (1831). In his letter book he names Chief Justice John Beverly Robinson and archdeacon John Strachan for their disdainful refusal to support the society, quoting Robinson's letter in full (Fothergill Papers, vol. 24). As Paul Romney notes, Strachan and Robinson later took over the idea as their own (*DCB*, VII: 319).

Palladium editorial, for instance, Fothergill condemned the Compact as “the *Augean Stable* of the most baleful, and corrupt, and most calamitous FAMILY INFLUENCE, that was ever suffered to paralyze an entire and magnificent Province.” A second and related project from the *Palladium* press, an elaborate map exposing the families of the Family Compact and their connections, apparently did not reach publication, though Fothergill advertised a prospectus in preparation.

The precipitous final stages of Fothergill’s failure can be traced to financial woes, a disturbing level of personal distraction, and his failing health. He used the *Palladium* to print a desperate petition to the government requesting payment for copies of *Mackenzie’s Own Narrative* that had been distributed to members of the Legislative Assembly. No help came from that quarter. Fothergill, who had been bedridden with rheumatic gout for seven months in 1837, was no longer physically strong, his health no doubt worsened by increasing financial worries. Under such duress, and with intimations of his own mortality increasingly before him, he drew back into his enduring passion, the study and recording of bird and animal life. At home in Pickering Mills, he continued to record in his journal the hunting, observing, and documenting of various species in the weeks leading up to his death.

Samuel Thompson has left a vivid record of the *Palladium* office in its final months, one that also provides a glimpse of Fothergill in his last year or two:

Early in the year 1838, I obtained an engagement as manager of the *Palladium*, a newspaper issued by Charles Fothergill, on the plan of the New York *Albion*. The printing office, situated on the corner of York and Boulton Streets, was very small, ... with an old hand-press of the Columbian pattern. To bring this office into something like presentable order, to train a rough lot of lads to their business, and to supply an occasional original article, occupied me a great part of that year. Mr. Fothergill was a man of talent, a scholar and a gentleman; but so entirely given up to the study of natural history and the practice of taxidermy, that his newspaper received but scant attention, and his personal appearance and the cleanliness of his surroundings still less. He had been King’s Printer under the family compact regime, and was dismissed for some imprudent criticism upon the policy of the Government. His family sometimes suffered from the want of common necessities, while the money which should have fed them went to

pay for some rare bird or strange fish. This could not last long. The *Palladium* died a natural death, and I had to seek elsewhere for employment.⁴⁴

Despite Thompson's efforts, nothing could save the newspaper from its "natural death." Its heart was elsewhere, its purpose lost in the midst of a changing political climate to which Charles Fothergill was ill-attuned.

For their part, Susanna and John Moodie had lost touch with Fothergill and his newspaper. While the *Palladium* was foundering, John Moodie found a second military appointment as Paymaster for the militia of the Victoria District. He was stationed in Belleville but busily seeing to the many military units along the Lake Ontario front. On the bush farm in Douro Susanna was struggling through the worst winter and spring she had endured since coming to Canada, alone with her children and one servant.⁴⁵ Despite sufferings and illnesses that nearly broke her spirit, she remained in her own mind a loyal Englishwoman and a "profession[al]" writer of wide cosmopolitan vision, eager to lend her pen to causes dear to her. The most heartening development to her – "like a gleam of light springing up in the darkness" – was that John Lovell in Montreal was by May 1839 paying her for her literary contributions.⁴⁶

The Moodies shared a deep affinity with Fothergill, a man whose values, interests, independence of spirit, and intense love of Britain seemed so in accordance with their own. But by the late summer of 1839 they were moving beyond the limits of his fixed sense of political independence, quietly beginning to align themselves with Robert Baldwin and the direction of conservative reform that was gaining fresh momentum because of the publication of Lord Durham's *Report*.⁴⁷ Fothergill had little empathy for the Baldwins. Still, they would carry with them the stamp of what Fothergill had stood for and fiercely articulated – the importance of the educated and conservative British middle-class in British North America. Like

44 Samuel Thompson, *Reminiscences of a Canadian Pioneer for the Last 50 Years (1833-1883)* (Toronto: Hunter, Rose, 1884; rpt: Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1968), 103-04. Thompson's account suggests that he worked for the paper until its demise, which occurred about August 1839.

45 See *Letters of Love and Duty*, 114-159.

46 *Roughing It in the Bush*, 440.

47 Writing from Belleville on 24 May 1839, John Moodie described his positive reactions to reading Lord Durham's *Report* (*Letters of Love and Duty*, 150-51).

Fothergill, Susanna Moodie would continue to insist on the reliability of her genteel social and cultural vision, and she would suffer from the ways in which that outlook was criticized once *Roughing It in the Bush* reached Canadian readers and reviewers. Though she wrote a more positive sequel entitled *Life in the Clearings* (1853), she was soon to find the role of cultural commentator and interpreter a very uncomfortable and disagreeable position. John Moodie's turbulent career as the Sheriff of Hastings County was but another chapter in the problem of seeking to maintain an independence from party politics, even when, as in Moodie's case, he but thinly veiled his reformist sympathies in the face of his Tory critics and persecutors in Belleville.⁴⁸ He shared with Fothergill a certain naivete about political realities and a confidence in his ability as a gentleman and a thinker to ride above the turbulence and vulgarity of the daily political fray. His wife shared that naivete with him.

The *Palladium* likely died sometime in August 1839, having, as a signal of its frailty, already shrunk back to its original four-page format. Operating in opposition to both Reform and Family Compact interests, Fothergill received little by way of government or advertising support, and material he sent to government members, like the Mackenzie pamphlet, was not paid for.⁴⁹ Many *Palladium* subscribers lost interest in the paper or, as was usual for the time, did not pay their bills. Thus, Charles Fothergill's ambition to provide Toronto with a strong, independent, and well-informed cultural voice withered as he himself weakened and the immediacy of the Rebellion faded.

The newspaper, however, did wonders for Susanna Moodie. She was already taking new life and fresh hope from her engagement with *The Literary Garland*, a connection that followed directly from John Lovell's newspaper, the Montreal *Transcript*, which had been so quick to reprint many of her Rebellion poems from the *Palladium* and to promote her poetical skills and patriotism. She was not yet out of the prison of the bush, but she was, as she had not been since she left England seven years earlier, a professional writer with a

48 John Moodie's troubles with the Belleville Tories and certain lawyers began soon after his arrival in the town and persisted until, through a final lawsuit against him, he was formally removed from office in 1863.

49 Fothergill provided direct reports on the Legislative Assembly at his own expense, no doubt hoping that government support for such record keeping would eventually be forthcoming. That support never came.

publisher who was willing to pay her.⁵⁰ As well, by means of her poetry, she had caught the attention of the new Lieutenant Governor, Sir George Arthur. When some months later in Belleville her husband found an influential and supportive friend in his commanding officer, the Baron George de Rottenburg, Sir George Arthur's former secretary, the possibility of a better future for the Moodie family began to take shape.

At last, and largely through the agency of Fothergill's *Palladium of British America*, Susanna Moodie's future as a professional writer in Canada looked promising. When in May 1840 Charles Fothergill died in a "penniless" and pathetic state,⁵¹ the Moodies were again able to be together, living much more comfortably in Belleville and beginning to enjoy the range of advantages and opportunities now available to them. It would likely never have occurred to them to look back and heed the lessons of Fothergill's life and career in Upper Canada. Had they done so, his struggles to contribute to and to raise public interest in cultural, scientific, and literary matters in Canada might have served as a warning of the financial, personal, and political dangers lying in wait for those who resolved to follow in his footsteps. Even as he led the way forward by means of certain of his cultural visions and schemes, Charles Fothergill's example made clear the kinds of resistance to cultural development and literary expression that would persist in the decades ahead.

RÉSUMÉ

Susanna Moodie acquit une renommée littéraire au Canada du fait qu'elle écrivit de la poésie patriotique à la veille de la Rébellion de 1837. Ce n'était pas, par contre, le *Literary Garland* de John Lovell,

50 Susanna Moodie and her children finally left the bush in late December 1839. They moved to Belleville where John Moodie had already begun his new duties as the Sheriff of Hastings County. He owed his new and prestigious position both to his own military connections and to his wife's letters to Sir George Arthur. Arthur, who likely read some of her patriotic poems in Fothergill's *Palladium*, was very well disposed to the loyal and eloquent Mrs. Moodie, even before she wrote to him. See "Susanna Moodie and Sir George Arthur," *Canadian Poetry* 38 (Spring/Summer 1996): 130-38.

51 A month after Fothergill's death some of his papers and most of his museum artefacts (perhaps also many of his paintings of birds) were destroyed in a fire. The work of a lifetime, which he had hoped to house in his planned Lyceum, was thus lost.

mais le *Palladium of British America* (de décembre 1837 à l'été 1839), le journal de Toronto de Charles Fothergill, qui en premier lui donna une large couverture tant dans le Haut que dans le Bas-Canada. Au moins dix poèmes de S. Moodie parurent dans le *Palladium* durant les dix-huit mois d'existence du journal; plusieurs furent réimprimés dans les deux Canada, et c'est via cette couverture que son œuvre fut remarquée par Lovell. Après avoir considéré l'état de la culture de l'imprimé et de l'édition dans le Haut-Canada colonial, cet article explore la convergence de ces deux vies littéraires dans le Haut-Canada colonial. C. Fothergill, assez âgé et défaillant, séparé d'elle d'une génération en termes d'âge et d'expérience au Canada, trouva en l'ambitieuse S. Moodie une contributrice originale et de bonne volonté à son journal. De même, Fothergill se lia avec enthousiasme avec John Moodie, le mari de Susanna, qui était lui-même un écrivain de grande renommée. Celui-ci donna son amitié à Fothergill et servit d'agent à son épouse pour la promotion et la livraison de ses poèmes. L'article explore aussi les valeurs et les idées d'inspiration anglaise concernant la culture que Fothergill partageait avec les Moodie.