Coverage of Canadian Imprints in *ESTC ON CD-ROM* (1992)

Stephen Francom[†]

Since its inception in 1976 the Eighteenth Century Short Title Catalogue (ESTC) has been steadily expanding our knowledge of British and English-language printing history during the eighteenth century. Its revolutionary emphasis on the use of MARC records and its exhaustive union catalogue scope, whereby not only all works, but all extant copies of all relevant works are cited, have made it a model for international retrospective bibliography. The purpose of this report is to assess the value of the ESTC database in its most widely accessible form — the *ESTC ON CD-ROM* (1992) — as a resource for the historical and bibliographical study of Canadian imprints and the printing trade for the eighteenth century. The following criticisms refer exclusively to the CD-ROM edition. No attempt has been made to assess either the microfiche or on-line versions of *ESTC ON RLIN*.¹ Also, since ESTC is an on-going project, we can be reasonably confident that some of the problems associated with Canadian imprints described here will be corrected eventually.

Of course, ESTC's major limitation with respect to Canadian imprints is its exclusion of all periodicals published more frequently than annually, including newspapers, the principal mode of publishing for all eighteenth-century Canadian printers (with the single exception of the partners, Roger Lelièvre and Pierre-Edouard Désbarats). It is expected that this problem will be addressed during the next phase of the ESTC project, which will be devoted to the bibliographical description of serials. With respect to monographic publications we can define three essential measures of ESTC's value as a resource for the study of eighteenth-century Canadian printing history and bibliography: (1) the extent of its coverage of the universe of eighteenth-century Canadian imprints defined by Marie

[†] Stephen Francom is a Master of Library Science student at the University of Toronto. He has recently completed a four-month internship at the Archives of Ontario.

Tremaine in *A Bibliography of Canadian Imprints 1751-1800* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1952); (2) its effectiveness in locating extant copies of works which Tremaine identified but for which she found no copies; and (3) its effectiveness in identifying and locating extant copies of works not identified by Tremaine.

In total, Tremaine identified 1,210 items which were either printed or proposed to be printed in Canada prior to 1801.² A search of the ESTC database defined by the codes 'cy=cn and nr=Tremaine' identifies 211 ESTC records for works both printed in Canada and cited in Tremaine.³ Table 1 analyses ESTC coverage of Canadian imprints in terms of a percentage of the total number of imprints recorded by Tremaine, divided chronologically in five-year sections:

Table 1

KEY:

A = Number of items identified by Tremaine

B = Number of ESTC-Tremaine records

C = ESTC-Tremaine records as a percentage of A

PERIOD	A	B	C
1751-1755	9	0	0
1756-1760	17	1	5.9
1761-1765	48	3	6.25
1766-1770	83	9	10.8
1771-1775	68	9	13.25
1776-1780	123	23	18.7
1781-1785	126	18	14.3
1786-1790	210	41	19.5
1791-1795	293	50	17
1796-1800	233	57	24.5
TOTAL	1,210	211	17.5

This analysis demonstrates that ESTC's coverage of the universe of eighteenth-century Canadian imprints defined by Tremaine is

generally sparse, averaging 17.5% of the total and never in any five-year period reaching 25% of the total. Coverage is especially meagre prior to 1776 and minuscule for the period 1751–1765. It is encouraging, however, that *ESTC* coverage does at least reflect the dynamic pattern of the development of eighteenth-century Canadian printing revealed by Tremaine's research, characterized by steady growth between 1751 and 1775 followed by dramatic, 100% increases in press output beginning in 1776 and 1786.

Of the 1,210 total items identified by Tremaine, 397 were works for which Tremaine was unable to locate an extant copy — Tremaine ncl (no copy located) items — or works which were in some way advertised or proposed to be printed but for which Tremaine concludes that no evidence is available to demonstrate that the work was ever printed.⁴ *ESTC* has been largely unsuccessful in illuminating this grey area of eighteenth-century Canadian historical bibliography; it supplies descriptions, and provides locations of a single extant copy in each case, for a mere fifteen of 397 Tremaine ncl items, or just under 4% of the total.⁵ In contrast, the Tremaine supplement project (undertaken by Patricia Fleming and Sandra Alston) has to date located extant copies of approximately 120 Tremaine ncl items, or just over 30% of the total. At least three of these fifteen times had been located in extant copies prior to their citation in *ESTC*, further limiting *ESTC*'s contribution to the broadening of knowledge in this area.⁶

Several classes of material are prominent among the nearly 400 Tremaine ncl items, and it is instructive to analyze the extent to which *ESTC* has, by locating extant copies, contributed to a broadening of knowledge of these classes. The most numerous class of Tremaine ncl items is almanacs (eighty-five items), particularly those for Quebec (fifty-four), Lower Canada (twelve) and Nova Scotia (fifteen). Six of the fifteen Tremaine ncl items located in *ESTC* are almanacs: one for Lower Canada (Tremaine 921) and five for Nova Scotia (Tremaine 330, 350, 870, 923, and 978). It is, however, a measure of the inconsistency and incompleteness of its coverage of Canadian imprints generally that *ESTC* has not located *all* of the extant copies of Tremaine ncl almanacs nor even all of the Tremaine ncl almanacs held in collections which have reported *some* Tremaine ncl almanacs to *ESTC*.⁷

Other populous classes of materials among Tremaine ncl items include Laws & Statutes (fifty-seven items, none located in *ESTC*), particularly for the jurisdictions of Quebec and Lower Canada (forty-four): proclamations of Provincial Governors and Lt.-Governors

(fifty items, one located in ESTC — Tremaine 404), particularly those for Quebec and Lower Canada (twenty-five) and Nova Scotia (seventeen), and especially those issued under the authority of Governor James Murray (1764–1768) in Quebec and Lt.-Governor Wentworth (1792–1808) in Nova Scotia — nine items each; school books or primers printed in Quebec (sixteen items, none located in ESTC; none located by the Tremaine supplement project); and book catalogues — for auction sales and libraries (sixteen items, one located in ESTC — Tremaine 1188; no others located by the Tremaine supplement project).

A complete list of Tremaine ncl items located in ESTC along with a summary of new information provided by ESTC relative to Tremaine's description of the item is found in Table 2:

Table 2

TREMAINE ITEM	NEW INFORMATION SUPPLIED IN ESTC DESCRIPTION
36	adjusts title; supplies pagination, format
37	as above
330	adjusts title; confirms printer attribution; supplies pagination
350	confirms printer attribution; supplies pagination
410	confirms tentative printer attribution
513	confirms tentative printer attribution; supplies pagination and format
737	Tremaine located photostatic copy only
768	supplies title; confirms printer attribution
870	confirms title and printer attribution; supplies pagination and format
872	supplies title; confirms printer attribution
921	adjusts title; confirms printer attribution; supplies sheet and printed area dimensions
923	confirms title and printer attribution; supplies pagination

978	adjusts title; supplies pseudonymous author attribution and pagination; confirms printer attribution
1188	adjusts title, pagination and format

All fifteen Tremaine ncl items recorded in ESTC cite a single-copy location, six in American institutions (the American Antiquarian Society, four; the New York Public Library, one; and the Houghton Library at Harvard University, one) and nine in Canadian repositories (McGill University, four; Dalhousie University, three; the National Library of Canada, one; and the Public Archives of Nova Scotia, one).

The third essential measure of ESTC's value as a resource for the study of Canadian printing history and bibliography is the extent to which it has identified legitimate eighteenth-century Canadian imprints not previously identified by Tremaine or any other bibliographical source. A search of the ESTC database using the terms 'cy=cn andnot nr=Tremaine' and 'cy=cn and nr=not in Tremaine' identifies twenty-seven items which ESTC cataloguers are satisfied are eighteenth-century Canadian imprints not cited by Tremaine. It is highly probable that not all of these items are eighteenth-century imprints; it is likely that at least two of these items are, in fact, cited by Tremaine; and it is certain that at least two of these items were identified in other non-Tremaine sources prior to their citation in ESTC.

ESTC t142223 is probably an 1806 reprint of Tremaine 1184, as described in Tremaine's note to that item: see item 0159 in Milada Vlach and Yolande Buono, *Catalogue collectif des impressions québécoises, 1764-1820* (Montreal: Bibliothèque nationale du Québec, 1984). ESTC records w016703 and w016704 are identified as items 21 and 24 respectively in Patricia Fleming, *Upper Canadian Imprints, 1801-1841: A Bibliography* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press in co-operation with the National Library of Canada and the Canadian Government Centre, Supply and Services Canada, 1988), where they were dated as having been printed in 1803.

ESTC w010177 is probably Tremaine 1047 (see *Catalogue collectif* 0069). Tremaine thinks it 'was printed at Quebec possibly by P.-E. Désbarats about 1800.' ESTC dates this item 1797 and attributes it to the Quebec printer William Vondenvelden. ESTC w016581, the 'Nova Scotia Calender . . . for . . . 1776' printed by Anthony Henry

at Halifax, located by ESTC at Dalhousie, may well be Tremaine 195. The only copy seen by Tremaine (also at Dalhousie) was lacking the title page and was incomplete ('[16+?] p.'). Dalhousie must have acquired a complete copy of this work as the ESTC entry describes a work of '[40] p.'

ESTC records w016696 and w016660 were both identified and located at McGill in *Catalogue collectif* 0924 and 0443 respectively prior to their identification by ESTC. This leaves some twenty-three eighteenth-century Canadian imprints not identified by Tremaine but now recorded in ESTC for analysis by date of publication and subject content, as well as place of publication, printer, extent/format, language, and repository.⁸

Only three of these items were printed prior to 1780 and none prior to 1770, a fact which reflects the dramatic rise in Canadian printing beginning in the late 1770s.

These items are highly miscellaneous in subject content and authorship. As was the case with Tremaine ncl items, almanacs (four items, three for Nova Scotia) are the class of material best served by ESTC in its coverage of not-in-Tremaine Canadian imprints. Sermons (three items) and official publications of various agencies of the Quebec provincial administration (four items, including two ordinances issued by the Court of General Quarter Sessions of the Peace — Quebec District, and proclamations issued under the authority of Governors Dorchester and Haldimand) are also well represented. Predictably, given that the press in eighteenth-century Canada was largely subsidized as an organ for the dissemination of official or institutional information and opinion, only eight of these twenty-three not-in-Tremaine imprints are works of personal authorship; the rest were issued anonymously or under the auspices of various corporate bodies.⁹

To date, the compilers of the Tremaine supplement project have identified approximately 150 eighteenth-century Canadian imprints not recorded by Tremaine. ESTC's identification of twenty-three such items (or 15.3% of the known total) is comparable but slightly inferior in extent to its coverage of in-Tremaine imprints (211 of 1,204, or 17.5% of the total). It is, nevertheless, a great improvement on its coverage of Tremaine ncl items (a mere fifteen of 397 items, or 4% of the total).

In theory, one of the great advantages of ESTC from the perspective of the student of Canadian imprints is its access to the resources of hundreds of repositories and collections not available to Tremaine. Indeed, ESTC's list of contributing Canadian libraries includes

thirty-six repositories not known to or not consulted by Tremaine, largely because, like the National Library of Canada, the institution did not then exist.

But this ostensible advantage is largely negated by the fact that so few of these repositories have contributed records of their eighteenth-century Canadian imprints to ESTC; or perhaps, having been reported, their records have not yet been processed by ESTC and added to its current file.¹⁰ Whatever the reason, only seven of these thirty-six repositories have records of holdings of Canadian imprints in ESTC, and of these seven, only two — the National Library of Canada, with seventy-one items, and the University of British Columbia, with twenty items — are represented in significant numbers. Moreover, of the ESTC holdings reported by Canadian repositories not known to Tremaine, only one record (Tremaine 737, for which Tremaine found only a photostatic copy, located by ESTC at the National Library of Canada) corresponds to an item for which Tremaine could locate no copies, and none are for items not identified at all by Tremaine.

It is particularly disappointing that many Canadian institutions have reported voluminous ESTC holdings of non-Canadian imprints while at the same time they are represented in ESTC by few or no Canadian imprints. The University of Alberta has contributed at least 2,189 records to ESTC, while McMaster University is represented by an astounding 13,936: none of these records is of Canadian imprints. The University of Toronto's Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library has contributed at least 9,572 ESTC records, a mere nine of which are of Canadian imprints. The Bibliothèque nationale du Québec has reported holdings of 756 total ESTC items, only one of which is a Canadian imprint, despite the fact that this institution is known to possess several hundred early Canadian imprints (see *Catalogue collectif*). Certainly, one must conclude from this evidence that ESTC's access to repositories and collections not known to Tremaine has not yet led to any significant broadening of knowledge about or access to surviving copies of early printed Canadiana.

The inadequacy of ESTC's coverage of repositories holding significant collections of early Canadian imprints is even more acute and more apparent when one examines the number of records of Canadian imprints listed in ESTC with holdings in Canadian repositories known to and examined by Tremaine. With only two exceptions — McGill University and Dalhousie University — the vast majority of Canadian repositories is represented in ESTC by far fewer records

of Canadian imprints than the number of items noted in their collections by Tremaine.

In the Maritime provinces there are five repositories with major collections of eighteenth-century Canadian imprints: Dalhousie University, the Public Archives of Nova Scotia, the Nova Scotia Legislative Library, Acadia University, and Mount Allison University. Of these, only Dalhousie's collection is adequately represented in ESTC. Tremaine located thirty items, thirteen of which were identified as unique, at Dalhousie. To date, Dalhousie is represented in ESTC by forty Canadian imprints, including nine of the thirteen unique items identified by Tremaine and three items (all Nova Scotia almanacs) not identified by Tremaine.

At the Public Archives of Nova Scotia Tremaine found seventy-seven items, ten of which she identified as unique: the Archives is thus far represented by only twenty-seven ESTC records of Canadian imprints (but eight of the ten unique items), only one of which identifies an item not in Tremaine. The Nova Scotia Legislative Library is listed by Tremaine as holding copies of sixty-eight eighteenth-century Canadian imprints; to date the Legislative Library is listed in ESTC as a contributor of a mere four records of Canadian imprints. The situation is even worse with respect to the Acadia collection. Here Tremaine located copies of eighty items, fifteen of which were unique — including twelve Nova Scotia laws; ESTC locates copies of only two items at Acadia, neither of which corresponds to any of the unique items identified by Tremaine.

Mount Allison University is not a formal ESTC contributor; thus the Davidson Collection of early printed Canadiana is not accessible to researchers through ESTC. According to the recent catalogue of the Davidson Collection, the collection contains copies of fifty Tremaine items as well as copies of five eighteenth-century Canadian imprints not identified by Tremaine.¹¹

In terms of ESTC coverage of Quebec repositories, the only bright spot is the McGill University collection. Tremaine located copies of thirty-six items at McGill, none of which was unique. McGill's collection of Canadian imprints is represented in ESTC by fifty-seven items, including eleven items not identified by Tremaine¹² and copies of five items for which Tremaine found no copies.

At the Bibliothèque de la ville de Montréal (Tremaine's CaQM), Tremaine located copies of ninety-four items, seven of which were unique: to date, ESTC contains records of only thirty-nine items with copies located at the Bibliothèque de la ville de Montréal, none of which are items not identified by Tremaine or for which

Tremaine found no copies, and including only three of the seven unique items. *Catalogue collectif*, published in 1984, located copies of 246 items at the Bibliothèque de la ville de Montréal.¹³

The Bibliothèque nationale du Québec in Montreal did not exist when Tremaine was preparing *Canadian Imprints*, but at its inception subsumed most of the substantial collection examined by Tremaine at the Bibliothèque de St. Sulpice (Tremaine's CaQMS). Here Tremaine located 191 copies of 143 items, forty of which she identified as unique. As noted above, despite contributing at least 756 records to ESTC and despite total holdings (in 1984) of 543 Quebec imprints dated 1764–1820 (as listed in *Catalogue collectif*), the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec is represented in ESTC by a single Canadian imprint. Of the forty items in the St. Sulpice collection identified as unique by Tremaine, only two are located in ESTC at other repositories, leaving thirty-eight unique items unrepresented because the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec's collection of Canadian imprints has either not been reported to or not been processed by ESTC. These thirty-eight items include several works of major historical and bibliographical significance, including Tremaine 147, a primer printed in the Abnaki dialect; Tremaine 251, the second illustrated Canadian imprint; Tremaine 598, a broadside map of Montreal c. 1789; and Tremaine 466, the 1785 catalogue of the Quebec Library (these items are all listed as unique to the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec collection in *Catalogue collectif*).

A second huge gap in ESTC's coverage of Canadian imprints in Quebec repositories is its failure to include as a contributor the Séminaire de Québec in Quebec City. Tremaine examined this enormously rich collection when it was affiliated with the Université Laval (thus her use of the location code CaQQL). When Laval relocated to Sainte-Foy, nearly all of the eighteenth-century Canadian imprints remained at the Séminaire.¹⁴ Here Tremaine located 224 copies of 205 items, fifty-four of which were unique. *Catalogue collectif* confirms that, as of 1984, forty-five of these fifty-four items are still in the Séminaire de Québec collection (seven items are not cited in *Catalogue collectif* and two others are located at the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec or McGill but not at the Séminaire de Québec), forty-one of which remain unique (four items exist in two copies, one located at the Séminaire de Québec and the other at either the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec or the Bibliothèque de la ville de Montréal). Université Laval is a formal contributor to ESTC but to date is listed as having contributed records for

only six Canadian imprints, none of which correspond to the Séminaire de Québec items identified by Tremaine as unique; this leaves over forty unique Canadian imprints unrepresented in ESTC despite the fact that their current location is well known.

Relatively small but nonetheless important collections of eighteenth-century Canadian imprints at the Quebec Provincial Legislative Library (Tremaine code CaQ), les Archives nationales du Québec (Tremaine code CaQQA), the Advocate's Library in Montreal (Tremaine code CaQMA), Université de Montréal, and the Archevêché in Quebec City, the archives of the Catholic Archdiocese of Quebec (Tremaine code CaQQR), are similarly unrepresented in ESTC because these institutions are not formal ESTC contributors.

In Ontario three institutions, the Library of Parliament and National Archives of Canada in Ottawa and the Metropolitan Toronto Reference Library (cited by Tremaine as the Toronto Public Library collection, where she located 550 copies of 456 items, 123 of which were unique), are represented in ESTC by a total of seven records of Canadian imprints. At the Library of Parliament (two ESTC Canadian imprint records), Tremaine located 193 copies of 173 items, fifty-five of which were unique, including twenty-seven unique copies of Quebec and Lower Canada almanacs bound in collections of the *Quebec Gazette*, along with nineteen unique copies of the *Quebec Gazette's* carrier's addresses. Thirteen of the twenty-seven almanacs are cited in *Catalogue collectif* with copies (many of which are incomplete) in either or both the Séminaire de Québec and the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec. Five of the nineteen carrier's addresses are cited in *Catalogue collectif*, all single copies located at the Séminaire de Québec. This leaves thirty-seven items, apparently unique to the Library of Parliament collection, including fourteen copies of Quebec and Lower Canada almanacs and fourteen copies of the *Quebec Gazette's* carrier's addresses, not represented in ESTC along with an additional eighteen items identified by Tremaine as unique to the Library of Parliament collection but now known to exist at the Séminaire de Québec and/or the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec but not recorded in ESTC because the Séminaire is not an ESTC contributor. The Bibliothèque nationale du Québec has either not contributed records of Canadian imprints to ESTC or these records have yet to be processed.

Similarly, at the National Archives of Canada (five ESTC records of Canadian imprints), Tremaine identified 262 copies of 204 items

(not including photostatic copies) of which forty were unique, with an additional eight items unique to the institution but existing in multiple copies. Of these unique or unique-to-institution items, two are cited in ESTC and a third — Tremaine 55 — is additionally located at the Séminaire de Québec (*Catalogue collectif* 0891). But this leaves forty-five unique items unrecorded in ESTC, including: five proclamations issued in 1792 and 1794 by Lt.-Governor Simcoe in Upper Canada (Tremaine 817, 818, 819, 917, 918); *Der Neu-schottlandische Calender* for 1789 with a wood-block title-page (Tremaine 542); copies of rare New Brunswick almanacs printed by John Ryan or Christopher Sower (Tremaine 625, 626); and specimens/prospectuses of printing for the *Quebec Gazette* (Tremaine 56), *Quebec Herald* (Tremaine 618) and the *Quebec Times* (Tremaine 913). In fairness, it must be noted that since Tremaine examined this collection it has been largely reorganized and Tremaine's location notations have consequently been rendered obsolete. This has made it extremely difficult for contemporary researchers to find many of the items cited by Tremaine.

At the Metropolitan Toronto Reference Library (ESTC contributors of at least 200 total records, of which *none* is for a Canadian imprint), Tremaine found ninety-five copies of seventy-nine items, twenty of which were unique, including fourteen unique broadsides. In addition, Gertrude M. Boyle, ed., *A Bibliography of Canadiana: First Supplement* (Toronto: Public Library Board, 1959) lists four eighteenth-century Canadian imprints added to the (now) Metropolitan Toronto Reference Library collection since Tremaine published *Canadian Imprints* in 1952, including two items not identified by Tremaine (items 4757 and 4765); and Sandra Alston, ed., *A Bibliography of Canadiana: Second Supplement* (Toronto: Metropolitan Toronto Library Board, 1985–1989) lists eighteen eighteenth-century Canadian imprints added to the Metropolitan Toronto Reference Library collection since 1959 including one item not identified by Tremaine (item 6670) and two items for which Tremaine found no copies (item 6679 = Tremaine 1138; item 6683 = Tremaine 1191). This leaves, through 1989, a total of at least 101 items in the Metropolitan Toronto Reference Library collection, of which perhaps as many as twenty-five are unique, unrecorded in ESTC.

The two British repositories with major collections of eighteenth-century Canadian imprints, the British Library and the (London) Public Record Office, are, from the point of view of researchers interested in using ESTC to study early printed Canadiana, a study

in stark contrast. On the one hand, the general broadening of knowledge of the British Library's eighteenth-century collection, which has resulted directly from the ESTC project, is well illustrated by the inclusion in ESTC of more than three times as many Canadian imprints with copies at the British Library as were identified by Tremaine. Limiting her search at the British Museum Library to the Haldimand papers, Tremaine found twelve items, ten of which were unique. ESTC to date includes records of thirty-nine Canadian imprints with copies at the British Library, including all but three of the twelve British Museum Library items identified by Tremaine and five items not identified by Tremaine at all. In keeping with the ESTC's general expansion of knowledge of 'ephemeral' printing, two of these five not-in-Tremaine items are broadsides.

Unfortunately, for ESTC students of Canadian imprints, the prospect is not so pleasant with respect to the resources of the Public Record Office (Lpro). To date ESTC has located only one Canadian imprint at Lpro, where Tremaine identified 161 items, many of them broadsides sent to the Colonial Office by Canadian Governors and Lt.-Governors in their dispatches, and forty-seven of which Tremaine identified as unique. Of these 161 items, ESTC locates thirty-seven with copies in other repositories, but only one of the forty-seven items described by Tremaine as unique to the Public Record Office (Tremaine 613, located at the National Library of Canada).

It is doubly disappointing that ESTC not only does not include descriptive notice of a large number of apparently unique imprints but also misses an opportunity to contribute substantially to the historical, bibliographical record of eighteenth century Canadian imprints by confirming or altering the second-hand descriptive records produced by Tremaine for many of the items she located in unique copies at Lpro but which she apparently never saw, basing her descriptions on manuscript transcriptions of the original documents which she found at the Public Archives of Canada (now the National Archives of Canada).¹⁵ On a more positive note, the compilers of the Tremaine supplement project report that much of the relevant material at Lpro has been flagged, perhaps by ESTC researchers, and all has of course been described for inclusion in the forthcoming Tremaine supplement.

The short conclusion to this extended discussion is clearly that ESTC coverage of Canadian imprints, particularly those held in Canadian repositories, is woefully inadequate, especially so when much of the relevant material — particularly Quebec imprints — is

well documented in other bibliographical sources. The few instances in which ESTC has been relatively successful in encompassing and making accessible eighteenth-century Canadian imprints held in certain repositories — Dalhousie University, McGill University, the National Library of Canada, and the British Library — cannot compensate for the general and severe underrepresentation of eighteenth-century Canadian imprints held in most Canadian repositories and the utter omission of collections of virtually unparalleled richness at the London Public Record Office, the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec, the Séminaire de Québec, and the Metropolitan Toronto Reference Library.

Errors, omissions, and inconsistencies are to be expected in a project as massive and complex as ESTC, and it would, of course, be unfair to apply the same critical standards to a general bibliographic database as to a descriptive bibliography with a relatively narrow scope such as Tremaine's *Canadian Imprints*. Nevertheless, it seems neither unfair nor irrelevant to identify problems inherent in the ESTC database which cumulatively diminish its utility both as a union catalogue and as a resource for historical, bibliographical research relative to Canadian imprints.

In addition to the generally meagre coverage of the major eighteenth-century Canadian imprint collections in Canadian repositories, ESTC's location-coding protocols and explanatory keys are confusing and riddled with frustrating errors. Single repositories are sometimes designated by multiple location codes. For example, the law library at York University is listed as CaOTYL, with 512 citations; as CaOTY-L, with eight citations; and as Ca-OTYL, with one citation. Furthermore, mis-entered codes appear in the 'Libraries' browse indexes and various location fields of the records themselves which cannot always be connected with the name of an actual repository in the lists of contributing libraries provided in the ESTC ON CD-ROM printed *Manual*.^{16, 17}

Such errors and inconveniences undermine user confidence in what should be one of ESTC's most useful features — the ability to search the holdings of particular libraries or proximate groups of libraries — and calls into question the integrity and effectiveness of the file as a union catalogue.

Closely related to the issue of repository coverage is the issue of numbers of locations holding extant copies of particular works. ESTC is self-advertised as a union catalogue; it aims to provide exhaustive lists of worldwide locations of extant copies of the specific works cited in the ESTC file. This feature of ESTC is valuable

and important for several reasons. First, scholars have greater access to extant copies because they know where such copies are located. This is crucial because the bibliographical study of works produced during the hand-press period depends on the physical examination of multiple copies of such works. In the hand-press period every copy of every edition is worthy of scholarly notice because it may contain anomalous features which might help to clarify aspects of the printing history of particular works and of the eighteenth-century book trade in general. Specific copies may contain or lack, for example, half-titles, cancelled and/or inserted leaves, stop press corrections, errors in imposition, advertisements, and subscribers lists. The importance of ESTC's decision to list all extant copies rests in the fact that the anomalies are bibliographically significant. Comprehensive lists of extant copies of works are also helpful in establishing priorities for the preservation of particularly scarce editions, and represent significant secondary evidence of the geographic extent of eighteenth-century printing and the collecting practices of specific individuals and institutions.

Given these potential benefits the student of early printed Canada will clearly be interested to know the extent to which they are realized with specific reference to eighteenth-century Canadian imprints. A comparison of the number of locations listed by Tremaine and by ESTC for works commonly described (i.e., items cited both in ESTC and *Canadian Imprints*) reveals that ESTC has not only cited far fewer works than did Tremaine but also, in most cases, lists far fewer locations than did Tremaine. Table 3 summarizes the comparison by charting the number of locations provided by ESTC relative to Tremaine. The category '-5,' for example, indicates the number of commonly described works for which ESTC lists at least five fewer locations than did Tremaine. Only those ESTC locations described as 'primary' or 'verified' have been considered. ESTC locations described as 'unverified' have been ignored:¹⁸

Table 3

+2	+1	=	-1	-2	-3	-4	-5
1	26	58	27	30	10	14	40

This analysis indicates that in nearly 60% of the cases considered, ESTC has provided fewer (in many cases far fewer) locations than did

Tremaine, and where ESTC has provided more locations, the addition is marginal (with one exception, a single addition). ESTC's claim to function as a union catalogue cannot, at present, be maintained with reference to Canadian imprints.

In her introduction to *Canadian Imprints* Tremaine claimed that early Canadian imprints have survived in sufficient numbers that, with respect to the printing trade in eighteenth-century Canada, 'the general picture is clear. Additional items may possibly come to light from time to time, but they are unlikely to change the picture in any significant way' (p. xi). The advent of ESTC has identified and made accessible some few items either not known to Tremaine or which she knew of but could not locate in extant copies; however, neither these identifications nor ESTC's descriptions of Canadian imprints already well documented in Tremaine and other bibliographical sources has resulted in any major revision of the broad outlines of the portrait of printing in eighteenth-century Canada sketched by Tremaine.

To date ESTC has not provided evidence to alter Tremaine's conclusions regarding the authorship, date and place of publication, or printer(s) of items identified in *Canadian Imprints*. Nor has the information assembled and made available by ESTC led to the definitive identification of any printer or printers' partnership arrangement or centre of printing activity not known to and documented by Tremaine, nor even to the extension of the operative dates assigned by Tremaine to the activities of specific printers and presses. ESTC has not revealed any significant class of printed materials not known to Tremaine (although ESTC has made important contributions in identifying extant copies of various almanacs and broadsides), or which she concluded were either never printed in significant numbers or were printed but are now irretrievably lost (such as materials on the fur trade, the Indian almanacs, and elementary school books or primers). These conclusions are noted here not by way of criticism but as a statement of fact.

For the most part, ESTC descriptions of Canadian imprints provide, at best, relatively minor adjustments in bibliographical detail and confirmation of tentative bibliographical conclusions, ascriptions and attributions made by Tremaine, most often with reference to ncl items (see Table 2 above). Unfortunately, such positive contributions, modest as they are, are at least matched and probably exceeded by errors, anomalies, and inconsistencies in the bibliographical record of eighteenth-century Canadian imprints introduced by the ESTC, which when combined with certain faults and

limitations inherent in the ESTC database and cataloguing protocols, further compromise ESTC's value as a resource for the study of Canadian imprints and printing history.

One thing which is immediately apparent when one studies the file of ESTC descriptions of Canadian imprints is the disconcerting frequency with which ESTC title transcriptions diverge from Tremaine's (which is not to say that Tremaine, herself, was not guilty of an occasional mistranscription). Comparison of these transcriptions with transcriptions found in other bibliographical sources confirms that in virtually all cases of divergence, ESTC's transcriptions are erroneous. In most such cases ESTC contributors and/or cataloguers have inadvertently omitted title elements. For example, ESTC W009850 (Tremaine 1115), describing a sermon by Mather Byles printed at Saint John, N.B., by John Ryan in 1799, omits the word 'signal' from that portion of the title transcribed by Tremaine as '... the late signal successes, granted to his Majesty's arms.' Confronted with such an anomaly, the bibliographer in particular is left to ponder whether this discrepancy represents a simple error in transcription or an undetected variant. The frequency of such occurrences and comparison with other bibliographical sources certainly suggest that ESTC cataloguers and contributors have not been sufficiently vigilant in detecting transcription errors.

In some cases these mistranscriptions have serious semantic consequences, as in ESTC W016736 (Tremaine 1149) where the word 'first' is omitted from the caption title transcribed by Tremaine as '... an act passed in the second session of the first provincial parliament of Upper Canada.' Similarly, the omission of the word 'Regis' (in this case an entire line on the title page) in ESTC W016734 (Tremaine 889) from that portion of the title transcribed by Tremaine as 'Anno Regni Georgii III. Regis Magnae Britanniae ...' makes grammatical nonsense of the title. In this instance, Tremaine's transcription is confirmed by *Catalogue collectif* 0083.¹⁹ Of course, ESTC is not primarily a descriptive bibliography, but such errors, relatively minor in themselves, cumulatively undermine confidence in ESTC's claim to preserve important bibliographical information by faithfully transcribing *original* misprints rather than silently correcting or normalizing these. Who is to know if a particular anomaly is an original misprint or an ESTC transcription error?

Particularly in records catalogued at the British Library (ESTC record numbers beginning with the character 't'), an anomalous ESTC transcription often incorporates a *deliberate* ellipsis in a long

title. In some cases ESTC cataloguers have made puzzling, inappropriate, and unfortunate choices of title elements to edit by ellipsis. For example, compare the title as transcribed and edited by Tremaine in her item 439 and by ESTC cataloguers in record number 050135:

Tremaine: 'This is to give notice . . . [to] Refugee Loyalists and disbanded troops . . .'

ESTC: 'This is to give notice that his excellency the governor, in order to fulfill His Majesty's gracious intentions . . .'

The result is that the significant words 'Refugee Loyalists' are omitted in the ESTC record and thus lost for keyword searches on materials relating to this topic.

Also problematic is ESTC's handling of descriptions incorporating attributions — of dates of printing to undated items and printers' names to anonymously printed items. Tremaine herself made many such attributions on the basis of circumstantial evidence both internal and external to the printed item, and for the most part, ESTC simply incorporates these attributions in its descriptions, noting them as such and citing Tremaine as the source.

On occasion, however, a Tremaine attribution appears in an ESTC description without acknowledgment in the notes, as in ESTC w016725 (Tremaine 901). In other places ESTC reports as definitive information an attribution which Tremaine made quite tentatively, while providing no new evidence to support the change. For example, compare ESTC w016738 with the corresponding description by Tremaine (item 1151). ESTC dates the item without qualification to 1799 (the date on the title page) whereas Tremaine has been much more circumspect: 'Though possibly published in 1799, this work was advertised [for the first time?] [in] . . . *Upper Canada Gazette*, Apr. 5, 1800.' Does ESTC's unqualified attribution of this item to 1799 reflect some new information which has allowed definitive dating, or merely indiscriminating transcription of the imprint date and ignorance of Tremaine's doubts?

Most disturbingly, ESTC in some cases makes attributions — again unsupported by evidence — where Tremaine pointedly refused to do so. For example, Tremaine item 1173 was printed anonymously, and Tremaine made no attribution (a decision supported by *Catalogue collectif* 0458). In its corresponding description of this item (record number w016638), ESTC reports the imprint as 'Quebec:

Imprimé [par Roger Lelièvre & Pierre-Edouard Désbarats] à la Nouvelle Imprimerie 1800' and adds in a note, 'Pierre-Edouard Désbarats and John Neilson were partners at the Nouvelle Imprimerie in 1800.' The latter is a fact well known to Tremaine (and presumably considered by her insufficient as the basis for an attribution), and which further begs the question: why attribute to Lelièvre and Désbarats rather than Désbarats and Neilson? No further rationale or authority is provided by ESTC to sustain this attribution.

ESTC cataloguers have not been particularly scrupulous in noting bibliographical interrelationships between Canadian imprints even when such connections are obvious, important, and well documented by Tremaine. ESTC W016695, a description of Tremaine 710, never mentions the fact that the item is a French translation of Tremaine 709. Similarly, ESTC W016715, describing Tremaine 1119, fails to note that the item is a reprint of Tremaine 1086. ESTC W037139 (Tremaine 520) records the work's 'collation' as '[3], 76-100 p.' which is perplexing in the absence of any explanation such as is provided by Tremaine, that the work was separately printed but paged in continuation of an earlier publication (Tremaine 486).

ESTC's account of the imposition or format of Canadian imprints is particularly erratic, frequently incomplete, and in several instances directly contradictory to Tremaine (justifiably in one or two cases but most often not). Of the 211 items commonly described by ESTC and Tremaine, twenty-two ESTC entries include no more information in the 'Format' field than a '?'. The ESTC on CD-ROM *Manual* (p. 3.15) explains that the '?' indicates that the record was prepared by North American Imprint Program cataloguers working with microform copies, which naturally prevented their determination of the item's format 'with any certainty.' A further thirty-eight ESTC entries substitute for the standard ascriptions of format the dimensions in centimetres of the type page.²⁰ Contrary to the *Manual's* explanations (p. 3.14), this practice is *not* confined to the descriptions of single-sheet items — in fact, of the thirty-eight ESTC entries describing the 'format' of Canadian imprints in terms of type-page dimensions, only one (Tremaine 921/ESTC W034887) is a single-sheet item.

A final problem is ESTC's policy regarding multilingual texts. While ESTC does have a language-field code ('mul') for polyglot items, it is rarely assigned. Instead, in nearly all cases in which an item contains material printed in more than one language, the dominant language is exclusively designated in the language field while reference is made in the notes field to the presence of other-

language material. Bilingual English-French editions are common among eighteenth-century Canadian imprints, but in citing these items, ESTC nearly invariably describes them in the language field as 'English.' Searchers must thus rely on a keyword search in the notes field in order to identify such items. A secondary problem concerning bilingual English-French Canadian imprints is that ESTC cataloguers have not used standard phraseology in describing the manner of their imposition. ESTC record numbers w016690 (Tremaine 942) and t094676 (Tremaine 996) are respectively described as printed in English and French 'on opposite pages' and 'on facing pages.' Tremaine describes both as printed in English and French 'on opposite pages.' In some cases, no imposition information is provided, e.g. in ESTC w016655/Tremaine 188, described by Tremaine as printed 'in English and French on opposite pages' but in ESTC as merely 'printed in English and French.'

The powerful search and retrieval facilities provided by ESTC ON CD-ROM do offer considerable potential benefits to students of eighteenth-century Canadian imprints and printing history, but such benefits are at present severely limited by the relatively small sample of Canadian imprints (less than 20% of the 'universe') included in the ESTC database. In general the meagre size of this sample, and the impossibility of knowing whether it is statistically representative of the whole, means that no valid conclusions regarding eighteenth-century Canadian printing can be made on the basis of ESTC-derived data.

RÉSUMÉ

Le but de cet exposé est d'évaluer la couverture et le traitement des imprimés canadiens, dans l'édition 1992 sur cd-rom du catalogue de titres abrégés du dix-huitième siècle. La principale conclusion est que les imprimés canadiens sont largement sous-représentés: le catalogue abrégé sur CD-ROM contient des notices pour moins de vingt pourcent de tous les imprimés canadiens du dix-huitième siècle, tels que définis par Marie Tremaine dans: A Bibliography of Canadian Imprints, 1751-1800 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1952) et par Patricia Fleming et Sandra Alston dans leur supplément à paraître. Plusieurs institutions avec des collections imposantes d'imprimés canadiens du dix-huitième siècle sont représentées par peu ou pas de notices, y compris la Bibliothèque nationale du Québec à Montréal, le Séminaire de Québec, la

Metropolitan Toronto Reference Library et la London Public Record Office en Angleterre. De plus, plusieurs omissions, erreurs et anomalies inhérentes à la base de données diminuent grandement son utilité comme catalogue collectif et comme ressource pour la recherche historique et bibliographique relative aux imprimés canadiens.

NOTES

The author wishes to acknowledge the generous advice and assistance of Patricia Fleming and Sandra Alston, who are currently compiling a supplement to Tremaine's *A Bibliography of Canadian Imprints*, and who have graciously provided information derived from their work in progress.

- 1 In April 1994 some 75,000 bibliographic records of imprints published between 1473 and 1700 were added to the RLIN database. In view of the expanded time period of coverage, ESTC has been renamed as the English Short Title Catalog.
- 2 *A Bibliography of Canadian Imprints* ends with item number 1204, but some items are designated A, B, C, etc. See Tremaine 86A, B; 126A, B; 373A, B; 772A, B, C; and 1172A, B.
- 3 Despite claims made in the ESTC on CD-ROM *Manual* (p. 7.7) that a 'cy=' search for materials printed in a specific country will work equally well if the searcher uses the country's full name or its ESTC-designated code, a 'cy=cn' search works while a 'cy=Canada' search produces a 0 posting.
- 4 See Tremaine items 58, 77, 213, 396, 421, 476, 481, 518, 578A, 584, 589, 711, 743, 748, 979, and 984.
- 5 The fifteen Tremaine ncl items located by ESTC include one item (Tremaine 737) for which Tremaine found only a photostatic copy (at the National Archives of Canada; *Catalogue collectif* 0842 cites another photostatic copy at the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec).
- 6 A copy of Tremaine 404 was located at McGill in *Catalogue collectif* 0933; a copy of Tremaine 768 was located at McGill in *Catalogue collectif* 0451 and cited also as item 200 in *The Lawrence Lande Collection of Canadiana in the Redpath Library of McGill University: A Bibliography* (Montreal: Lawrence Lande Foundation for Canadian Historical Research, 1965). A second photostatic copy of Tremaine 737 was located at the Bibliothèque nationale du Québec in *Catalogue collectif* 0842 and cited also as item 65 in Aegidius Fauteux, 'Fleury Mesplet: une étude sur les commencements de l'imprimerie dans la ville de Montréal,' *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of America* 28, no. 2 (1934): 164-93, and item 1, 31 in N.E. Dionne, *Inventaire chronologique* (Quebec, 1905). None of the fifteen Tremaine ncl items located in ESTC are items listed in Tremaine on the basis of published advertisements or proposals for printing but for which no definitive evidence was found of their having been printed as proposed.
- 7 The Tremaine supplement project has located extant copies of four Tremaine ncl Nova Scotia almanacs and three Tremaine ncl Lower Canada almanacs not

currently located in *ESTC* (Tremaine 576, 749, 824, 867, 973, 1109, and 1159) *in addition* to the six Tremaine ncl Lower Canada and Nova Scotia almanacs that *ESTC* *does* locate. Moreover, although the Public Archives of Nova Scotia has reported to *ESTC* a copy of Tremaine ncl Nova Scotia almanac 350, it is not presently listed as having reported copies of Tremaine ncl Nova Scotia almanacs 576, 749, and 824, which the Tremaine supplement project located at the Archives. Similarly, Dalhousie University has reported to *ESTC* copies of Tremaine ncl items 870, 923, and 978 but is not presently listed in *ESTC* as holding copies of Tremaine ncl items 824 and 1159, located at Dalhousie by the Tremaine supplement project.

- 8 Six of the items bear Halifax imprints while four others are attributed to Halifax (one other item has the indefinite imprint 'Nova Scotia'); Quebec: two imprints and six attributions; Montreal: one imprint and two attributions; Saint John, N.B.: one imprint. Three items name Anthony Henry as printer. John Howe is named printer of three items with one other item attributed to him and yet another item with the imprint 'printed by . . . J. Walter . . . and . . . reprinted John Howe . . . ' William Brown at Quebec is named printer in one item with three others attributed to him; Fleury Mesplet at Montreal is named printer in one item and attributed printer of another. John Ryan at Saint John and Louis Germain at Quebec are each named printer in one item. Seven items are anonymously printed with no attributions. Twelve items are printed in English, seven in French, three in both English and French, and one in German. Nine items are 'single sheet' or broadsides (illustrating *ESTC*'s utility in exposing hitherto unknown 'ephemera'), while six others are twenty-four pages or fewer in length; only five items exceed fifty pages. McGill is listed as a location for nine of these items (five broadsides), Dalhousie three (all almanacs), the American Antiquarian Society and the British Library four each.
- 9 Among the more interesting eighteenth-century Canadian imprints cited in *ESTC* not hitherto known are the following:
 - A. *ESTC* w016581 is the 'Nova Scotia Calender . . . for . . . 1776,' by a pseudonymous author — 'Rider' — not mentioned in Tremaine. The compilers of the Tremaine supplement project confirm that this is indeed a copy of Tremaine 195.
 - B. *ESTC* w016661 is an ordinance issued by the Court of General Quarter Sessions of the Peace, Quebec District, establishing cartage rates for Montreal and Quebec.
 - C. *ESTC* w016633 is a 150-page 'brief review of the campaign in North America, in . . . 1781' by 'a gentleman in Nova Scotia.' This is evidently an extended exercise in Loyalist propaganda intended to justify the actions of British military and administrative officials during the American War of Independence.
 - D. *ESTC* w016698 is a blank form of agreement to enter service, prepared for McTavish, Frobisher and Co., fur traders of Montreal (printed 1790).
 - E. *ESTC* w024751 is a broadside printed in 1796 at Halifax for the Freemasons Grand Lodge of Nova Scotia, listing members of the Hiram Lodge, Saint John, N.B., who were expelled from the Order for 'apostasy.'

- F. ESTC W016611 is a copy of the 'Neuschottlandische Calender, auf das Jahr . . . 1798.' Identification of this item in a copy at Dalhousie confirms that Anthony Henry did indeed print a German language almanac for this year.
 - G. ESTC W016624 is apparently an election circular or handbill (printed 1795), an illustrated broadside which includes both letter press text and an 'en-graved election cartoon favoring the merchant over the lawyer as representative' (ESTC note).
 - H. ESTC W016660 is a broadside soliciting contributions for the repair of the Hotel Dieu at Quebec, which describes the criteria for admission to this institution and the treatment provided, and also names major subscribers to the restoration campaign.
 - I. ESTC W016600 is a copy of the 'for 1793' edition of the 'Halifax Almanack,' printed by John Howe; identification of this copy fills the only gap in the series 1790-1801.
 - J. ESTC W015737 is 'An Astronomical Diary, or Almanack . . . for . . . 1789 . . . for . . . the City of St. John' by Samuel Stearns and printed by John Ryan. Christopher Sower printed the Saint John 'Astronomical Diary' for 1786 (Tremaine 446), 1788 (Tremaine 502) and 1790 (Tremaine 574). Since both ESTC W015737 and the Saint John 'Astronomical Diary . . . for 1787' are not identified by Tremaine, the possibility arises that Ryan also printed the 'for 1787' edition and that he and Sower had an arrangement to share the responsibility and profit of printing the 'Astronomical Diary' in alternate years, prior to Ryan's beginning to print the 'British-American Almanack' with the 'for 1790' edition.
- 10 *Factotum* no. 37 (September 1993) contains in its 'ESTC News' section (p. 3) the announcement that ESTC has 'just begun processing receipts for 1992; the project is thus some 'two years behind.'
 - 11 Two of the five not-in-Tremaine items in the Davidson collection were probably printed in 1803. Compare items 534 and 535 in *The Edgar and Dorothy Davidson Collection of Canadiana at Mount Allison University* (Sackville, N.B.: Centre for Canadian Studies, Mount Allison University, 1991) with items 21 and 24 in Patricia Fleming, *Upper Canadian Imprints, 1801-1841: A Bibliography*. Circumstantial evidence suggests that at least a major portion of the Ketcheson collection was acquired by the Davidsons and donated with the rest of their collection to Mount Allison, thus compounding the problem of the inaccessibility through ESTC of the Mount Allison collection.
 - 12 Of these eleven items, two were probably printed in 1803. Compare ESTC W016703 and W016704 with items 21 and 24 in Fleming, *Upper Canadian Imprints, 1801-1841: A Bibliography*.
 - 13 Not all of these items, of course, were printed prior to 1801, the terminal limit of Tremaine's and ESTC's scope; the figure is cited to illustrate the obvious and significant gap between the number of records contributed by the Bibliothèque de la ville de Montréal to ESTC and the number of relevant items contained in the Bibliothèque de la ville de Montréal collection.
 - 14 Specifically, works acquired by Laval prior to 1910 remained at the Séminaire.
 - 15 See Tremaine 138, 148, 158, 166, 178, 179, 206, 910, and 969.

- 16 Comparison of the list of Canadian contributing libraries on pp. 13.22 and 13.23 of the *ESTC ON CD-ROM Manual* with the browse index list of location codes with the prefix 'Ca' reveals the following anomalous codes (with the number of citations with which the code is erroneously connected added in brackets); CaBMBN (1); CaBV:VB (1); CaHEU (1); CaHSHK (1) — probably a misprint of the proper code CaNSHK; CaNSHB (1) — a misentry for CaNSHV?; CaNSHBV (1) — i.e. CaNSHV; CaNSHK (1) — i.e. CaNSHK; CaNSHMs (257) — entered as such in the browse index but as CaNSHMS in the printed key; CaOIHM (1) — i.e. CaOHM; CaOKO (1) — i.e. CaOKQ; CaONicS (1) — i.e. CaQNicS; CaONtU (1) — i.e. CaOTU?; CaOTMLC (1); CaOUW (1); CaOWtCl (1); CaPMPC (1); CaQHM (3); CaQKR (1); CaQMMM (1); CaQnM (1); and CaTOU (1) — i.e. CaOTU.
- 17 Examination of two *ESTC* records will demonstrate how *ESTC* location code anomalies can bedevil and frustrate those who use this database to conduct research concerning early Canadian imprints. *ESTC* w016724 corresponds to Tremaine 845. In the detailed display format provided by *ESTC* the information in the location fields for this item appears as

PRIMARY LOC (NA): CaOONL

VERIFIED ADD LOCS (NA): ??? (Lande 13-306 Uncatalogued. Reserve)

An experienced researcher familiar with the Lande collection at the National Library of Canada will have little difficulty in interpreting this. But what of a researcher without such experience or knowledge? He or she might well assume that *ESTC* has located two copies of this item, one at the National Library and another, frustratingly inaccessible, at the mysteriously named repository '????.'

A more serious problem concerns *ESTC* w016626, a sixteen-page address by James Clarke to Cornwallis [Freemasons] Lodge in Halifax, printed at Halifax by John Howe in 1789. The 'primary location' for this item, which was not identified by Tremaine, is listed as repository 'CS.' Consultation of the subindex 'U.S. Libraries' in the *ESTC* 'Libraries' browse index indicates that repository CS is listed as a location for six items, one of which is w016626, but this index does not indicate the name of the institution involved, and for this it is necessary to consult the key to contributing libraries in the printed *Manual*. Unfortunately, the code 'CS' does not appear anywhere in this list. A note at the head of the list of location codes for North American libraries (p. 13.15) says 'Symbols used for North American libraries are those used in the National Union Catalog: pre-1956 Imprints. Any symbols not found in this list should be identified through NUC.' But an examination of the NUC list of location codes fails to identify 'CS,' leaving the researcher interested in this hitherto unknown, presumably unique item to hypothesize that the item is held at the Sutro Branch, Sacramento, of the California State Library (listed in NUC and *ESTC* as 'C-S').

The *ESTC* 'Libraries' browse index is itself somewhat confusing because three subindexes are offered — U.K. Libraries, U.S. Libraries, and Other Libraries. But 'U.S.' in this context turns out to mean, 'North American,' since the user must look in the 'U.S. Libraries' subindex for location codes for Canadian libraries.

- 18 The number of works does not total 211, i.e. the total number of works commonly described by Tremaine and *ESTC* because, as with items 197, 198,

200, and 231, Tremaine did not provide location lists for works for which very large numbers of copies exist.

- 19 In still other cases of mistranscription ESTC contributors or cataloguers have misspelled or mis-keyed title elements. For example, the internal arrangement and extent of Tremaine 232 are badly distorted in the corresponding ESTC entry (w016637) where the number 'xxi' is erroneously entered in that portion of the title transcribed by Tremaine (and confirmed by *Catalogue collectif* 0457) as '... divises en xii. livres. ...' In a few extreme cases non-existent title elements have been *added*, as in ESTC w016664 (Tremaine 187) where a portion of the title is transcribed as '... pursued by the government. ...' The word 'the' does not appear in the title of the University of Toronto copy which serves as ESTC's primary source of information.
- 20 Diverging in at least two instances from similar measurements found in Tremaine — see Tremaine 101/ESTC w006069 and Tremaine 257/ESTC w016686.