pricks zealous collectors into making stupid purchases. George Miles ventures a social history of rare book collections. Describing a convulsive cycle of sentimental acquisition and financial retrenchment, he suggests that, were we to pay attention to books as physical evidence as well as sources of information, we could ascribe a new value to fraudulent productions. Documents of the history of the book trade, fakes could become classics in their own right. 'Is it valuable?' would replace 'is it real?' as the question for acquirors. Jennifer Larson, America's answer to Nicolas Barker, wonders whether such a process might be institutionalized. Could forgeries, once removed from the market, make their way into teaching collections? Anthony Rota concludes the formal papers with an ethereal – one might say insubstantial – appeal for decency. Resorting at times to theological language, he damns forgers to a 'special circle of Dante's Hell' and talks with alarming enthusiasm about the 'sin' 'in bibliographic terms' of fakery (pp. 153-54).

It is curious that so many aficionados of evidence fail to notice the obvious ironic aspects of their project at canonizing copyists. Both Fake and Frauds and Forged Documents remain silent on the social and career value of forgery. Isn't it fun and professionally beneficial for scholars to hold a conference on a subject that they are officially trying to exterminate? Fortunately, bibliography, as the conference all admit, is a cut above foolishly clean distinctions. Detective stories not only teach, they please. One finishes these books not only informed – would to god that all scholars were such prophets of precision! – but delighted, having been in the company of some of the most entertaining, assiduously engaged people in the scholarly community. Harris, Myers, and Bozeman have recorded an inimitably originate, beguilingly straightforward dialogue on a heretofore unmentionable topic. Their startling books will issue in many new fields of research – and many delectably embarrassing disclosures.

KEVIN L. COPE
Louisiana State University


Stephen Garrison’s book is the latest of several primary and secondary bibliographies of Edith Wharton, many of which are long outdated and none of which is as complete as this new work. The others are Lawson Melish’s A Bibliography of the Collected Writings of Edith Wharton (1927), which refers only to books; Lavinia Davis’s A Bibliography of the Writings of Edith Wharton (1933), a book written for collectors and now itself a collector’s item; Vito J. Brenni’s Edith Wharton: A Bibliography (1966), which covers primary works, translations, book reviews, and selected criticism; Marlene Springer’s Edith Wharton and Kate Chopin: A Reference Guide (1976); and Kristin O. Lauer’s and Margaret P. Murray’s Edith Wharton: An Annotated Secondary Bibliography (1990), which includes an outline pri-
mary bibliography. Other notable recent publications include R.W.B. Lewis's *Edith Wharton: A Biography* (1975), which won a Pulitzer Prize, and *The Letters of Edith Wharton* (1988). The latter two point to material, such as details of publishers' advances and Wharton's income from books and stories, which might well be used in a comprehensive account of her writing life; but Garrison does not follow all these leads and his bibliography is not a publishing history.

Garrison's listings of editions and reissues of Edith Wharton's works up to the late 1980s show that many are still in print with various publishers, including *The Library of America* series, Penguin and Signet paperbacks, Virago, and Norton critical editions, each of which is a clue to her modern readership: her books are considered part of the canon of American literature; she is a good read and still has a popular, general appeal; 1970s and 80s women's studies scholars have read certain of her novels, notably *The House of Mirth*, as a textbook on feminism; and she is studied in undergraduate literature courses. She has, as it were, been seen in a number of caps over the years: realism, naturalism, and feminism. She has been compared with other great contemporaries: James, Hardy, and Proust. She has been labelled sedate, bloodless, exclusive, a writer from, about, and for high society. Yet she was a woman of letters in the broadest sense, producing novels of thought-provoking social criticism such as *The House of Mirth*, sensitive poetry such as the *Artemis to Actaeon* collection and in particular 'The Mortal Lease;' criticism; books on design and architecture; dynamic travel writing – the elderly George Meredith reading *A Motor Flight Through France* (1908) told her 'I'm flying through France in your motor at this moment;' chilling ghost stories – 'The Eyes,' 'Bewitched;' and even erotic prose, as in the 'Beatrice Palmato' fragment first published in Lewis's biography.

Garrison has been given the luxury of reproduced title-pages of all first editions, including most British and Canadian issues. The bibliography is well illustrated with photographs of jackets, covers, and decorative boxes. There is an especially nice photograph of the box for the first edition of the first printing of the *Old New York* set (1924) [A. 33-A. 36], with additional photographs of the outside and inside of the matching jacket for the *False Dawn* volume. It is particularly useful to have photographs of some of the early rare Wharton volumes, such as her anonymous 1878 *Verses*. Other jacket photographs, such as that for *The Decoration of Houses* (1897), suggest by their battered and taped appearance that these were books not only read but used: this was not merely what we would now label a coffee-table book.

There are a number of Canadian issues of Edith Wharton's books significant enough to receive separate treatment in this bibliography. These include: *The House of Mirth* (1905), *The Fruit of the Tree* (1907), *The Hermit and the Wild Woman* (1908), *The Reef* (1912), *The Custom of the Country* (1913), and *Fighting France* (1915), all issued by McLeod and Allen in Toronto; *Summer* (1917), *The Glimpses of the Moon* (1922), *The Mother's Recompense* (1925), *Here and Beyond* (1926), and *Twilight Sleep* (1927), issued by George J. McLeod in Toronto; and *A Son at the Front*, issued by Copp, Clark in Toronto in 1923.

Edith Wharton wrote twenty-two novels, sixteen collections of short stories,
eighty-seven separately published short stories, three poetry collections, forty-eight separately published poems, nine non-fiction volumes, and forty-two miscellaneous items: this useful information is from Lauer and Murray. Garrison lists fifty-two entries under section A, Separate Publications – an excellent chronological guide, but one which, given its cumbersome 395-page length and the diversity of materials, might usefully have been supplemented by, or in truncated form, might itself have been a supplement to individual subject sections. The point is that, with a writer as eclectic as Edith Wharton, while a chronological listing has its place, subject grouping is also useful. The least one might expect is a section by section Contents list with first page references. Ease of access and users' needs ought to be a consideration, and the bibliographer ought not to make assumptions about the absolute nature of his users' requirements.

Edith Wharton lived from 1862 to 1937, a fact unrecorded in this bibliography. Without the support of even a chronology of her life it is impossible for the user to know which of the editions and articles listed she saw through the press. But beyond this, a bibliography of a writer from which the writer is excluded is dull, however comprehensive the listing of editions and issues, and, in Garrison's case, the minute details of copyright. Garrison gives half a picture. He investigates publishers' records, telling, for example, that Edith Wharton received a ten or fifteen per cent royalty, but he does not reveal what that meant in dollars. The figures do exist in the records as Lewis reveals: Appleton paid her a $15,000 advance for *The Reef* which he did not recoup from sales; in 1919 her literary income of almost $40,000 enabled her to buy one house, lease another, and make improvements to both. Nor does Garrison tell how and when she wrote. The nineteen-year gap between items A.1 and A.2 is not explained, nor does Garrison note what these books are about or why or how they came to be written: the first is poetry, the second a book on the decoration of houses; A.3 is a book of short stories; A.4 a novel. Should the reader of a bibliography really have to read a biography of the subject in order to make sense of it?

There are other gaps. Even with illustrated title-pages, transcription has a place in bibliographical study. Without it there is the danger of assuming that the illustrated title-page is irrefutably the first edition, whereas, as everyone who studies books as physical objects knows, the possibility of variants is ever present. Manuscripts, their locations, and their relationship to published works are not covered. Neither Edith Wharton's move from Scribner to Appleton in 1917 nor her one-off return to Scribner with *A Son at the Front*, honouring a promise made ten years earlier, are noted. The termination of the British publishing arrangement with Macmillan in 1921 goes unmentioned, nor is there evidence to suggest that Garrison has investigated the Macmillan archive. There are no details of magazine earnings, although Lewis's work indicates that income figures and correspondence survive. From the early 1920s her serialised novels in magazines were regularly earning $15,000 and more, and Lewis records that in 1927 she was offered $40,000 for serial rights to *The Children* and $50,000 for her next novel. Garrison does not list translations of Wharton's works, even when they are textually significant: she was, for example, joint translator of some of her stories –
The Confessional' and 'The Reckoning.' Dramatic and movie versions of novels are not listed although some, such as The Glimpses of the Moon with screenplay by Scott Fitzgerald (1923), are of literary as well as cinematographic interest, and others were financially significant – The Children brought her $25,000 in film rights. The bibliography's fifteen-page index contains no page numbers, merely references to section numbers within the bibliography. Thus, for example, while André Gide is listed in the index, the user must search the eight pages of D.1 to find the reference. Such an index is quickly compiled with a word processor, but very inconvenient to use. Confusing, too, are the separate listings for Murray, John and John Murray. Nor, incidentally, is there evidence that Garrison investigated the John Murray publishing archive. There are minor inaccuracies, such as an error in the transcription of the printing on the spine of The Greater Inclination on p. 17: the illustration is captioned A.3.a.a, when it appears to show the second printing. I find it confusing that at the end of certain book entries Garrison notes that the work was 'Serialized, in lightly revised form,' noting the journal and with cross-referencing to the magazines and newspapers section, but omitting to mention that in all these cases the serial version appeared before the book, and, therefore, that it is the book which is 'lightly revised.'

This is clearly a mammoth and invaluable piece of scholarship. Regrettably, it does not search beyond the books as physical objects, into the details of publishing history which in turn can, in a good, modern bibliographical study, take the reader back to the works. The genesis and evolution of the texts and the ways in which they came to be written and published are absent. The bibliography is, therefore, something of a disappointment. The inviting opportunity remains for further Edith Wharton scholarship in the field.

Gillan Fraser
Victoria University in the University of Toronto


The appearance in 1990 of the second edition of Eric Gill: A Bibliography prepared by D. Steven Corey and Julia MacKenzie and the catalogue of the 1991 University of Toronto exhibition entitled Eric Gill, His Life and Art will be welcomed equally by librarians, bibliographers, Gill collectors, and book dealers specializing