suffered. On the credit side, publication costs of such a complex work were reduced substantially while the database remains on-line in the Library where it can be revised and searched by multiple access points.

The fourth and final volume of the Second Supplement is somewhat misleadingly entitled Index, which suggests one component. It consists of eight indexes: Names, Titles, Place of Publication, Printers, Publishers, Maps and Plans, Illustrations, and Subjects. This volume was added to the projected three-volume set at the suggestion of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. The indexes appended to Vols. 1 to 3 have been enlarged, rationalized (the editor's term) and cumulated. Improvements to the MINISIS programme have provided 'see' and 'see also' references. Again some problems remain: random examples are ['U.S.] Government Printing Office in the Printers Index; and both 'Bible' and 'Bibles' and 'Primers' and 'Textbooks' without a cross-reference in the Subject Index.

Minor criticism of the Second Supplement must be placed in perspective. They do not detract from the overall achievement of the editors who have produced a major work requiring expertise in many areas of bibliographical research, without the assistance of other contributors such as indexers who were involved in earlier volumes. A detailed examination of the components identified in the 'Plan of the Book,' the 'Key to Bibliographical Authorities,' the 'Bibliography of Sources Consulted,' the notes and the Indexes can only evoke sincere admiration and gratitude to the editors and the Toronto Public Library for this invaluable work.

Gloria Strathern
University of Alberta

Elizabeth Waterston with Ian Easterbrook, Bernard Katz and Kathleen Scott. The Travellers, Canada to 1900: An Annotated Bibliography of Works Published in English from 1577. Guelph, Ont.: University of Guelph, 1989. [2], viii, [2], 321, [1] pp.; $39.00 when purchased in person or on campus, $44.00 when prepayment accompanies order, $49.00 when not prepaid (hardbound). ISBN 0-88955170-7.

This volume is the result of almost thirty years of research and reflection. Its purpose, to present 'an annotated list of over seven hundred reports on Canada, published in English and written by travellers before 1900' [p. iii], is ambitious; the reference list, including quite a few unpublished Ph.D. dissertations, is impressive; and it responds to an urgent need for such a research tool on the part of historians, geographers and anthropologists, as well as literary critics. Waterston names three co-authors, and acknowledges the help of research assistants, graduate students, librarians and bibliophiles. The Travellers, Canada to 1900 is presented as a considerable collective achievement, drawing on decades of patient annotation as well as on the latest computer technology available.

Notwithstanding its long preparation, its scope and its scholarly claims, this bibliography suffers from serious flaws. The first is apparent in the title: neither 'travellers' nor 'Canada' is clearly defined. More flaws appear in the book's organization. The bibliographical arrangement, a chronology according to the date of publi-
cation, is lent the flimsiest of rationales and requires not one but two lists (one from 1577 to 1900 and another, supplementary, to cover recently edited texts of early travellers). The annotations are patchy, inconsistent and even erroneous, and the indexes are inadequate. The list of references, while complete, is unfocused, the reader has trouble recognizing the subject it is supposed to reflect.

Let us consider these problems one by one, beginning with the scope of the bibliography, as given in the title. In the Introduction, the key term ‘travellers’ remains undefined, and appears to be a blanket term including explorers, surveyors, immigrants and tourists. Seventeenth-century ‘adventurers’ to the eastern Arctic (p. iii) remain undistinguished from ‘sophisticated ladies and gentlemen of the 1890s, who swept their elegant way along the corridors of the railway cars’ (p. vi). Despite the separation of ‘exploration literature’ from ‘travel literature’ in the *Oxford Companion to Canadian Literature* (1983), to which she contributed the latter entry, Waterston perpetuates the confusing terminology of her earlier article, ‘Literature of Exploration: Canadian Travel Books of the 1870’s,’ *Studies in Canadian Literature*, 4, no. 2 [1979]: 44-57.) Simply and conventionally, an explorer may be defined as someone who travels from A to B where B is unknown to his own culture. But Waterston defines exploration literature as ‘something more than report, something closer to the great imaginative travel accounts like the *Odyssey, Gulliver’s Travels* ...’ (Ibid., p. 44). Of Canadian travel writing in the 1870s, ‘perhaps four or five achieved a “literature of exploration” thanks to their “literary power” (ibid., p. 45). Here Waterston shows her training (and bias) as a literary critic. However, in the Introduction to *The Travellers, Canada to 1900* she insists that ‘this particular kind of book must be judged by standards other than literary ones’ (p. vii): ‘Because of these travellers’ reports ... Canada evolved ... These travel books not only reflect Canadian history, they also play a part in making that history’ (p. iii). Waterston claims that her bibliography has more than literary importance: ‘Reading the notes in sequence, you can watch Canadian history unfold’ (p. iii). It is nonetheless true that a poor definition of her subject limits the usefulness of her work as an interdisciplinary research tool.

Just as the term ‘travellers’ is ill-defined, so is ‘Canada.’ The Preface explains that the bibliography is ‘Canadian’ in the sense of covering more than one region of the country as it was constituted in the time of the particular traveller’ (p. i). Thus the term ‘Canada’ might be considered a fluid one, referring first to the Great Lakes drainage and extending later to the Maritimes, the prairies, the west coast and the Arctic as these regions were annexed to the central provinces. But there are two difficulties with this definition, one of place and one of chronology. Waterston acknowledges the first: ‘while we have attempted to create an index which reflects fairly upon each area of the country as it appears in the literature, our notes have been filtered through a south-western Ontario bias’ (p. i) – with the not surprising result that Ontario is covered far more ‘fairly’ and extensively than any other region of Canada. Waterston is so biased that she has considered only texts published in English (original works and English translations). This slanted linguistic / geographical approach, together with Waterston’s literary emphasis, seriously limits and colours her annotation of many explorational documents. The second difficulty is that the definition of what is ‘Canadian,’ as given in the Preface, is in fact the work
of hindsight. Frobisher's landfall on Baffin Island, Vancouver's survey of the west coast, Butler's celebration of 'the great lone land' are 'Canadian' only in retrospect, not by some sort of predestination. Waterston remarks 'how fortuitous the development of this country has been. There is,' she says, 'little sense of a manifest destiny, unrolling inexorably' (p. iii). But her working definition of what is 'Canadian' belies this observation.

Waterston's centrist, retrospective point of view is that of the settler, not the explorer. Her 'true prairies' are those of Hind and Butler, not Kelsey, Henday or Thompson. Until the mid-nineteenth century, she argues, this territory 'yawned, unknowable, empty, shapeless,' waiting for 'when the time came to tame the prairie not with words but with steel' (p. vi). Meanwhile military travellers were recording the pleasures of life in colonial outposts, and thus depicting 'the garrison as an essential part of the Canadian identity' (p. v). Beyond the forts lay a romantic hinterland: 'It would have been easy to identify with Waverley as one pushed through twilit Canadian forests' (p. iv). Waterston lays her own heritage of Ontario-based Moodie / Jameson mythopoetic awe on writers who have no share in it; Thompson, for example, 'records his [sic] sense of the strangeness of physical space in the unmapped country' (p. 203). The fur traders' way of life (the basis of western exploration) is an adventure rather than serious business; in Isham's account of Hudson Bay Company (HBC) posts, for example, an oxymoron labels the details of supplies and trade as 'the trivia [sic] that made survival and commerce possible' (p. 209).

Together with this Ontario settler’s point of view is the assumption that both exploration and travel accounts exercised their influence only in published form – hence the organization of the bibliography according to publication dates. Hearne, for example, ‘designed his travel book to feed an established audience ... he wrote one of the most readable 18th Century accounts of travel in the interior of Canada' (p. 19). Mention is made of the ‘rough diary notes’ that are extant in manuscript (p. 19), presumably equivalent to ‘Captain Cook's private notes' submitted to the Admiralty (p. 210). Hearne's extant 'notes' are in fact a late revision of his 1770-72 journal, which was handed over to the HBC London Committee and then circulated, still in manuscript, among members of the Royal Society. Thompson copied Hearne’s manuscript journals while he was a clerk at Churchill. Hearne’s journey to the Coppermine River was important for subsequent exploration by virtue of his manuscript account, not the volume published over twenty years later. Waterston’s exclusive attention to printed material and its publication dates neglects the vast body of contemporary manuscript information, and obscures the real lines of historical influence. The same may be said of her preference for listing English translations rather than the original French accounts (Hennepin, La Rochefoucauld, etc.).

The organization of Waterston’s bibliography might induce us to think that eighteenth and nineteenth-century readers could read only print and only English. Also, it is difficult for the historically minded, who remember that Kelsey reached The Pas in 1690 and Fraser the Pacific in 1808, to look up their accounts under 1929 and 1960, the dates when these accounts finally appeared in print. The listing order chosen for this bibliography is awkward as well as historically dubious.

As for the annotations, I can comment on only those works with which I am familiar – the accounts of Western fur traders and a few of the Arctic expeditions.
Given Waterston’s background knowledge of colonial literature in English, I would assume that the nineteenth-century travel entries are more accurate than those for eighteenth-century exploration. But in those entries on which I can comment, it must be said that there are too many inaccuracies and ambiguities. Some examples: For La Verendrye, there is no mention of the sons and nephew, and only a misleading indication of the country which the family explored – ‘much of western Canada’ (p. 204). Always the English teacher, Waterston mentions only Pond’s spelling (p. 206), and neglects to relate his explorations to those of Mackenzie. The relationship between the accounts of Dixon, Portlock and Meares is also left unexplained; Meares, whose Memorial almost led Britain into war with Spain, is said to have ‘described Indian life and emphasized the fertility of areas along the Pacific Coast’ (p. 17). The relative paucity of annotation devoted to historically important exploration (Kelsey, four lines; La Verendrye, three lines; Pond and Meares, a mere two lines each; Mackenzie, five lines) contrasts markedly with chatty descriptions of later travellers (Hind, three entries and a total of twenty-four lines; Butler, two entries and a total of sixteen lines; Grant, nine lines; Southesk, thirteen lines). Hearne’s account included in Tyrrell’s edition of Hearne and Turnor is mistakenly identified as ‘the third trip’ (1770-72) instead of a later journey in 1774-75 (p. 207). There are two separate entries for Mackenzie (1801 and 1970), implying that there are two separate texts rather than two editions of the same journals (pp. 23, 213). As for Coues’ edition of Henry’s journal, there is not one word devoted to a description of the journal itself; Waterston mentions only the late nineteenth-century interest in such records (p. 193). There is a condensation of errors when Waterston annotates Thompson’s Narrative: ‘Thompson’s journals prove his excellence as a storyteller,’ thus confusing journals and Narrative; his route to the Pacific was ‘via the Columbia River to Moberley ... in 1807’; and his ‘manuscript journals’ may be consulted in Coues’ edition of Henry – in fact, Coues presents Thompson’s journals as editorial paraphrase, in footnotes (p. 203). Last but not least, Franklin’s first land expedition, of which Hood left an account, is said to have explored ‘the Hudson Bay region,’ not the Coppermine River and east to Melville Sound (p. 214). This is a high rate of error for what should be a standard reference work.

Although the annotated entries are nicely spaced and easy to read, the author / title and subject indexes are in three columns of small type and are not distinguished from each other by running titles at the top of each page. There is no index of accounts according to the date of journey – the listing order I would have preferred for the annotated bibliography. In the reference section, there is no note or table of contents to indicate the subdivisions (five of them) into which the reference entries fall. The material is here, but the question is rather one of emphasis, presentation and even exclusion. Why should the fifth section of references, ‘Books and Dissertations on Other Travel and Exploration Literature to 1900,’ be included? The Grand Tour, Chinese Travellers of the Ming Period, and The Armenian Image in History and Literature have no direct relevance – in fact, no relevance at all – to the subject of Waterston’s bibliography. This general fifth category combines with the problem of title terms already mentioned to obscure the specific purpose of The Travellers, Canada to 1900.

In a word, Waterston’s bibliography raises very high hopes, not only of a reliable
reference work, but also of the definition of a field hitherto largely neglected. These hopes are disappointed, because the project exceeds the detailed knowledge and even the linguistic / geographical perspective of its compilers. The subject remains ill-defined, and as a result, the bibliography is much less useful than it might have been.

BARBARA BELYEA

University of Calgary


Patrick O'Neill is Coordinator of the Speech and Drama Programme in the Modern Languages Department at Mount Saint Vincent University in Halifax, and a theatre historian of note. We owe the ‘discovery’ of Canadian copyright material at the British Library to his tenacious search for printed copies of Canadian plays which he has described in his article ‘From Theatre History to Canadiana: The Canadian Deposit Collection in the British Library’ (Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada 25 (1986): 26-37). O'Neill condensed his account in the introduction to a series of checklists, briefly explaining what accidents of copyright legislation, disasters and disinterest led to the sole survival in London of several thousands of books, pamphlets, broadsides, maps, photographs and sheet music deposited for copyright in Canada between 1895 and 1924. Besides Vol. 4 for Sheet Music, already published are: Vol. 1, Maps (1984); Vol. 2, Goad Insurance Plans (1985); Vol. 3, Part 1, City and Area Directories (1986); Vol. 3, Part 2, Telephone and Miscellaneous Directories (1988); and Vol. 5, Photographs (1989).

I have qualified the use of the term ‘discovery’ above because I know of at least two persons who were aware of the existence of this material before O'Neill found it. Dr. Helmut Kallman, former Chief of the Music Division at the National Library, had himself ‘discovered’ deposited sheet music during a visit to the British Museum in 1973. Official publications specialist Elizabeth Deavey was asked to look into the matter, and she ‘discovered’ the law which provided for the deposit in London of the material in question. Nevertheless, since no one followed up on that information, we must all be grateful to Patrick O'Neill for having carried his own detective work through to a concrete conclusion.

The sheet music checklist is by far the largest to date. In two parts, it contains an impressive 11,338 numbered entries, arranged alphabetically by composer from Abbot through Zucca, a composer / lyricist index (pp. 681-756), and a title index (pp. 757-893). As stated in O'Neill’s preface (pp. vi-vii), each entry also includes the title, the category (whether song or piano piece), place of publication, publisher and date of publication, the copyright registration number and the British Library shelf number. Not explained but easily deduced is the indication of size used by the British Library (e.g. 8°, folio). Where applicable, the entry also includes the names of