
*A Bibliography of Canadiana* edited by Frances M. Staton and Marie Tremaine was published in 1934 ‘to form a chronological record of the history of Canada from its discovery four hundred years ago until the Confederation of the provinces in 1867.’ Some 4,646 selected items, mostly books, pamphlets and broadsides, were identified and described with a wealth of bibliographical, biographical, descriptive and historical notes. Items were arranged chronologically by significant date including those actually published at a considerably later date (e.g. no. 111). Main entry was under author where this could be determined, followed by title information with wording, spelling and punctuation reproduced exactly, statement of publication, and pagination according to then current library practice. In a few isolated examples (e.g. no. 291), full bibliographical descriptions were provided. This work soon became known as ‘Staton and Tremaine’ or the ‘T.P.L. Catalogue.’ The richness of the Toronto Public Library collections and the excellence of the *Bibliography* soon gained it recognition as an essential reference tool for those concerned with pre-Confederation studies, including antiquarian booksellers, private and institutional collectors, and scholars.

A *First Supplement*, containing an additional 1,640 items, was produced in 1959 by Gertrude Boyle and Marjorie Colbeck, who followed the principles and practice of the original. Subsequently, the Library consolidated its reference collections. All pre-Confederation imprints, including materials omitted from the *Bibliography* and the *First Supplement* together with additional important items acquired by gift and purchase, are now housed in the Baldwin Room of the Canadian History Department. Now, thirty years after the *First Supplement* appeared, the *Second Supplement* containing a further 3,271 items has been issued in four volumes. This scholarly bibliography is a notable achievement by the editor, Sandra Alston, the recipient of the 1988 Tremaine Medal for outstanding service to Canadian bibliography, ably assisted by Karen Evans.

Vol. 2, the first to be published, appeared in 1985 and was reviewed by Richard Landon in Volume 24 (1985) of the *Papers / Cahiers*. This order of publication may account for the unfortunate gap in numbering between item 6684 in Vol. 1 and item 6800, the first item in Vol. 2. This error is noted in an erratum slip loosely inserted in Vol. 1.

On a cursory examination, this *Supplement* may look identical to its two predecessors, since the six volumes have been issued in uniform bindings in the same format. Closer study reveals significant differences in what, perhaps, should be referred to as ‘Alston and Evans.’ Not only do these changes incorporate developments in bibliographical methodology over the intervening years; they also extend the value of the publication to a wider audience such as cartographers and students of printing and publishing history.
The ‘Plan of the Book’ outlines the editorial policy, structure of item entries, bibliographical conventions, and production methods adopted. One apparently minor but significant change, namely that only those items published up to the year 1867 would be included and arranged in strict chronological order from those for which only the decade is known onwards, illustrates the intellectual rigour applied to the undertaking. Broadsides have been omitted, presumably a practical decision necessary to control the number of imprints that could be researched and included. Similarly, it was intended originally that magazines would be included at the end of Vol. 3, but this section was abandoned due to time constraints.

The major difference in this Supplement is the emphasis placed on the physical description of the Library’s copies of imprints. Collation information is provided according to the principles established in Fredson Bowers’ Principles of Bibliographical Description. Such evidence, especially for imprints with complex compositions, occupies considerable space for full collation and binding information, although other evidential information such as running titles, catchwords, paper and typeface is not treated. Sources cited and references supplied reveal the extensive investigation of copies held in other institutions, especially valuable where the T.P.L copy is defective, closely bound or rebound.

The bibliographical field exemplified by Bowers has been the province of specialists in English-language literary works. Their concern has been to utilize physical evidence of transmission to establish the most authoritative text. However, the value of such studies does not negate the value of equally valid areas of rigorous bibliographical study from the documentation of subject fields to the French ‘histoire du livre,’ the German ‘Geschichte des Buchwesens,’ and the English ‘history of the book’ concerned with cultural, intellectual and social aspects of publications. Consequently, editors of reference publications must identify their constituencies and provide appropriately. In this case, the traditional constituency located across North America and abroad has been concerned with pre-Confederation studies in many subject fields. To meet the needs of such scholars, the notes supplied should identify the subject and content of uninformative titles and consistently link related titles. References to sources consulted are an essential part of the documentation but they should not require replication of the editorial research to find the necessary information.

In this Supplement notes and references to related items such as subsequent editions issued by the same publisher, editions published elsewhere, translations and responses are treated inconsistently. In some cases the note provided refers to a related item by short title and a ‘q.v.,’ without item number, requiring consultation of either the Name or Title Index or earlier volumes to locate that item. In other cases, an item number is provided in the note, while reference to the related item by number in both the note and the reference cited are provided.

Editors of the Second Supplement utilized MINISIS, a computerized textual database management system created primarily for bibliographical applications. Without MINISIS, production and publication of the text would have been more protracted and expensive. However, some compromises in both historical conventions and the quality of production were necessary. Spacing of words, especially in title entries, justification of margins and alignment of item numbers in the indexes have
suffered. On the credit side, publication costs of such a complex work were reduced substantially while the database remains on-line in the Library where it can be revised and searched by multiple access points.

The fourth and final volume of the Second Supplement is somewhat misleadingly entitled Index, which suggests one component. It consists of eight indexes: Names, Titles, Place of Publication, Printers, Publishers, Maps and Plans, Illustrations, and Subjects. This volume was added to the projected three-volume set at the suggestion of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. The indexes appended to Vols. 1 to 3 have been enlarged, rationalized (the editor's term) and cumulated. Improvements to the Minis programme have provided 'see' and 'see also' references. Again some problems remain: random examples are [U.S.] Government Printing Office in the Printers Index; and both 'Bible' and 'Bibles' and 'Primers' and 'Textbooks' without a cross-reference in the Subject Index.

Minor criticism of the Second Supplement must be placed in perspective. They do not detract from the overall achievement of the editors who have produced a major work requiring expertise in many areas of bibliographical research, without the assistance of other contributors such as indexers who were involved in earlier volumes. A detailed examination of the components identified in the Plan of the Book, the Key to Bibliographical Authorities, the Bibliography [of Sources Consulted], the notes and the Indexes can only evoke sincere admiration and gratitude to the editors and the Toronto Public Library for this invaluable work.

Gloria Strathern
University of Alberta

Elizabeth Waterston with Ian Easterbrook, Bernard Katz and Kathleen Scott. The Travellers, Canada to 1900: An Annotated Bibliography of Works Published in English from 1577. Guelph, Ont.: University of Guelph, 1989. [2], viii, [2], 321, [1] pp.; $39.00 when purchased in person or on campus, $44.00 when prepayment accompanies order, $49.00 when not prepaid (hardbound). ISBN 0-88955170-7.

This volume is the result of almost thirty years of research and reflection. Its purpose, to present 'an annotated list of over seven hundred reports on Canada, published in English and written by travellers before 1900' [p. iii], is ambitious; the reference list, including quite a few unpublished Ph.D. dissertations, is impressive; and it responds to an urgent need for such a research tool on the part of historians, geographers and anthropologists, as well as literary critics. Waterston names three co-authors, and acknowledges the help of research assistants, graduate students, librarians and bibliophiles. The Travellers, Canada to 1900 is presented as a considerable collective achievement, drawing on decades of patient annotation as well as on the latest computer technology available.

Notwithstanding its long preparation, its scope and its scholarly claims, this bibliography suffers from serious flaws. The first is apparent in the title: neither 'travellers' nor 'Canada' is clearly defined. More flaws appear in the book's organization. The bibliographical arrangement, a chronology according to the date of publi-