Leonard E. Boyle. *Medieval Latin Palaeography: A Bibliographical Introduction* (Toronto Medieval Bibliographies 8). Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1984. xvi, 398 pp.; \$35.00 (cloth), \$15.00 (paper). ISBN 0-8020-5612-1 (bound), 0-8020-6558-9 (pbk).

This work is primarily intended for graduate students who are beginning their studies, and the author's intention is to present a bibliography of 'integral palaeography' (p. xv). By this term he means the complete study of the original text in manuscript along with all other material necessary for a complete understanding of the text. This approach, which has enthusiastic practitioners and supporters in almost every country in the world, has led the author to include notices not only of publications related to palaeography in its strict etymological sense of 'old writing,' but a much wider range of scholarship. To some, therefore, this bibliography will seem to overlap the fields of codicology (the archaeology of book-production), art history, library science, and textual criticism, as well as other related areas such as the detection of forgeries.

There is, as the author tells us, an approximate medieval precedent for the organization of the book into seven sections (p. xi). This arrangement corresponds to a system of enquiry (popular among scholastics in Ireland and elsewhere) which sought to investigate the circumstances of human actions by asking seven questions: *Quis, quid, quomodo, quibus auxiliis, cur, ubi, quando?* The over 2,200 entries to be found in the bibliography are the answers to these questions.

In the first section, the 'Scholarly Setting,' there are notices of the principal bibliographies, periodicals, and various miscellanies in the field. The history of the scholarship of palaeography is carefully considered and the chapter concludes with a chronological list of palaeographical manuals published since 1838 followed by a handlist of selected facsimiles. The author rightly insists on the absolute necessity of facsimiles in all their various forms (photographs, microfilms, microfiches). But as indispensable as these are, first hand contact with the original manuscript is often still necessary, since it is not always easy to tell from an ordinary microfilm when there is a need for further investigation by the ultra-violet lamp or by other special photography. Many is the time a colleague has asked me to check a reading in a manuscript with a tight binding or with an almost imperceptible crease which has defied the microfilmer's skill.

The second section, the 'Cultural Setting,' is concerned with the history of Latin writing from the Roman period to the Humanistic period. Particularly valuable for the student is the diagram on p. 75 which illustrates the 'various stages of development of Latin and vernacular scripts' from ca. 50 B.C.-1450 A.D. This illustration deserves more prominence (in the Index as well) and further references and / or elaboration would have been welcome.

The next section, which is devoted to the 'Institutional Setting' (i.e. libraries, archives, and catalogues) covers the whole period from medieval to modern times. In the fourth section on the 'Physical Setting,' the author treats the codicological aspects of writing materials, and book production of both roll and codex. Here material on cataloguing, dating, and localizing manuscripts is also included. The fifth

section, the 'Human Setting,' reviews work on the scribe and his milieu as well as on all forms of manuscript decoration.

The penultimate chapter, the 'Textual Setting,' lists important books and articles on editing, textual criticism, and the transmission of texts from antiquity and the Middle Ages. The seventh chapter, the 'Research Setting,' is devoted to a variety of topics. Among the items of interest are lists of special aids for researchers in the linguistic, literary, historical, chronological, and topographical fields as well as for those working in related areas such as epigraphy and diplomatics (the science of establishing the authenticity of documents).

Finally, the bibliography concludes with two indices: the first of places, names, and subjects (pp. 334-391); the second of manuscripts cited in the text (pp. 392-9). In addition to short introductions to many of the sections and sub-sections, most entries are accompanied either by a brief note on the scope of the contents or by a succinct value judgment which could only come from an experienced professor of palaeography. The inclusion of references to key reviews of important works (#158-9 for example) is particularly valuable and time-saving for the reader.

Leonard Boyle arranged for the publication of this bibliography before he left the Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies and the University of Toronto to become Prefect of the Vatican Library. He had completed the essential work on the project by 1981, so only a few items which have appeared after this date have been cited. The task of selecting which titles to include in a work of less than 400 pages must have been a difficult one, particularly when it was necessary to keep in mind the general purposes of the Toronto Medieval Bibliographies series: 'to aid "new" students ..., to guide more advanced readers who have had little formal training ..., and ... to assist new libraries in forming a basic collection' (p. vi). There are few significant omissions, but the author might have noted, in connection with the monumental *Codices Latini Antiquiores* (#263), the appearance of Rutherford Aris, *An Index of Scripts for E.A. Lowe's Codices Latini Antiquiores*. (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 1973-4). There are remarkably few printing or other types of errors and only cases like #1950 need be noted, where 11 not 9 volumes of Stegmüller's *Repertorium Biblicum Medii Aevi* appeared between 1950 and 1980.

Minor reservations which I have are perhaps more a matter of taste than of substance. If it had been feasible to expand the scope of the bibliography, a section might have been added describing the activities of the various research centres concerned with palaeographical studies. Students should be made more familiar with the resources and facilities of research institutes like the CNRS – Institut de Recherche et d'Histoire des Textes in Paris, perhaps the foremost of its kind in the world. But these suggestions in no way detract from the exceptional usefulness of the present work. It is to be recommended to all scholarly libraries and will undoubtedly become a standard reference work for those seeking a thorough introduction to the field. Let us hope that it will prove possible for this valuable bibliography to be reedited and brought up to date at regular intervals.

DENIS BREARLEY (*Denis Brearley teaches Medieval Latin and Palaeography in the Department of Classical Studies of the University of Ottawa and is joint editor of the Hiberno-Latin Newsletter.*)