tools in philosophy and religion, indexes for book reviews and theses, and other less specialized sources. Cooperation was also obtained from librarians, researchers, and acquaintances and friends of Gilson.

A small complaint that I have with McGrath's bibliography is that the description of items is often quite abbreviated and compressed, particularly for reviews of Gilson's books. A reviewer's personal name, for example, is omitted altogether and not even the first initial is given. I am aware that the rationale for this sort of truncated style has chiefly to do with keeping publication costs of the bibliography as low as possible. The resultant inconvenience to the user of the bibliography should, however, be considered.

Besides his significant contributions to theology and philosophy, Gilson made excursions into politics, journalism, literature, and music. The variety and quantity of items recorded by McGrath reflect the depth of Gilson's character and diverse interests, his prolific output, and continuing influence.

CARL SPADONI
(Carl Spadoni is Assistant Archivist of the Bertrand Russell Archives, McMaster University.)


John Stuart Mill, the foremost exponent of liberalism of the nineteenth century, had an enormous impact on his contemporaries and succeeding generations. An indication of his widespread and continuing influence is the amount of commentary that has been published on his life and work. The first modern checklist on Mill, which was done by Keitaro Amano in 1964, contained not only secondary literature but also recorded Mill's own publications and their translations. From 1965 to 1970 an alphabetical checklist compiled by Dudley L. Hascall and John M. Robson appeared serially in the Mill News Letter. Readers of the news letter are apprised of new work on Mill through a regular column, 'Recent Publications.'

Associate Professor of English at Victoria College in the University of Toronto and one of the editors of the Mill News Letter from 1971 to the present, Michael Laine has amalgamated, revised, and updated these previous compilations. His enumerative bibliography of secondary literature consists of the following sections: an alphabetical checklist of nearly two thousand articles and books dealing with Mill in a substantial way to the end of 1978; three appendices — one of light or satiric verse in which Mill is mentioned, one of cartoons, and one of portraits and other forms of representation; a subject index; and an index of important persons cited. Each entry of the checklist is numbered sequentially, annotated when the title is not self-explanatory, and sometimes cross-referenced when the same point or issue is discussed.

Since Mill's work and career are frequently referred to and summarized in textbooks of economics, political science, and philosophy, Laine has excluded such publications from his checklist because they usually repeat the same information, an exception being made only if the author in question is sufficiently prominent. Theses
and dissertations are also excluded unless they are published and deal with topics not treated extensively elsewhere or are published in a foreign language and appear to reflect a national interest or preoccupation. Works in German, Romance, Scandinavian, and Russian languages are included, and their titles have been translated and transliterated when necessary. Oddly enough, items in Japanese are excluded, and the reader is referred back to Amano's bibliography and the Mill News Letter. As a result, for example, Laine's checklist records most of Гюозо Фукухара's articles on Mill in English but not those in Japanese; this exclusion is somewhat regrettable since Professor Fukuhara's articles were listed in the Fall 1971 issue of the newsletter.

There are two other major exclusions from Laine's checklist. Only important or interesting reviews of Mill's books are recorded, but there are no reviews to be found of any posthumous editions. During Mill's years as a Member of Parliament (1865 to 1868), his views and speeches were constantly discussed by the British press and by newspapers on this side of the Atlantic as well; Laine has decided that a complete list of such articles would not be useful and has consequently recorded only those of special interest.

Even if one were tempted to quarrel with Laine's decisions about exclusions, one cannot find fault with the quality of items that he has recorded, some of which would be very difficult to locate even for the most determined Mill aficionado. Coincidentally, another checklist of secondary material on Mill appeared at about the same time as that of Laine's. Published in the Public Administration Series of Vance Bibliographies and compiled by Robert Uhlman Goehlert, a prolific bibliographer working in the fields of law, economics, and politics, this other checklist consists of approximately fourteen hundred items ordered alphabetically. Although it is more up-to-date and lists theses and dissertations, Goehlert's checklist is simply not as comprehensive as Laine's; nor does it contain Laine's valuable appendices. In comparing the two checklists and in examining various reference sources, I found each checklist to be accurate and I discovered only a few items that both failed to record.

A minor criticism of Laine's bibliography is that his system of cross-referencing is occasionally inconsistent and inadequate. The same can be said for the amount of annotation that he provides for obscure titles. Perusing his checklist, I came across many items about which I had no idea how they specifically related to Mill.

A major criticism is that the subject index is a hopeless finding aid. With respect to Amano's bibliography, Laine remarks in his preface: 'The section of writings on Mill, comprising less than half the volume, is arranged under subject headings. Unfortunately, a user may not always respond to Amano's divisions; should he not, he has no way of locating an article.' I will not try to defend Amano since an enumerative bibliography organized by subject without a name and title index will be susceptible to Laine's objection. Concerning his own subject index, Laine observes: 'The index, in its section on Mill himself, has been kept as general as possible so that fine discriminations concerning categories would be made by users and not for them.' The hapless result, however, is that the subject headings are so general that it is very difficult and sometimes impossible to locate anything specific. Suppose, for example, that one wanted to find commentary on Mill's views on the nature of geometry. Item 977 is exactly on this topic. Yet the subject index has neither the subject heading 'geometry' nor 'mathematics.' Item 977 is listed in two places in the subject index: under the
general heading 'Philosophy' subdivided into 'Logic' and under the general heading 'Works' subdivided into 'A System of Logic.' In the first location approximately one hundred and twenty items are also listed and in the second roughly ninety.

The Mill Editorial Project at the University of Toronto has produced first-rate, scholarly volumes. Laine's checklist, which has partly resulted from that editorial endeavour, is certainly to be welcomed, especially when it is compared to other attempts. In the last two decades, no doubt, much searching and verification have gone into its impressive compilation. It is a shame nonetheless to find that the product of such accumulated labour is hampered by limited subject access.

CARL SPADONI


This long-awaited book reveals quickly why it took fifteen years to compile. The great volume of Carman's correspondence, divided among so many repositories, makes the task of editing any selection tedious and prolonged. Professor Gundy has clearly had a great deal of work and is to be commended for pursuing it so carefully and comprehensively, as is McGill-Queen's for undertaking the project with the prodigality that has obviously financed this handsome and well-illustrated volume.

Gundy informs us in the first paragraph of his sympathetic introduction that this is a limited selection of letters: 'There are, in fact, at least three times as many extant Carman letters as those here presented....' His primary criterion for selection seems to have been 'to let Carman tell his own life story in an edited selection of his letters.' And that is what this book amounts to – pieces of autobiography patched together by the editor. It is autobiography on a very intimate level, the more so for the poet being, at least for most of his life, unaware of the possibility of his letters being valuable or likely to be published. Furthermore, the selection is chronologically comprehensive, from his adolescent letters to his parents to one written three days before his death, thus supplying a record of a developing personality before the beginning of his long and difficult literary career. These letters also prove the maintenance of Carman's connections with Canada as he moved about in the United States.

As autobiography this book is excellent; yet it is only as autobiography that it can be criticized. The editor has been careful to include letters to each significant correspondent and about all important areas of the poet's thought, such as unitrinianism and theosophy. While these letters accumulate to recreate Carman's personality – and a remarkably pleasant and engaging personality is found therein – the wide scope of the editorial concept inhibits the exploration by the reader of these ideas to any useful depth. It seems to me that this is primarily Carman's fault, if one judges by these letters, for many are superficial and do little more than express the poet's positive or negative opinions with negligible rhetorical support. And here one cannot help comparing Gundy's edition with Desmond Pacey's edition of F.P. Grove's letters, with which it has much in common, from the surprising similarities between the letters written by both men while touring Canada to give readings to the destruction by both Catherine Grove and Mary Perry King of their more intimate letters. In