An Index to the Literary Garland Updated

Mary Lu MacDonald

FOR THOSE INTERESTED IN CANADIAN BIBLIOGRAPHY, MARY MARKHAM Brown's *An Index to the Literary Garland* (Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1962) has a place apart, as the first retrospective index to a major Canadian periodical. For anyone interested in the literary history of early nineteenth-century English Canada, it is a familiar reference work, making the contents of the major Canadian literary periodical published before Confederation accessible to researchers.

Recently I have had occasion to use the *Index* as a sort of personal notebook while making a detailed study of the *Literary Garland*, checking the titles in the *Index* against the actual literary works I was reading. Not every item was checked, my purpose being my own research and not a critique of the *Index to the Literary Garland*. However, a few errors and omissions emerged from my comparison of the *Index* entries with the original text. These were noted for my own records and I pass them on for the use of other researchers. In the course of my work I have also been able to identify a few more of the *Garland's* anonymous writers. These additional attributions are also listed here. Finally, there are several *caveats* which should be borne in mind by those using the *Index* as a primary source.

It is not my purpose to discuss the bibliographic philosophy of the work, nor is it useful to compile a list of typographical errors which have no effect on the utility of the text. I confine myself to the matters mentioned above.

The principal error attributes to the English poet Letitia Landon (L.E.L.) several works which are not hers. The two poems 'Love' and 'Morning' are signed L.E.L., and the item from the *World of Fashion* notices her death; these three items properly belong under the listing for L.E.L. However, the two works 'Dick Spot' and 'Octavius Skeggs' are by someone who signs the initials E.L. and who, from editorial comments (April 1839, p. 240, and May 1839, p. 288), is a male residing in Canada. 'The Yorkshire Factory Girl' appeared in the magazine with the initials L.E.L., but an editorial correction was made in the next issue (October 1844, p. 480) stating that the initials should have been A.E.L. and that the author was Mrs. A.E. Lundy, mother of the vice-principal of McGill. 'The Yorkshire Factory Girl' should therefore be listed with 'The

Yorkshire Collier Girl' under the initials A.E.L. The remaining entry, a 'criticism of L.E.L. in "Life Behind the Counter"' is somewhat of a mystery. A few lines from L.E.L. form the superscription to that story, but there is no criticism of Landon in the text.

There are also a number of minor omissions, such as notes of the writer's sex or place of residence, which are unimportant for most readers. Some works have, however, been omitted from the *Index*. They are as follows:

Australis

Sonnet to Disappointment (v)	Nov '48:500
To Mary (v)	Nov '48:500

C. (D.C.)

Why Tarries my Johnnie? (p)	July '42:381-3
-----------------------------	----------------

Empey, Alex

The Fair One (v)	Nov '49:498
------------------	-------------

H. (M.H.) (B.W. Town)

Moonlight (v)	Aug '48:370
Sonnet, Written on an Evening in June (v)	Aug '48:370

Haskins, Dr.

La Penserosa (v)	June '44:246
------------------	--------------

Lounger, A Literary (J.H. Willis)

Canadian Boat Song (v)	Dec '39:40
Oh! had she loved (words to song)	Jan '43:43-5

M'Carroll, James (Peterborough)

The Father to his Sleeping Child (v)	Nov '41:562
--------------------------------------	-------------

Moodie, Susanna

To Violets (v)	Nov '41:562
The Wish (v)	Nov '41:562

Picken, Andrew

A Romance (words to song)	Nov '47:530-1
---------------------------	---------------

Richardson, John

editorial comment on readings of <i>Hardscrabble</i>	May '49:240
--	-------------

S. (R.S.)

The Soldier's Grave (v)	Dec '41:26
editorial note identifying Robert Sweeny as author of the above	Dec '41:48

M.M. Brown has been inconsistent in the indexing of material which appeared in the monthly 'Editor's Table' section. These include references to

submissions by various writers, which often include clues to their identity, and reviews of their published works. I have also been inconsistent, adding several references above, but omitting others, such as the review (October 1844, p. 480) of Mrs. Fleming's *The Prompter*. A serious student should read all the 'Editor's Table' pages in the *Literary Garland* very carefully.

In the matter of attributions, there are six additional ones which can be added. 'D.C.' refers to David Chisholme, a Scottish-born resident of Lower Canada. The poems 'The Battle of the Plains of Abram' and 'The Indian's Farewell to Sir Alexander Mackenzie' subsequently appeared in *The Garland: A Collection of English, Irish, Scotch, Naval, and Other Songs* (Montreal: Armour and Ramsay, 1844) over the name of Chisholme. All the items listed under 'D.C.' are consistent with biographical material about Chisholme, particularly 'The Song of the Persecuted' and 'Why Tarries my Johnnie?'

The *Literary Garland* contributor 'E.J.D.' is identified in the *Bathurst Courier*, August 25, 1848, as Mrs. J.P. Grant of Perth, Canada West. Her maiden name was Emma Donoghue. The daughter of an English clergyman, she married J.P. Grant in Montreal on October 20, 1847. The identification of 'A.E.L.' as Mrs. A.E. Lundy has already been mentioned.

The author of 'The Indian's Chant', 'Major Longmore', is George Longmore, a British Army officer born in Quebec City in 1793. The 'Chant' is taken from Canto 11 of Longmore's 'Tecumthé', first published anonymously in the *Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal* (Montreal), December 1824, and subsequently in his *Tales of Chivalry and Romance*, published in Edinburgh and London in 1826.

'M.A.M.', the Irish-born author of a number of *Literary Garland* items in both prose and verse and the anonymous author of *Tales of the Olden Time* (Montreal: Lovell and Gibson, 1845), was Mary Anne Madden (1820-1903). She was married in Montreal in 1847 and under her married name, Mrs. James Sadlier, was a prolific writer in the United States in later years.

The 'Professor Wilson' whose works appeared in the *Literary Garland* in 1839 and 1841 is more likely the Scottish Professor John Wilson (1785-1854), well known at the time as the author of works which appeared in *Blackwood's* under the pseudonym 'Christopher North', as well as other works carrying his own signature, rather than the Canadian professor of later renown, born in 1816, who was not yet a professor when the *Literary Garland* published works over this signature.

The student using the *Index* should be careful not to assume that all works signed by the same initials are written by the same person, especially when these works are separated by a number of volumes and a gap in time. The period in which the *Literary Garland* was published was one of much recent immigration, great population mobility, and rapid change in Canada. We cannot take for granted that a contributor in the 1840s would be aware of what

had appeared in print only a few years before. Often there are different addresses – 'Sorel', 'Montreal', 'Kingston' – given for the same set of initials. This may merely mean that an individual has changed his or her place of residence, but it could also be a signal that we are reading the work of a different writer. The converse is also true, that works signed by different sets of initials or pseudonyms may have been written by one person. This was certainly the case in other periodicals of the time.

These problems of identification in the *Literary Garland* are compounded because the editorial and typographical standards of the magazine were not uniformly high and confusion may result from printing errors. For example, the American writer Mrs. E.F. Ellett becomes Mrs. E.F. Fleet when the author's name is printed with the first instalment of the story 'Coreggio'. The name is corrected, without comment, for the second instalment. M.M. Brown has placed together under the initials 'P.E.M'κ' three items with the general title 'Scraps from my Notebook'. The first appears under these initials, the second with the initial 'E' alone, and the third with the initials 'E.M'κ'. It is probably quite correct to assume that they were written by the same person, but one cannot be sure. It may be the result of typographical or editorial error, but there may also be some other reason why three different sets of initials were used to identify three works published over a period of sixteen months.

The question of asterisks used to identify 'original' material should also be approached warily by the student. In volumes I-IV of the first series, an asterisk appeared in the text to indicate an original work. With the New Series, begun at the end of 1842, the practice changed. The asterisks appeared in the annual index supplied to subscribers with the last number of the year. In some years (i.e., 1847) the asterisk indicates non-original material, and in other years (i.e., 1846) it is used to denote original works. M.M. Brown has, for the most part, succeeded in keeping these different signals straight. However, a student who does not have access to one of the annual indexes, because it is missing from the volume being consulted, should proceed warily, especially as not all the 'original' material was, in fact, first published in the *Literary Garland*. A few examples: Susanna Moodie's 'The Canadian Herd Boy' appeared in the *Garland* as 'original' in May 1847. It had previously been published in the *Ladies Musical Library* in August 1843 and in the *Kingston Chronicle* on September 16, 1843. Susanna Moodie is a frequent offender in this regard, particularly where her poetry is concerned. She published poems in Canadian newspapers almost from the first week of her arrival in Canada, and a number of these later appeared in the *Literary Garland*. To take another example, the writer who signed himself 'A Scotchman and a Soldier' had published poetry widely in Canadian newspapers. Some of these works were later resurrected as 'original' in the *Garland*. 'The Convict' (March 1849, p.

93) appeared in the *Kingston Chronicle* on June 28, 1834, and later in the *Quebec Gazette* on September 27, 1837. 'The Traveller's Dream' and 'The Mariner's Watch Hymn' (January 1850, pp. 10 and 16) both appeared earlier: in the *Kingston Chronicle* on December 14, 1833, and December 6, 1834, and in the *Quebec Gazette* on February 6 and September 8, 1837.

A final *caveat* for the enquiring student. Much of the biographical data used by M.M. Brown was taken from Morgan's *Bibliotheca Canadensis*, which has proved, under the examining light of scholarship in the last two decades, to contain many errors. If the objective is to show that someone of a particular name was writing in Canada, Morgan is an adequate reference. If detail is important, it should be verified from other sources.