not indicated, e.g. Goderich, not Goderich City. Also, I prefer to arrange municipalities which have geographic designations north, south, east or west, in inverted form, as we do in the Ontario Municipal Directory; for example: Gower, North, not North Gower, as in the bibliography.

With these municipal comments out of the way, I congratulate Mrs. Aitken on a good job, which I hope will be revised on a set basis, and going back to the starting date of 1950. Only a few other sources are available for the researcher in this field: Urban and Regional References 1945-1969, with annual supplements; (Canadian Council on Urban and Regional Research, 151 Slater St., Ottawa 4, Suite 511.) “A Bibliography of Lambton County and the City of Sarnia,” (University of Western Ontario, Library Bulletin, no. 8, March 1970.) by Edward Phelps; and the Ontario Department of Municipal Affairs (now Ministry of Treasury, Economics and Intergovernmental Affairs) Library Bulletin, on the subject of Local Histories, now under revision.

Barbara A.B. Weatherhead,
Ministry of Treasury, Economics &
Intergovernmental Affairs, Toronto


A good bibliography enables the introductory student to make a sensible selection of reading material. For the mature scholar it is a superb tool in which, within its defined framework, he can have confidence. It can guide him through what is often a vast body of material of mixed quality.

This bibliography is a great disappointment. The preface states that Riel was “secretly married” in 1866 and that the marriage was later “broken off”. In 1866, Riel and Marie Julie Guenon secretly concluded a marriage contract. When the banns were published “the match”, in the words of G. F. G. Stanley, “was broken off” at the insistence of the girl’s parents. While explaining the first rebellion Arora comments: “The Metis also did not want to suffer as Quebec did when it entered into Confederation”. What this means with reference to 1867-69 escapes this reviewer. It is claimed that “Amnesty was given to the Metis but the treachery of the government was soon discovered...” This complex area cannot be reduced to simplistic categoricals. (An excellent M. A. thesis on the amnesty problem is not listed in the bibliography.) We are told that “Riel was executed by pretenders to democracy and justice” and that “the federal government tried to exterminate the Metis race.” Macdonal and his colleagues made no pretence of believing in democracy, and the suggestion that they contemplated racial extermination is silly.

Arora describes his work as “comprehensive”. It is not comprehensive and the rules that determined the inclusion and exclusion of items are neither spelled out nor discoverable. Saunders’s work on Tupper, Dafoe’s short piece on Laurier and
"... To Sir John A. Macdonald [sic] tran. and abr. by John Glassco; poem" are included, but no mention is made of Creighton or Pope on Macdonald, Skelton, Schull, Willson or Neatby on Laurier, Christie on Campbell or Heisler on Thompson. Duff's article on Jackson is listed, but not Cherwinski's more recent article on the same man. Arora includes manuscript material but, according to "Sources used", has not consulted the Union List of Manuscripts in Canadian Repositories (P.A.C., 1968). This might explain why he places the "Family papers of Louis Riel" in the Manitoba Provincial Library instead of in the Archives, and why the Louis Riel Papers (P.A.C.) are not mentioned. Mason Wade, The French Canadians, constitutes one entry. Pages 405-12 of that work are then listed separately. If important works are omitted, why do we need such trivial items as seventeen recent articles from the Regina Leader Post?

Entries have been annotated if the "compiler has seen or read reviews in various bibliographical tools and booklists". The result is less satisfactory. The description of Anderson, "1885"; The Riel Rebellion includes: "Brilliant, honest and objective account..." That phrase is quoted on the pamphlet's title page. Martin's article on Manitoba in Canada and its Provinces (1914) is described as "Most scholarly treatment of the whole story of the causes and events of the insurrection". There are however no comments on two brilliant and indispensable works: Morton's Introduction to Alexander Begg's Red River Journal and Giraud, Le Métis canadien. On the other hand, Gutteridge, Riel: A Poem for Voices merits one of the longer comments!

This bibliography is not judicious, neutral or technically acceptable. It should not be used by introductory students. A properly annotated bibliography could guide such students through the richly controversial material germane to Riel. For the mature scholar the work is not sufficiently reliable or substantial to merit serious consideration.

In a rather unfortunate phrase the compiler comments: "The student, historian and researcher of Canadian history... should welcome this bibliography... I would welcome any suggestion or comment for the improvement of this bibliography." I do not welcome this bibliography, but have some suggestions. First, self-congratulatory material should be removed. Second, the preface should be deleted in favour of something that is not unabashedly propagandistic. Third, principles of inclusion and exclusion should be defined and the work redone according to those principles, which should then be explained to the reader. Fourth, annotations should be excluded unless they touch in a consistent and informed way on the key books.

Louis Riel is a towering figure in Canadian history. A sophisticated guide to the rich and extensive literature generated by his career would be fascinating. This bibliography is no tribute to either Riel or that literature. One wonders why it was published by Saskatchewan's Provincial Library.

Donald Swainson,
Department of History, Queen's University.

85